

LC7VMAX1

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

3 -----x
4 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

5 v.

20 CR 330 (AJN)

6 GHISLAINE MAXWELL,

7 Defendant.

Jury Trial

8 -----x

9 New York, N.Y.
10 December 7, 2021
11 9:05 a.m.

12 Before:

13 HON. ALISON J. NATHAN,

14 District Judge

15 APPEARANCES

16 DAMIAN WILLIAMS

17 United States Attorney for the
18 Southern District of New York

19 BY: MAURENE COMEY

20 ALISON MOE

21 LARA POMERANTZ

22 ANDREW ROHRBACH

23 Assistant United States Attorneys

24 HADDON MORGAN AND FOREMAN

25 Attorneys for Defendant

BY: JEFFREY S. PAGLIUCA

LAURA A. MENNINGER

-and-

BOBBI C. STERNHEIM

-and-

COHEN & GRESSER

BY: CHRISTIAN R. EVERDELL

Also Present: Amanda Young, FBI

Paul Byrne, NYPD

Sunny Drescher,

Paralegal, U.S. Attorney's Office

Ann Lundberg,

Paralegal, Haddon Morgan and Foreman

LC7VMAX1

(Trial resumed; jury not present)

THE COURT: Matters to take up.

MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

THE COURT: Go ahead, Ms. Menninger.

MS. MENNINGER: We learned early this morning through a disclosure by the government that they have spoken with witness Brian.

THE COURT: I'm sorry, could you pull up the mic closer please. Thank you.

MS. MENNINGER: That they had spoken with witness Brian, who was anticipated to testify today. Brian is the brother of witness Jane.

THE COURT: Correct.

MS. MENNINGER: You may recall, your Honor, we had litigation around prior consistent statements; and that Brian is being offered in part to report supposedly prior consistent statements with Jane. We had discussions about whether Jane would be subject to recall in order to be questioned about those particular prior consistent statements, should they be admitted.

What we learned from the government early this morning is that after her testimony, Jane called Brian and discussed with Brian her testimony in court, in violation of the Court's sequestration order. She disclosed to him a document that she was shown on the stand during cross-examination; she gave her

LC7VMAX1

1 characterization of the defense attorney who cross-examined
2 her, using an expletive that rhymes with "front." And that was
3 told to this witness, who is anticipated to be testifying
4 today, who is obviously also subject to the Court's
5 sequestration order.

6 I am very troubled and disturbed that witnesses who
7 are still subject to recall are calling other witnesses that
8 they know will be called to testify; that will be called to
9 testify about their memories of events that happened years ago;
10 and that they are disclosing to witnesses -- this witness --
11 what they experienced on the witness stand, including a
12 document that they were shown, your Honor.

13 I am asking the Court to forbid the witness Brian from
14 being called, given this violation. At a minimum, your Honor,
15 I would ask that there is a hearing outside the presence of the
16 jury in which Brian is subject to examination by the Court as
17 to exactly what happened during this phone call. Those are the
18 two pieces of information that he reported to the government
19 and was reported to us via some handwritten notes at about 2
20 this morning. That's my request, your Honor.

21 THE COURT: Okay.

22 MS. MOE: Your Honor, there are only two legal
23 principles at play here. The first is Rule 615 about excluding
24 witnesses from a courtroom. Neither Brian nor Jane has been in
25 the courtroom while other witnesses have testified. That rule

LC7VMAX1

1 has been fully complied with.

2 The other legal principle is that the government
3 cannot have substantive communications with Jane because she is
4 subject to recross about prior consistent statements. We have
5 not violated that legal principle either.

6 With respect to communications between Jane and Brian,
7 we have disclosed our awareness of that and defense counsel is
8 free to cross-examine Brian about those communications; that's
9 all the law requires. There is no sequestration order that
10 prevents family members from talking to one another; of course,
11 it's not best practice.

12 THE COURT: Did the government give any guidance?

13 Just on the first point, witnesses sequestered, so not
14 in the courtroom, could they be provided by another witness or
15 an attorney the transcript of the trial testimony?

16 MS. MOE: I have no awareness of whether that's
17 occurred, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: No, it's just to test the boundaries of
19 what you suggested in the first point, which is the only
20 question is whether they observed trial or not. And I don't
21 think -- I think that strikes me, I haven't looked at the law
22 on this, as an overstatement.

23 For example, I don't think a witness could be
24 provided, consistent with a sequestration order, the transcript
25 of trial testimony; and I wondered if the government agreed

LC7VMAX1

1 with that proposition.

2 MS. MOE: Your Honor, I haven't looked at the law on
3 that particular issue. That would strike me as sort of
4 consistent with being in a courtroom to see the testimony. And
5 I'm not aware of that occurring in this case; we certainly
6 haven't been providing trial witnesses with transcripts of
7 testimony. I'm not aware of any attorney doing that either.

8 I think what we're talking about is a conversation
9 between two siblings in which one sibling shared that her
10 experience in court was unpleasant.

11 THE COURT: Pull up the mic please.

12 MS. MOE: Apologies, your Honor.

13 I think what we're talking about here, your Honor, is
14 a conversation between two siblings in which one sibling said
15 she had an unpleasant experience in court; and that she was
16 shown a document on the stand that was -- I don't know all the
17 details of this conversation, just what's been relayed to me.

18 THE COURT: Can I back up and ask if the government
19 gave any direction in advance about not discussing trial
20 testimony with other witnesses, which I think probably would
21 constitute best practices.

22 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

23 Following Jane's testimony, I spoke with her attorney.
24 I don't want to make a representation that's not accurate. My
25 memory of that conversation is that I told him and reminded him

LC7VMAX1

1 that she was potentially subject to recall and recross. And so
2 my understanding is that he understood the rules about that;
3 and that we couldn't speak with her; and that she was still a
4 trial witness subject to recall. I don't remember whether I
5 repeated, sort of, the ground rules about trial witnesses.
6 That's all I remember from that conversation, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: And did the government prior to trial
8 give -- was there any direction given on this issue -- since
9 this witness is being provided for prior consistent statements,
10 did the government give any direction either to the witnesses
11 or to their counsel that they ought not to confer in light of
12 the reason that the witness is being offered?

13 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

14 Off the top of my head, I can't point to a particular
15 date or a particular conversation; but it's our practice -- and
16 what we did in this case -- is to tell every witness that their
17 memory should be their memories and they shouldn't be talking
18 to other witnesses before the trial. So I'm confident we did
19 that in this case; I just can't remember a particular date of a
20 particular conversation, but we've been having those
21 conversations with all of our witnesses.

22 THE COURT: And how did the government learn about
23 this conversation?

24 MS. MOE: Last night we had a meeting with Brian. And
25 he, unprompted, mentioned that he had heard from Jane that she

LC7VMAX1

1 had called him after her testimony and relayed that her
2 experience wasn't pleasant.

3 THE COURT: It sounds like maybe more than that it
4 wasn't pleasant; sounds like part of what was relayed -- that's
5 not the part that concerns me. Needless to say, the point
6 that's concerning is whether she coached him on her responses
7 so that his testimony regarding prior consistent statements
8 would show consistency. That's, I think, the only --

9 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: I'm not sure there's any relevance --
11 although it's concerning, I'm not sure there's any relevance to
12 a description of the process is unpleasant or that they did or
13 didn't like the lawyers and how they were treated.

14 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

15 On the subject of the prior consistent statement, I
16 would note -- and the 3500 material reflects this -- that Brian
17 had relayed the substance of his testimony to the government
18 and it's memorialized in 3500 long before this conversation
19 happened. He has been on our witness list for some time; he's
20 met with the government long before this trial began.

21 And so to the extent there is any suggestion that his
22 testimony is prompted by a recent conversation with Jane during
23 the trial, that's belied by the record here, which is that he
24 has relayed to us those prior consistent statements
25 substantially in advance of the trial.

LC7VMAX1

1 With respect to his communications with Jane, we
2 memorialized what Brian told us about that in our notes and
3 provided them to defense; and so we've been transparent about
4 that.

5 I don't think those notes or that conversation in any
6 way suggests that witnesses are doing something improper or
7 that anyone is coaching anyone to say something in particular.
8 And again, this witness has been on the record with the
9 government about this issue long before the trial.

10 THE COURT: Well, obviously if I allow the testimony,
11 it's fair grounds for cross, needless to say.

12 MS. MOE: Of course, your Honor.

13 THE COURT: And where is he in the order of things
14 today?

15 MS. MOE: He would be the next witness after the
16 witness who's currently on the stand.

17 THE COURT: Ms. Menninger, so given the timing of
18 where we are, do you have any authority to support the
19 proposition that -- other than obviously it being fair grounds
20 for cross, that this is a violation of order or law that would
21 suggest a quite substantial remedy of excluding testimony?

22 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, I have not had time to
23 research this. I think that the disclosure came in around 3
24 o'clock in the morning. And without revealing what time I got
25 up, I have not had time to research that question between when

LC7VMAX1

1 I got up and when I came to court this morning. I have checked
2 the Westlaw headnotes and there certainly are cases where
3 witnesses are excluded for far more minor infractions than
4 this.

5 THE COURT: But infractions of what?

6 MS. MENNINGER: A sequestration order like walked into
7 a courtroom briefly, you know, or an agent was in the room and
8 heard some of the confidential informant's testimony. That's
9 what I've briefly learned from looking at headnotes, your
10 Honor.

11 Part of my concern is that what you've just heard from
12 the government is those are the two things that Brian
13 volunteered to them. They said they don't know exactly what
14 happened in this conversation. And for all we know, there's
15 more to the conversation than what Brian volunteered, because
16 they may have said, Oh, whoa, don't tell us anymore about that.

17 So that's one of the reasons why my request is to find
18 out exactly what was communicated to him by Jane before he gets
19 on the stand; and that, I would submit, is something that the
20 Court could ask him about under oath outside the presence of
21 the jury to determine exactly the scope of the violation here.
22 Because we only know of one document that she told him she had
23 been shown on the stand. I don't know if she told --

24 THE COURT: Do we know what document?

25 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

LC7VMAX1

1 He volunteered that it was the Interlochen application
2 that she was shown and was asked, as you know, questions about
3 on the stand. So whether there were other disclosures in that
4 conversation, they weren't written down in the notes. And I
5 suggest that maybe it is important to learn that information
6 before the Court makes a determination about exactly the
7 magnitude of the violation here, your Honor.

8 MS. MOE: Your Honor, I would direct the Court's
9 attention to our note on this, which is marked 3510-020.

10 THE COURT: Can I have it?

11 While Ms. Drescher is getting that, go ahead, Ms. Moe.

12 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

13 The note reflects --

14 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, I have a paper copy, if
15 you'd like.

16 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

17 Go ahead, Ms. Moe.

18 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

19 The note reflects in the middle of the page that Brian
20 told the government, after Jane testified, she called Brian.
21 Jane did not discuss her testimony. She just told Brian that
22 he should know that the defense attorney is a expletive; and he
23 should know that's what this will be like. Jane mentioned she
24 was shown an Interlochen application.

25 And on that score, your Honor, I would note that the

LC7VMAX1

1 Interlochen application is not the basis of any prior
2 consistent statement. I don't anticipate asking him on direct
3 about his Interlochen application at all.

4 MS. MENNINGER: The point is we don't know if that's
5 the only thing she told him; that's just what he volunteered to
6 the government.

7 THE COURT: All right. Let's do this. We'll have
8 Brian not testify till after lunch. I think the first task is
9 the government to fully inquire what Brian learned from Jane or
10 anyone else about testimony that's taken place.

11 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

12 We'd be happy to have that conversation.

13 With respect to scheduling issues, just in terms of
14 the sequencing today, I would note that we anticipate
15 calling -- your Honor, if I could have just one moment.

16 THE COURT: Sure.

17 (Counsel conferred)

18 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

19 I just wanted to think through a scheduling issue
20 because we have a witness who will be testifying beginning
21 probably later this morning, and that testimony may be fairly
22 long. And for scheduling reasons, Brian had planned to fly
23 home tomorrow; and so it may be, just depending on the
24 sequencing of this issue, that we might request to call him out
25 of order to accommodate that. But we can see how the timing

LC7VMAX1

1 goes today and flag that later on.

2 THE COURT: Well, we're not going to speed up Brian
3 because he's planning to fly home today. The question is when
4 we have sufficient time to inquire whether there's been an
5 effective violation of the sequestration order and, if so, what
6 the appropriate remedy for that is. So that's going to require
7 a factual investigation by the government, and then legal
8 analysis from both sides as to what an appropriate remedy is in
9 light of what we learn factually.

10 MS. MOE: Of course, your Honor. I just wanted to
11 flag a scheduling concern. I certainly don't mean to expedite
12 the issue. We'll thoroughly examine it.

13 THE COURT: Okay. Ms. Menninger, is that --

14 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

15 THE COURT: -- sufficient in light of where we are at
16 the moment?

17 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Okay. Other issues?

19 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

20 I also conferred with the government this morning in
21 light of the briefing last night on Mr. Flatley's testimony.
22 Because the letter that we received from the government is
23 different from what I was told during a conferral on Friday on
24 this topic. So I've tried to narrow the issues as I understand
25 them to be.

LC7VMAX1

1 Your Honor, with respect to any testimony that was in
2 the November 26 disclosure, which I believe is not what was
3 disclosed earlier in September, but most of it is what I would
4 agree is factual testimony. If a document has metadata, any
5 old person can right-click on it, look at the properties, and
6 read what those properties are.

7 There's only one portion of the November 26 disclosure
8 that I believe treads into opinion expert land, and that is on
9 the second page of the November 26 disclosure where Mr. Flatley
10 will testify that he verified the accuracy of metadata by
11 running a particular program. He will explain what metadata
12 is, such as the file name and when the file was created, and
13 where it can be stored in a computer system.

14 Your Honor, if those are the only things that
15 Mr. Flatley intends to testify about, then I think we're fine.
16 It's the things that came in the disclosures on November --
17 there were more on November 26 that were not in this letter and
18 there were things on December 3rd that were disclosed. If he
19 is limited to those things that were put in the September 26
20 disclosure, I'm fine with that, your Honor.

21 He also was not ever disclosed as a fact or expert
22 witness with regard to CDs. The original notice and the
23 supplemental notice all refer to his review of devices. So I
24 believe that the government does not intend to put on evidence
25 about CDs through him, but those are the two areas that I think

LC7VMAX1

1 we're down to, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Okay.

3 MR. ROHRBACH: Your Honor, as I think our letter
4 indicated, we're quite surprised to receive the defendant's --

5 THE COURT: Mr. Rohrbach, let's just get to the issue.
6 It sounds like it's narrowed to two things. Every letter I
7 get, it starts with, We're so surprised or this has already
8 been litigated. Let's just get to the issue.

9 MR. ROHRBACH: So, your Honor, I think we're in a
10 pretty good place then. Mr. Flatley is not going to go into
11 very much -- we obviously don't know exactly what Mr. Flatley
12 will say on the stand, but the questions and what we expect to
13 elicit should track the government's November 26 letter. And
14 so it sounds like if defense counsel doesn't have a problem
15 with what's in this letter, then there is no issue here for the
16 Court.

17 I'm not exactly sure what Ms. Menninger is referencing
18 with regard to CDs, but I think that we expect Mr. Flatley to
19 give purely fact testimony regarding CDs, and there's no expert
20 opinion at all involved there. To the extent that it's a late
21 disclosure of anything, it's just a factual view of Mr. Flatley
22 that is in the 3500 material that he may testify to.

23 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, on the CDs, apparently
24 Mr. Flatley intends to testify that a created date is the same
25 thing as a modified date. And also about once a file is burned

LC7VMAX1

1 onto a CD, it can't be unburned. Those are, I think, what the
2 government represented in their letter of last night he
3 intended to talk about, which have never been disclosed to us
4 as his intended testimony.

5 MR. ROHRBACH: Your Honor, as we said in our letter
6 last night, we don't intend to elicit those things on direct;
7 but also those are factual pieces of knowledge that you can
8 understand without having any specialized training or
9 experience if you just have used a CD burner before.

10 MS. MENNINGER: If it's not coming out on direct, your
11 Honor, then I don't think it matters.

12 THE COURT: Okay.

13 MS. MENNINGER: But as to the other ones, I will just
14 make an objection if there's something that's not in the
15 November 26 letter. I think the government knows what their
16 witness is going to say because they are going to ask him
17 questions. And if it's a question that calls for things that
18 weren't disclosed, then I'll bring it to the Court's attention.

19 THE COURT: Okay.

20 MR. ROHRBACH: That's fine, your Honor.

21 THE COURT: I do want to press a little bit on the CD
22 bit; because I want to know what in the government's mind would
23 happen on cross that would lead the government to redirect with
24 respect to the created date is the same as the modified date or
25 once burned on CD, can't be unburned. I don't want to have the

LC7VMAX1

1 government being too cute here and saying we're not going to do
2 it on direct, but you know full well you're going to do it on
3 redirect.

4 MR. ROHRBACH: Understood, your Honor.

5 If I could confer with Ms. Pomerantz, she's putting it
6 on; but I suspect it really is unlikely to come out on redirect
7 at all.

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 (Counsel conferred)

10 MR. ROHRBACH: Your Honor, the government is not
11 planning to talk with Mr. Flatley on direct about CDs. So it's
12 hard to imagine what exactly would happen on cross that would
13 make this an issue; but, of course, the government doesn't want
14 to limit itself by promising under no circumstances will it
15 elicit this information.

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 So if you're not going to ask about CDs on direct, if
18 he's not crossed on CDs, that's the end of the matter.

19 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Ms. Menninger, does that get us where we
21 need?

22 MS. MENNINGER: That's fine, your Honor. Thank you.

23 THE COURT: Okay. Great. Thank you both.

24 All right. Well, it sounds like all that work we did
25 on Flatley last night will just go in the can for future use.

LC7VMAX1

1 I think the only outstanding issue from yesterday is
2 the objection to Exhibit 309. I'm sustaining that objection on
3 401/403 grounds.

4 What else do we need?

5 MS. MENNINGER: Nothing else from the defense, your
6 Honor.

7 MS. MOE: Your Honor, may we briefly be heard at
8 sidebar about an issue relating to potential cross-examination
9 of Brian that implicates a privacy interest?

10 THE COURT: Okay. So this will be sealed; correct?

11 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

12 THE COURT: I do have a request for lengthy sealed
13 proceedings that we do them in the robing room because of the
14 physical taxing on the court reporter. So if you think it will
15 be short, we can do it here; if it will be more than five
16 minutes, we should do it in the robing room.

17 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

18 I believe this will be brief.

19 THE COURT: Okay. All right.

20 (Pages 1440 to 1443 SEALED)

21 (Continued on next page)

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 (In open court)

2 THE COURT: All right. Just waiting to hear from
3 Ms. Williams, if we have all our jurors.

4 Bring in the jury.

5 Can we have the witness back on the stand.

6 MS. POMERANTZ: Yes, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: Thank you.

8 (Jury present)

9 THE COURT: Good morning, members of the jury. Nice
10 to see you. Thank you again for being here right on time so we
11 can get started. I appreciate it.

12 Ms. Meder, you may remove your mask. And I remind you
13 you are under oath.

14 Ms. Comey, you may continue with your direct
15 examination.

16 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

17 KIMBERLY MEDER,

18 called as a witness by the Government,

19 having been previously duly sworn, testified as follows:

20 DIRECT EXAMINATION (continued)

21 BY MS. COMEY:

22 Q. Good morning.

23 A. Good morning.

24 Q. I'd like to pick up where we left off yesterday.

25 I think you had Government Exhibit 1101 in front of

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 you to use as an aid. Do you have that in front of you now?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And then we were talking about what was marked for
4 identification as Government Exhibit 304.

5 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, will you please pull that up
6 for the witness, the parties, and the Court.

7 Q. Ms. Meder, do you recognize this?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What is it?

10 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
11 Maxwell investigation.

12 Q. And what was the 1B number that that CD was contained
13 under?

14 THE COURT: I'm sorry, could you pull the microphone a
15 little bit closer. Thank you. Go ahead.

16 A. 1B26.

17 Q. And have you familiarized yourself with the physical
18 appearance of Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein during this
19 investigation?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Who do we see in this photograph?

22 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers Exhibit
24 304.

25 MS. MENNINGER: Subject to the prior objections, your

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Honor, no further objection.

2 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

3 GX-304 is admitted. You may publish.

4 (Government's Exhibit 304 received in evidence)

5 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

6 Q. And while this is published for the jury, could you please
7 tell us who's on the left and who's on the right?

8 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
9 Epstein.

10 MS. COMEY: We can take that down.

11 Thank you, Ms. Drescher.

12 Can we now please pull up for the witness, the
13 parties, and the Court Government Exhibit 306.

14 Q. Do you recognize this?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What is it?

17 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
18 Maxwell investigation.

19 Q. And under what 1B number was that CD logged?

20 A. 1B26.

21 Q. Who's in this photograph?

22 A. Ghislaine Maxwell.

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
24 evidence.

25 MS. MENNINGER: No further objection.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 THE COURT: Thank you.

2 GX-306 is admitted. You may publish.

3 (Government's Exhibit 306 received in evidence)

4 MS. MENNINGER: And your Honor I will have the same
5 for the rest of these just to save everyone's time.

6 THE COURT: Understand.

7 And your objections are preserved.

8 MS. COMEY: May we publish, your Honor?

9 THE COURT: You may.

10 MS. COMEY: Thank you.

11 We can take that down. Thank you, Ms. Drescher.

12 Let's go now please to what's been marked for
13 identification as Government Exhibit 307. Ms. Drescher, will
14 you please pull that up for the witness, the Court, and the
15 parties.

16 Q. Do you recognize this?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What is it?

19 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
20 Maxwell investigation.

21 Q. What 1B number was that CD logged under?

22 A. 1B26.

23 Q. And who do we see in this photograph?

24 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

25 MS. COMEY: The government offers this in evidence.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 THE COURT: GX-307 is admitted.

2 (Government's Exhibit 307 received in evidence)

3 MS. COMEY: May we publish?

4 THE COURT: You may.

5 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

6 Q. Who do we see on the left and the right?

7 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
8 Maxwell.

9 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, would you now please pull up
10 what's been marked for identification as Government Exhibit 320
11 just for the Court, the parties, and the witness.

12 Q. Do you recognize this?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. What is it?

15 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
16 Maxwell investigation.

17 Q. And under what 1B number was that CD?

18 A. 1B75.

19 Q. Who's in this photograph?

20 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

21 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
22 evidence.

23 THE COURT: Without further objection, GX-320 is
24 admitted.

25 (Government's Exhibit 320 received in evidence)

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 MS. COMEY: May we publish?

2 THE COURT: You may.

3 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

4 Q. Who do we see on the left and the right in this photograph?

5 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
6 Maxwell.

7 MS. COMEY: We can take that down. Thank you.

8 Let's go now, please, to Government Exhibit 321.

9 Ms. Drescher, would you please pull that up for the
10 witness, the parties, and the Court.

11 Q. Do you recognize this?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What is it?

14 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
15 Maxwell investigation.

16 Q. What 1B number was that CD logged under?

17 A. 1B75.

18 Q. Who's in this photograph?

19 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

20 MS. COMEY: The government offers this in evidence,
21 your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Consistent with the Court's rulings,
23 GX-321 is admitted.

24 (Government's Exhibit 321 received in evidence)

25 MS. COMEY: May we publish please, your Honor.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 THE COURT: You may.

2 MS. COMEY: Thank you.

3 Q. Who do we see on the left and who do we see on the right?

4 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
5 Epstein.

6 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, let's go now, please, to
7 Government Exhibit 322 for the witness, the parties, and the
8 Court.

9 Q. Do you recognize this?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. What is it?

12 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
13 Maxwell investigation.

14 Q. What 1B number was that CD logged under?

15 A. 1B78.

16 Q. Who's in this photograph?

17 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

18 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
19 evidence.

20 THE COURT: Okay. And I've ruled. GX-322 may be
21 admitted.

22 (Government's Exhibit 322 received in evidence)

23 THE COURT: And you may publish.

24 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

25 Q. Who's on the left and who is on the right?

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
2 Maxwell.

3 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, let's go now please to
4 Government Exhibit 324 just for the witness, the parties, and
5 the Court.

6 Q. Do you recognize this?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. What is it?

9 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
10 Maxwell investigation.

11 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

12 A. 1B19.

13 Q. Who's in this photograph?

14 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

15 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
16 evidence.

17 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-324 is
18 admitted. You may publish.

19 (Government's Exhibit 324 received in evidence)

20 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

21 Q. Who's on the left and who's on the right?

22 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
23 Maxwell.

24 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, let's go now to Government
25 Exhibit 325, please, for the Court, the parties, and the

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 witness.

2 Q. Do you recognize this?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is it?

5 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
6 Maxwell investigation.

7 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

8 A. 1B75.

9 Q. Who's in this photograph?

10 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

11 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
12 evidence.

13 THE COURT: GX-325 is admitted. You may publish.

14 (Government's Exhibit 325 received in evidence)

15 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

16 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

17 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
18 Epstein.

19 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, we can now pull up what's
20 been marked for identification as Government Exhibit 333,
21 please, for the parties, the Court, and the witness.

22 Q. Do you recognize this?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. What is it?

25 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Maxwell investigation.

2 Q. Under what 1B number was the CD logged?

3 A. 1B78.

4 Q. Who is in this photograph?

5 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

6 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
7 evidence.

8 THE COURT: And again, consistent with my rulings,
9 GX-333 is admitted. You may publish.

10 (Government's Exhibit 333 received in evidence)

11 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

12 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

13 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
14 Maxwell.

15 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, let's now pull up, please,
16 Government Exhibit 337 for the Court, the witness, and the
17 parties.

18 Q. Do you recognize this?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What is it?

21 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
22 Maxwell investigation.

23 Q. Under what 1B number was this CD logged?

24 A. 1B63.

25 Q. Who's in this photograph?

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 A. Ghislaine Maxwell.

2 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
3 evidence.

4 THE COURT: And again, GX-337 is admitted consistent
5 with my rulings. You may publish.

6 (Government's Exhibit 337 received in evidence)

7 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

8 Ms. Drescher, let's go now, please, to Government
9 Exhibit 340 for the witness, the parties, and the Court.

10 Q. Do you recognize this?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What is it?

13 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
14 Maxwell investigation.

15 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

16 A. 1B63.

17 Q. Who is in this photograph?

18 A. Ghislaine Maxwell.

19 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
20 evidence.

21 THE COURT: Consistent with my rulings, GX-340 is
22 admitted. You may publish.

23 (Government's Exhibit 340 received in evidence)

24 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

25 Ms. Drescher, let's go now, please, to Government

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Exhibit 341 for the witness, the Court, and the parties.

2 Q. Do you recognize this?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is it?

5 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
6 Maxwell investigation.

7 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

8 A. 1B63.

9 Q. And who are the people we see on the left and in the center
10 in this photograph?

11 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; in the center, Jeffrey
12 Epstein.

13 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
14 evidence.

15 THE COURT: Consistent with my rulings, GX-341 is
16 admitted.

17 (Government's Exhibit 341 received in evidence)

18 MS. COMEY: May we publish, your Honor?

19 THE COURT: You may.

20 Q. And will you tell us one more time who's on the left?

21 A. Ghislaine Maxwell.

22 Q. And who's in the center?

23 A. Jeffrey Epstein.

24 MS. COMEY: Let's go now, please, Ms. Drescher, to
25 Government Exhibit 342 for the witness, the parties, and the

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Court.

2 Q. Do you recognize this?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is it?

5 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
6 Maxwell investigation.

7 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

8 A. 1B63.

9 Q. Who is in this photograph?

10 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

11 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
12 evidence.

13 THE COURT: I don't think we discussed this one
14 yesterday, so if you want to --

15 MS. MENNINGER: Subject to the same objection, your
16 Honor.

17 THE COURT: Understood. GX-342 is admitted.

18 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 342 received in evidence)

19 THE COURT: You may publish.

20 Q. Who is on the left?

21 A. Ghislaine Maxwell.

22 Q. Who is on the right?

23 A. Jeffrey Epstein.

24 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, let's go now, please, to
25 Government Exhibit 343 for the witness, the Court, and the

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 parties.

2 Q. Do you recognize this?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is it?

5 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
6 Maxwell investigation.

7 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

8 A. 1B63.

9 Q. Who is in this photograph?

10 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

11 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
12 evidence.

13 MS. MENNINGER: Same objection and cumulative, your
14 Honor.

15 THE COURT: Understood. GX-343 is admitted.

16 (Government's Exhibit 343 received in evidence)

17 THE COURT: Let me just ask, Ms. Comey, are there
18 other ones I didn't see yesterday?

19 MS. COMEY: I don't believe so, your Honor. I didn't
20 realize we had not discussed these yesterday.

21 THE COURT: My presumption is that there won't be, and
22 so we'll move on.

23 MS. COMEY: May we publish, your Honor?

24 THE COURT: Yes, you may.

25 MS. COMEY: Thank you.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 BY MS. COMEY:

2 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

3 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
4 Epstein.

5 MS. COMEY: Let's go now to what's been marked for
6 identification as Government Exhibit 347, please.

7 Q. Do you recognize this?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What is it?

10 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
11 Maxwell investigation.

12 Q. Under what 1B number was this CD logged?

13 A. 1B19.

14 Q. Who is in this photograph?

15 A. Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell.

16 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
17 evidence.

18 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-347 is
19 admitted. You may publish.

20 (Government's Exhibit 347 received in evidence)

21 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

22 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

23 A. On the left, Jeffrey Epstein; on the right, Ghislaine
24 Maxwell.

25 MS. COMEY: Let's go now, please, to what's been

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 marked for identification as Government Exhibit 348.

2 Q. Do you recognize this?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is it?

5 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
6 Maxwell investigation.

7 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

8 A. 1B19.

9 Q. Who is in this photograph?

10 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

11 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
12 evidence.

13 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-348 is
14 admitted. You may publish.

15 (Government's Exhibit 348 received in evidence)

16 BY MS. COMEY:

17 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

18 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
19 Epstein.

20 MS. COMEY: Let's go now please to Government Exhibit
21 314 for the witness, the Court, and the parties, Ms. Drescher.

22 Q. Do you recognize this?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. What is it?

25 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Maxwell investigation.

2 Q. Under what 1B number was the CD logged?

3 A. 1B75.

4 Q. Who is in this photograph?

5 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

6 MS. COMEY: The government offers this in evidence,
7 your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-314 is
9 admitted. You may publish.

10 (Government's Exhibit 314 received in evidence)

11 Q. Who is on the left, who's on the right?

12 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
13 Epstein.

14 MS. COMEY: Let's go now, please, Ms. Drescher, to
15 Government Exhibit 317 for the witness, the Court, and the
16 parties.

17 Q. Do you recognize this?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. What is it?

20 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
21 Maxwell investigation.

22 Q. Under what 1B number was the CD logged?

23 A. 1B75.

24 Q. Who is in this photograph?

25 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 MS. COMEY: The government offers this in evidence,
2 your Honor.

3 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-317 is
4 admitted. You may publish.

5 (Government's Exhibit 317 received in evidence)

6 Q. Who is on the left and who is on the right?

7 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
8 Epstein.

9 MS. COMEY: Let's go now, please, Ms. Drescher, to
10 Government Exhibit 318.

11 Q. Do you recognize this?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What is it?

14 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
15 Maxwell investigation.

16 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

17 A. 1B75.

18 Q. Who is in this photograph?

19 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

20 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
21 evidence.

22 THE COURT: Consistent with my ruling, GX-318 is
23 admitted. You may publish.

24 (Government's Exhibit 318 received in evidence)

25 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 Q. Once that's published, would you please tell us who's on
2 the left and who's on the right.

3 A. On the left, Ghislaine Maxwell; on the right, Jeffrey
4 Epstein.

5 MS. COMEY: Thank you, Ms. Drescher. We can take that
6 down.

7 Q. The last two exhibits I want to talk about are in the
8 binder up by you at the podium, Ms. Meder. I want to start
9 with what's been marked for identification as Government
10 Exhibit 313. Would you please turn to that in your binder.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Do you recognize that?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. What is it?

15 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
16 Maxwell investigation.

17 Q. Under what 1B number was the CD logged?

18 A. 1B75.

19 Q. And who is in this photograph?

20 A. Ghislaine Maxwell and Jeffrey Epstein.

21 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this
22 exhibit under seal to protect the privacy of a party.

23 THE COURT: No objection?

24 MS. MENNINGER: No further objection.

25 THE COURT: No further objection.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - direct

1 No objection to sealing, I presume.

2 MS. MENNINGER: Correct.

3 THE COURT: Okay. GX-313 is admitted under seal to
4 protect the privacy of a party.

5 (Government's Exhibit 313 received in evidence)

6 MS. COMEY: And, your Honor, I think I'll proceed to
7 one more exhibit we'll propose under seal and then ask the
8 jurors to take a look in their binders, if that's all right
9 with your Honor.

10 THE COURT: That's okay with me.

11 MS. COMEY: Would you please now turn in your binder
12 to what's been marked for identification as Government Exhibit
13 332.

14 Q. Do you recognize this?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What is it?

17 A. It's a photo from a CD I reviewed from the Epstein and
18 Maxwell investigation.

19 Q. Under what 1B number was that CD logged?

20 A. 1B26.

21 Q. During the course of this investigation, have you
22 familiarized yourself with the physical appearance of Virginia
23 Roberts?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Who is in this photograph?

LC7VMAX1

Meder - cross

1 A. Virginia Roberts.

2 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this
3 exhibit under seal to protect the privacy of a third party.

4 MS. MENNINGER: No further objection, your Honor.

5 THE COURT: Okay. 332 is admitted, and it's admitted
6 under seal to protect the privacy of the third party.

7 (Government's Exhibit 332 received in evidence)

8 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, at this time I would ask that
9 the jurors be permitted to look in their binders at what's now
10 been admitted under seal as Government Exhibit 313 and 332.

11 THE COURT: Okay. Jurors, you may look at GX-313 and
12 GX-332. And after you've viewed them, please place your
13 binders back on the ground.

14 MS. COMEY: And, your Honor, once the jurors have
15 reviewed those exhibits, I have no further questions.

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 All right. Ms. Menninger, you may set up for cross.

18 All right. Thank you.

19 CROSS-EXAMINATION

20 BY MS. MENNINGER:

21 Q. Good morning, Ms. Meder. Is that how you pronounce it?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. You were testifying about some photographs that you copied
24 from CDs onto a computer; correct?

25 A. Correct.

LC7VMAX1

Meder - cross

1 Q. And then you reviewed those photographs; correct?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. And some of those photographs were shown to the jury today;
4 correct?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Those CDs that you copied photographs from onto a computer,
7 those CDs were found all around the Epstein home; correct?

8 MS. COMEY: Objection. Foundation.

9 THE COURT: Sustained.

10 Q. Did you prepare for the government a location report for
11 the exhibits that were just shown to the jury?

12 A. I prepared a report showing the evidence item number of
13 where it came from.

14 Q. Within Mr. Epstein's house; correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So you found which CDs were found in which room of
17 Mr. Epstein's house; correct?

18 A. Yes, according to the evidence item numbers.

19 Q. Right. So you weren't at the house when the CDs were
20 seized, right?

21 A. I was on both searches.

22 Q. You were on both searches?

23 A. I was.

24 Q. Okay. And so you personally compared the numbers of these
25 CDs to where they were located in Mr. Epstein's house, right?

LC7VMAX1

Meder - cross

1 A. I confirmed the CD with the 1B numbers.

2 Q. And the 1B number was tied to a room in the house?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay. You did that work for the government, right?

5 A. I confirmed it.

6 Q. And you gave that work product to the government?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And so you know from the work that you did and gave to the
9 government that some of these CDs were found in a closet on the
10 third floor, for example?

11 A. I don't recall exact locations. I know the 1B numbers as
12 corresponding to the testimony today. And I do not recall
13 exact locations in the house.

14 Q. Do you know whether CDs were found in the third floor
15 closet?

16 A. I know they were found in the house. Again, I don't
17 remember the exact locations.

18 Q. Okay. So just from memory, you're not remembering where a
19 particular CD was found?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. Okay. And you do know that CDs were found around the
22 house?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And you know that the CDs were found in different floors
25 and in different places, different rooms?

LC7VMAX1

Meder - cross

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. None of the photos that you've been talking about, to your
3 knowledge, were displayed in the house, right?

4 A. I don't recall.

5 Q. They just came off of a CD?

6 A. I don't recall.

7 Q. Well, you've just testified about these CDs and taking the
8 photos off the CDs, right?

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. Okay. You didn't testify about any photos that were taken
11 off of a wall?

12 A. Correct.

13 (Continued on next page)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

LC7Cmax2

Meder - cross

1 BY MS. MENNINGER:

2 Q. And all of the CDs, to your knowledge, were seized during
3 the two searches that you were part of; correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And that was in July of 2019; right?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. As a part of this project, you reviewed a substantial
8 number of CDs; right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Do you know approximately how many CDs you reviewed?

11 A. I do not.

12 Q. A hundred?

13 A. There were probably hundreds, yes.

14 Q. And on those hundreds of CDs, there were thousands of
15 photographs; right?

16 A. Collectively, yes.

17 Q. There were more than 10,000 photographs; correct?

18 A. I don't know specific numbers.

19 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, may I approach the
20 witness? Actually, if we can just show the witness and the
21 Court, and I'll alert counsel to the number, 3531-12.

22 MS. COMEY: We don't have it yet.

23 MS. MENNINGER: I have a hard copy.

24 THE COURT: Okay.

25 MS. MENNINGER: May I approach, your Honor?

LC7Cmax2

Meder - cross

1 THE COURT: You may.

2 BY MS. MENNINGER:

3 Q. Ms. Meder, do you recognize the handwriting on 3531-12?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Is that your handwriting?

6 A. It is.

7 Q. Are these some of your notes that you took when you were
8 doing this photograph review?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And if you could just look at a couple of the pages and
11 tell me whether it refreshes your recollection about the number
12 of photographs that you reviewed.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Can you tell the jury now about how many photographs you
15 think you reviewed?

16 A. Several thousand.

17 Q. In one set, there was more than 20,000, is that right, on
18 page 2?

19 A. I'm not seeing the 20,000.

20 Q. In the box in the middle of the page on page 2, it's on the
21 backside.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. On another set, there was somewhere between four and
24 ten thousand; is that right?

25 A. Yes.

LC7Cmax2

Meder - cross

1 Q. And in another set, there was about 18,000, on page 4?

2 A. That might have been the total.

3 Q. Okay. So not the four to ten, but the eighteen?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. So eighteen and twenty thousand in a couple different sets
6 that you have reflected in these notes; right?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you remember it took a substantial period of time for
9 you to go through all those photographs; right?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Your job was to copy the photos from the CDs to the
12 computer and then to review them; right?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. You don't have any personal knowledge of how the photos got
15 onto the CDs, for example?

16 A. No.

17 Q. You don't have any personal knowledge of who took the
18 photos that you've been talking about; right?

19 A. Well, in some of the black binders, there are initials
20 written on the bottom of pages.

21 Q. But you don't know what those initials mean from personal
22 knowledge; correct?

23 A. You can infer based on how they were labeled on the disc.

24 Q. You don't have personal knowledge, do you?

25 A. No.

LC7Cmax2

Meder - cross

1 Q. You don't have personal knowledge about when these photos
2 were taken; correct?

3 A. On the disc, there are dates labeled.

4 Q. But you don't know if those dates are accurate from
5 personal knowledge, do you?

6 A. I'm not a computer expert, so I wouldn't be able to confirm
7 it, but they are written on the CDs.

8 Q. There are notes on the CDs and you don't know if they're
9 accurate; correct?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. You don't know whether the photos were altered by anyone
12 before they went onto the CD?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. You don't know whether those photos on the CD were simply
15 sent to Epstein or someone else and then captured on a CD;
16 correct?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. You don't know whether any of those photos are a correct
19 and accurate representation of any particular fact; correct?

20 A. Correct.

21 MS. MENNINGER: No further questions. Thank you.

22 THE COURT: Ms. Comey.

23 MS. COMEY: Briefly, your Honor. Thank you. May I
24 inquire?

25 THE COURT: You may.

LC7Cmax2

Meder - redirect

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MS. COMEY:

3 Q. Ms. Meder, you were mentioning some initials that you saw
4 on the black binders. Could you tell us what you saw?

5 MS. MENNINGER: Objection. It's hearsay, your Honor.
6 The labels on the binders are hearsay.

7 MS. COMEY: I'm just asking her about the initials
8 that were elicited during cross examination.

9 MS. MENNINGER: I did not elicit the hearsay, your
10 Honor. I elicited that there were initials and not what they
11 were, because she just testified she does not know whether
12 those initials are accurate.

13 THE COURT: Sustained.

14 BY MS. COMEY:

15 Q. You also mentioned that you saw dates on CDs. Could you
16 tell us what dates you remember seeing on the CDs you reviewed?

17 MS. MENNINGER: Same objection, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Sustained.

19 MS. COMEY: No further questions.

20 THE COURT: Thank you. Nothing further, correct,
21 Ms. Menninger?

22 MS. MENNINGER: Not for this witness. Thank you.

23 THE COURT: Ms. Meder, you may step down. You are
24 excused.

25 (Witness excused)

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Ms. Comey, the government may call its next witness.

2 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may I retrieve our exhibit?

3 THE COURT: Yes.

4 MS. POMERANTZ: The government calls Stephen Flatley.

5 THE COURT: Stephen Flatley may come forward.

6 STEPHEN FLATLEY,

7 called as a witness by the Government,

8 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

9 THE COURT: You may be seated. Please remove your
10 mask and state and spell your name for the record.

11 THE WITNESS: Sure. It's Stephen, S-t-e-p-h-e-n,
12 Flatley, F-l-a-t-l-e-y.

13 THE COURT: Ms. Pomerantz, you may inquire.

14 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

15 DIRECT EXAMINATION

16 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

17 Q. Good morning.

18 A. Good morning.

19 Q. Where do you work?

20 A. I work for the Federal Bureau of Investigation, New York
21 division.

22 Q. Is that also known as the FBI?

23 A. Yes, it is.

24 Q. Do you work any particular unit at the FBI?

25 A. Yes. I work in the Computer Analysis Response Team, or

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 CART.

2 Q. And what is CART?

3 A. CART is responsible for collecting and processing digital
4 evidence.

5 Q. What is your title in the CART team?

6 A. I am the CART coordinator.

7 Q. And what does that mean?

8 A. That means I mentor other people and handle the day-to-day
9 activities.

10 Q. Do you have any other roles on the CART team?

11 A. I am a senior examiner. I am also a field instructor from
12 Quantico.

13 Q. You mentioned that you're an examiner. What kind of
14 examiner are you?

15 A. I am a forensic -- digital forensic examiner.

16 Q. How long have you been a forensic digital examiner for the
17 FBI on the CART team?

18 A. 16 and a half years.

19 Q. What did you do prior to joining the FBI?

20 A. I was a computer consultant and programmer.

21 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, I think since we're just
22 doing fact testimony that any more than this would be
23 inappropriate under 702.

24 THE COURT: Okay. You can move on. Thank you.

25 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

2 Q. You mentioned digital evidence. What do you mean by
3 digital evidence?

4 A. Things like computers, thumb drives, CDs, anything that
5 stores information in a digital format.

6 Q. Taking a step back, what does it mean to forensically
7 examine an electronic device?

8 A. Basically we just categorize and organize the data so it's
9 easier to look through.

10 Q. Mr. Flatley, what is considered a computer?

11 A. To be considered a computer, a device has to have four
12 characteristics. It has to take input, it has to give output,
13 it has to have some kind of processor, and have some kind of
14 storage.

15 Q. Where is information stored on a computer?

16 A. On your average computer, it's stored on the hard drive.

17 Q. What is a hard drive?

18 A. It's an electromechanical device for storing digital data.

19 Q. When you analyze digital evidence, what, if anything, do
20 you know about the case?

21 A. Usually nothing.

22 Q. Mr. Flatley, did there come a time when you examined
23 digital evidence in this case?

24 A. Yes, there did.

25 Q. In approximately what year or years?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 A. It began in 2019.

2 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, I would like to show the
3 witness what's been marked for identification as Government
4 Exhibit 54.

5 THE COURT: Okay.

6 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor. I'm going to
7 show it to defense counsel.

8 THE COURT: Thank you.

9 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

10 Q. Mr. Flatley, do you recognize this?

11 A. Yes, I do.

12 Q. What is it?

13 A. It's one of the hard drives I examined in this case.

14 Q. What is the NYC number?

15 A. The NYC number here, NYC024350. It's a unique identifier
16 that I place on different pieces of evidence. Every piece of
17 evidence gets its own NYC number.

18 Q. How do you recognize Government Exhibit 54 as a device you
19 examined?

20 A. It has my initials on it and it has the case number and the
21 date.

22 Q. What was the first step you took in examining Government
23 Exhibit 54?

24 A. When I received government's 54, I plugged it into a write
25 blocker --

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. I'm sorry, Mr. Flatley. Just to take a step back, when you
2 first get it, do you mark it in some way?

3 A. Yes. I'm sorry. The first thing I do is put the NYC
4 number on it and the sticker with my initials.

5 Q. After marking it, do you create an image of the drive?

6 A. Yes. In this case, I had to inspect it to see what kind of
7 data was on it, to see if it was already an image or if it was
8 a clone so that if it was a clone, I would have to image it.
9 If it was an image, I would just have to copy it.

10 Q. Did you end up making an image of this device?

11 A. Yes, I did.

12 Q. What does it mean to make an image of a device?

13 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, this is outside the 702
14 disclosure.

15 THE COURT: Overruled.

16 A. So an image is a bit-for-bit copy of the media from the
17 very beginning to the very end. We take those -- that copy and
18 we write it into several different files and then that way it
19 containerizes the data inside it so we don't accidentally mess
20 it up.

21 Q. Did you image the drive that's been marked for
22 identification that's been marked as Government Exhibit 54?

23 A. Yes, I did.

24 Q. Can you explain to the jury how you made or what tools you
25 used to make a forensic image of the hard drive?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 A. Sure. There is a possibility of three different tools that
2 we can use. One is a physical piece of equipment called a TX1
3 disc duplicator --

4 Q. Mr. Flatley, sorry to interrupt. In this case, what did
5 you use here?

6 A. I used the TX1 disc duplicator.

7 Q. Why not just examine the drive itself in this case,
8 Government Exhibit 54?

9 A. Hard drives are a little fragile, especially this one, it's
10 pretty old. The fact that we spin it up, that may be the last
11 time it ever spins. So we always make a copy and we work off
12 the copy so that we have our data. We can make arguably
13 infinite copies of that data and prove that it's the same data.
14 So that's what we do.

15 Q. What, if anything, do you do to determine that the image
16 you made from Government Exhibit 54 matched the data on
17 Government Exhibit 54?

18 A. We run a hash algorithm, which is basically a math problem
19 against the data that we copied and the data from the original,
20 and if the hashes match, then the data is identical, and the
21 data was in this case.

22 Q. After you made an image of Government Exhibit 54, what do
23 you do next?

24 A. After the 54 was imaged, I then placed it through our
25 software, AccessData's lab to categorize and organize the data.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. What is AccessData's lab?

2 A. It's a piece of forensic software.

3 Q. Did there come a time when you were asked to review the
4 image you made of Government Exhibit 54?

5 A. Yes, there did.

6 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, could we please pull up
7 for the witness, the Court, and the parties what's been marked
8 for identification as Government Exhibit 419.

9 Q. Mr. Flatley, do you recognize this?

10 A. Yes, I do.

11 Q. What is it?

12 A. It is a piece of the software registry information for
13 government's 54.

14 Q. And what is registry software information?

15 A. So the registry is a database, a hierarchical database that
16 Windows uses to store all its settings.

17 Q. Does Government Exhibit 419 fairly and accurately reflect
18 the registry software information for Government Exhibit 54?

19 A. Yes, it does.

20 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, the government offers
21 Government Exhibit 419.

22 MS. MENNINGER: No objection, your Honor.

23 THE COURT: Thank you. GX419 is admitted. You may
24 publish.

25 (Government's Exhibit 419 received in evidence)

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. Mr. Flatley, let's walk through the information listed in
2 Government Exhibit 419. What is listed as the install date for
3 Government Exhibit 54?

4 A. It's February 22nd, 2001.

5 Q. What is listed as the product name here?

6 A. Microsoft Windows 2000.

7 Q. Do you see where it says registered organization?

8 A. Yes, I do.

9 Q. What is registered organization mean?

10 A. It's a standard user inputtable field that Windows displays
11 to you when you first set up the computer and it asks for
12 basically the company name that owns the computer.

13 Q. You just mentioned user inputtable. Just briefly, what
14 does that mean?

15 A. That means when you first start the computer, it asks who
16 is the organization, who owns this, and you answer, you type in
17 on a keyboard.

18 Q. What is listed as the registered organization?

19 A. Gmax.

20 Q. And what is registered owner?

21 A. It's the same kind of field as registered organization.
22 It's user inputtable field that's put in when you first start
23 the computer.

24 Q. What is listed as the registered owner here?

25 A. Gmax.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, now we can bring that
2 down.

3 Can we pull up for the witness, the Court, and the
4 parties what's been marked for identification as Government
5 Exhibit 424.

6 Q. Mr. Flatley, do you see that?

7 A. Yes, I do.

8 Q. Do you recognize Government Exhibit 424?

9 A. Yes, I do. It's an email that was printed from
10 Government's 54.

11 Q. And how do you recognize this?

12 A. I reviewed it prior to court today.

13 Q. Is Government Exhibit 424 a true and accurate copy of an
14 email on Government Exhibit 54?

15 A. Yes, it is.

16 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, the government offers
17 Government Exhibit 424.

18 MS. MENNINGER: No objection, your Honor.

19 THE COURT: Thank you. GX424 is admitted. You may
20 publish.

21 (Government's Exhibit 424 received in evidence)

22 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

23 Ms. Drescher, if we can publish.

24 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

25 Q. I'd like to turn to the first email in the chain on page 2.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Mr. Flatley, what is the date and time of the email?

2 A. The email was sent on Friday, May 25th, 2001, at 12:05 p.m.

3 Q. Who is the email from?

4 A. It's from gmax1@mindspring.com.

5 Q. Who is the recipient of the email?

6 A. Sally Markham.

7 MS. POMERANTZ: I'd like to ask, Ms. Drescher, if you
8 could, highlight the language starting with "I need to know"
9 and we can go through the end of number 6.

10 Q. Mr. Flatley, can I ask you to read the highlighted
11 language, please?

12 A. "I need to know what if any list John is using and he needs
13 to understand that he is doing a truly awful job.

14 1. There was no drinking water in the black Merc.

15 2. There were no pens in the black Merc.

16 3. The bulb on JE desk was burnt out when we arrived.

17 4. The pool deck was so filthy, JE had to ask him to
18 pressure wash it. Is this not the gardener's job? And if so,
19 why does John not have it done?

20 5. Even though John said that he changed the color
21 card in the computer, having done it would it could not -- he
22 could not see that it was exactly the same as before, i.e., no
23 different, and that obviously JE would not be happy with it.

24 6. The massage creams, et cetera, in JE's bathroom
25 were a mess. No one had it tidied up and arranged them so it

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 was neat."

2 MS. POMERANTZ: And if we could highlight the last two
3 lines of this. Sorry, Ms. Drescher. Starting with "How are we
4 doing." Thanks very much.

5 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you read that highlighted language,
6 please.

7 A. Sure. "How are we doing with the PB manual - where do we
8 stand with it? G."

9 MS. POMERANTZ: We can move out of that and let's move
10 up to page 1 of this exhibit and take a look at the email
11 response to the prior email that we just looked at.

12 Q. Mr. Flatley, what is the date and time of the email?

13 A. It's 6:46 p.m. on May 25th, 2001.

14 Q. And who is the email addressed to?

15 A. It's addressed to Ms. Maxwell.

16 Q. And if we could just scroll down to the bottom of the
17 email. And who is it signed by?

18 A. Signed by Sally.

19 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, let's pull back up to
20 the first page. Thank you very much.

21 THE COURT: Ms. Pomerantz, could I get you a little
22 bit louder, please.

23 MS. POMERANTZ: Of course, your Honor. Thank you.

24 Ms. Drescher, can you highlight the paragraph starting
25 with "John and I specifically talked."

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you read that paragraph, please.

2 A. Sure. "John and I specifically talked last week about how
3 important these details are. About two weeks ago, I faxed your
4 checkoff lists to John in preparation for the manual. These
5 are the lists you made and I'd say they are at least 3/4
6 complete. (This is the third time I've reviewed these lists
7 with him since I've started.) He stated the lists are
8 complete, although I definitely want to add to them and edit
9 them as your needs change."

10 MS. POMERANTZ: If we can pull out of that, we can
11 drop that call out, and if we can zoom in on the paragraph
12 starting with "Our household manual draft." Thanks very much.

13 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you please read that.

14 A. Sure. "Our household manual draft does indicate where to
15 purchase "Cleaning supplies" (Publix and Sam's Club-PB Gardens)
16 and states "Use only Tide with bleach, Downy softeners (switch
17 fragrance every 2-3 months) Bounce dryer sheets. We did edit
18 and reviewed this information last week. However, we have not
19 completed an inventory list/check off list of supplies yet."

20 Q. Thank you, Mr. Flatley. And directing your attention to
21 the top of page 1, who is this email from?

22 A. It is from gmax, gmax1@mindspring.com.

23 Q. And who is this email to?

24 A. MarkhamCPM@earthlink.net.

25 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can pull that down.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Thanks very much.

2 Ms. Drescher, can we pull up for the witness, the
3 Court, and the parties what's been marked for identification as
4 Government Exhibit 418 and 418R. If we can pull them up side
5 by side.

6 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

7 Q. Mr. Flatley, do you recognize this exhibit?

8 A. Yes, I do.

9 Q. What is it?

10 A. That's a document that was printed from Government 54.

11 Q. And are you referring Government Exhibit 418 or 418R?

12 A. Both of them. One was -- one is just redacted.

13 Q. And just to be clear for the record, which is the redacted
14 one?

15 A. Redacted is 418R.

16 Q. And Government Exhibit 418, how do you recognize this
17 exhibit?

18 A. I reviewed it prior to court today.

19 Q. Where did you locate this exhibit?

20 A. It was on Government's 54.

21 Q. Is this a true and accurate copy of a document on
22 Government Exhibit 54?

23 A. Yes, it is.

24 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, the government would offer
25 Government Exhibit 418 under seal and 418R publicly.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 MS. MENNINGER: No objection to that, your Honor.

2 I would note that the unredacted one is visible on
3 counsel's table. So I'm not sure if the --

4 THE COURT: We'll take those down from counsel's
5 table.

6 MS. POMERANTZ: We can take down Government Exhibit
7 418. Thank you.

8 THE COURT: So 418 is admitted under seal because it
9 has third-party telephone numbers. And 418R is admitted with
10 some of those phone numbers redacted.

11 (Government's Exhibits 418, 418R received in evidence)

12 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

13 Ms. Drescher, could we pull up for the witness, the
14 Court, and the parties what has been marked for identification
15 as Government Exhibit 418B.

16 Q. Mr. Flatley, do you recognize this?

17 A. Yes, I do.

18 Q. What is it?

19 A. It is the properties of the document you just showed me,
20 418.

21 Q. And does Government Exhibit 418B fairly and accurately
22 reflect the properties for Government Exhibit 418?

23 A. Yes, it does.

24 Q. How do you know that?

25 A. I reviewed it prior to court today.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. What did you do to review?

2 A. I'm sorry?

3 Q. What did you do to review?

4 A. I looked at it in my forensic software.

5 MS. POMERANTZ: The government offers Government
6 Exhibit 418B.

7 MS. MENNINGER: No objection, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Thank you. GX418B is admitted. You may
9 publish.

10 (Government's Exhibit 418B received in evidence)

11 MS. POMERANTZ: Thanks, your Honor. If I may, I'm
12 going to go through a couple more exhibits to enter them and
13 then I'll publish them for the jury.

14 THE COURT: That's fine. Thank you.

15 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

16 Ms. Drescher, could we pull up for the witness, the
17 Court, and the parties what's been marked for identification as
18 Government Exhibit 420 and 421.

19 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

20 Q. Mr. Flatley, please let me know when you've reviewed those
21 exhibits.

22 A. I have.

23 Q. Thank you.

24 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, if we could pull up
25 Government Exhibit 422 for just the witness, the Court, and the

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 parties.

2 Q. Mr. Flatley, let me know when you've reviewed that, please.

3 A. I have.

4 Q. Do you recognize Government Exhibits 420, 421, and 422?

5 A. Yes, I do.

6 Q. What are they?

7 A. They're documents that were printed off of Government
8 Exhibit 54.

9 Q. What kind of documents are they?

10 A. They are Word documents.

11 Q. And how do you recognize these exhibits?

12 A. I reviewed them prior to court today.

13 Q. Are they true and accurate copies of Word documents on
14 Government Exhibit 54?

15 A. Yes, they are.

16 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, the government offers
17 Government Exhibit 420, 421, and 422.

18 MS. MENNINGER: No objection, your Honor.

19 THE COURT: Thank you. 420, 421, and 422 are
20 admitted.

21 (Government's Exhibits 420, 421, 422 received in
22 evidence)

23 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can pull that down.
24 If we can pull up for the witness, the Court, and the parties
25 what's been marked for identification as Government Exhibit

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 420B and 421B.

2 Q. Mr. Flatley, please let me know when you've reviewed this.

3 A. I have.

4 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, if we can pull up 422B,
5 please.

6 Q. Mr. Flatley, let me know when you've reviewed that.

7 A. I have.

8 Q. Do you recognize Government Exhibits 420B, 421B, and 422B?

9 A. Yes, I do.

10 Q. What are they?

11 A. They are the properties of the documents that are
12 associated with.

13 Q. Do these exhibits fairly and accurately reflect the
14 properties for the corresponding exhibits?

15 A. Yes, they do.

16 Q. How do you know that?

17 A. I reviewed it prior to court today.

18 MS. POMERANTZ: The government offers Government
19 Exhibits 420B, 421B, and 422B.

20 MS. MENNINGER: No objection, your Honor.

21 THE COURT: 420B, 421B, 422B are admitted.

22 (Government's Exhibits 420B, 421B, 422B received in
23 evidence)

24 MS. POMERANTZ: Thank you, your Honor.

25 Q. Mr. Flatley, where were Government Exhibits 418, 420, 421,

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 and 422 saved?

2 A. They were on Government Exhibit 54.

3 Q. Were they saved under any user account?

4 A. Just give me one second. Yes, they were saved under -- in
5 the documents folder for a user, Ghislaine.

6 Q. When you say they were saved under a user account, what
7 does that mean?

8 MS. MENNINGER: Objection, your Honor. The user
9 account was outside the scope.

10 THE COURT: Overruled.

11 A. So when you have a computer, a Windows computer, when you
12 have a sign-in, a log-in ID username and password, it creates a
13 folder structure under that name to organize the different data
14 on it in case there is other users that are also on the
15 machine. So, these particular documents were saved under the
16 documents folder under the user Ghislaine.

17 Q. What kind of files are Government Exhibits 418, 420, 421,
18 and 422?

19 A. They're Microsoft Word documents.

20 Q. Where are properties stored in a Word document?

21 A. So Word documents are actually not just one file, there are
22 several files that are kind of cobbled together and one of
23 those files maintains the properties of the document.

24 Q. Just put simply, how can someone determine the properties
25 in a Word document?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 A. So there are two ways you can do it. If the document is
2 open in Word and you go up to File and go down to Properties,
3 it will tell you that. Or, if the document is closed, you can
4 just right-click on the document and select Properties and it
5 will tell you the same information.

6 Q. When a Word document is created, is there metadata that is
7 generated that reflects the creation date of that file?

8 A. Yes, there is.

9 Q. Do Word documents have metadata regarding dates of
10 modification?

11 A. Yes, they do.

12 Q. And what is that referred to as?

13 A. The date modified.

14 Q. What does that metadata reflect?

15 A. The last time somebody saved it.

16 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, could you please publish
17 Government Exhibit 420 and 420B, which are now in evidence,
18 side by side.

19 Q. Let's just take a look at 420B, Mr. Flatley. What is
20 listed as authors?

21 A. The author is listed as gmax.

22 Q. What is listed as last saved by?

23 A. That is also gmax.

24 Q. And what is listed as the content created date for this
25 document?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 A. Created on September 7th, 2002.

2 Q. And what is listed as the date last saved?

3 A. September 13th, 2002.

4 Q. What is listed here for last printed?

5 A. September 7th, 2002.

6 Q. And what is listed as the total editing time?

7 A. 30 minutes.

8 Q. Mr. Flatley, just focusing on --

9 THE COURT: I'm sorry, Ms. Pomerantz. I can't hear
10 you.

11 MS. POMERANTZ: I'm sorry, your Honor. My apologies.

12 Q. Looking at Government Exhibit 420, what is the date in the
13 top-right corner?

14 A. September 7th, 2002.

15 Q. And if you could read the title of the document, please.

16 A. Sure. It's PB New Shampoo and Massage Products.

17 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can take that down.
18 Thanks very much.

19 Ms. Drescher, could you now publish Government Exhibit
20 418R and 418B. They're already in evidence, so we can publish
21 them side by side, please.

22 Q. Let's start with 418R, Mr. Flatley. On the first page, can
23 you read the top of the document, which I'm going to ask
24 Ms. Drescher to highlight for you.

25 A. It says, Palm Beach House Workers.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 MS. POMERANTZ: We can pull that down.

2 Q. If you can read the names under full-time workers and just
3 the first entry would be fine. Thank you.

4 A. John and Mary Alessi.

5 Q. If we can turn to page 2 of this document, can you read the
6 top of the page 2 of this document.

7 A. Palm Beach House Maintenance.

8 Q. And I want to direct your attention to where it says FedEx.
9 Can you read that, please.

10 A. Sure. It says, FedEx an 800 number, 800-463-3339. The
11 account number is 114420816. Nearest dropoff - box next to
12 P.B. National Bank on Worth Avenue.

13 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can take that down.

14 Q. Let's take a look at 418B. Who is the author?

15 A. The author is gmax.

16 Q. Who is the document last saved by?

17 A. Last saved by gmax.

18 Q. What is the revision number listed here?

19 A. 2.

20 Q. And what is the last printed date here?

21 A. The last printed date is January 29th, 2002, 6:01 p.m.

22 Q. And what is the content created date?

23 A. It's January 29th, 2002, 6:05 p.m.

24 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can pull those down
25 now. Thank you.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 If we could pull up Government Exhibit 421 and 421B,
2 which are already in evidence.

3 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you read Government Exhibit 421.

4 A. Sure. It says: "Help wanted. Are you a massage
5 therapist? Work in Palm Beach home. Excellent pay. Mostly
6 weekends. Please call 351-1000. Leave message."

7 Q. Mr. Flatley, focusing on 421B, who is listed as authors?

8 A. The author is gmax.

9 Q. Who is listed as last saved by?

10 A. Last saved by gmax.

11 Q. On what date was the content created?

12 A. Created on September 17th, 2001.

13 Q. What's listed as the date last saved?

14 A. September 17th, 2001.

15 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, we can pull that down.

16 If we could publish 422 and 422B.

17 Q. Mr. Flatley, I want to focus your attention to Government
18 Exhibit 422B.

19 A. Okay.

20 Q. On what date was the document created?

21 A. The document was created on October 14th, 2002.

22 Q. And what's listed as the late last saved?

23 A. October 14th, 2002.

24 Q. What's listed as the last printed date?

25 A. October 13th, 2002.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - direct

1 Q. What is the total editing time?

2 A. 20 minutes.

3 Q. And I want to direct your attention to Government Exhibit
4 422.

5 MS. POMERANTZ: Ms. Drescher, can you please zoom in
6 on the first paragraph.

7 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you please read the first photograph gmax
8 wrote?

9 A. Sure. "Jeffrey and Ghislaine have been together, a couple
10 for the last 11 years. They are, contrary to what many people
11 think, rarely apart - I almost always see them together."

12 MS. POMERANTZ: We can pull that down.

13 Let's zoom in on the second paragraph.

14 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you please read the second paragraph gmax
15 wrote.

16 A. Sure. "Ghislaine is highly intelligent, and great company
17 with a ready smile and an infectious laugh who always puts one
18 at one's ease, and always makes one feel welcome."

19 MS. POMERANTZ: And let's pull up the next paragraph.

20 A. "Jeffrey and Ghislaine share many mutual interests and they
21 have a lot of fun together. They both have keen searching and
22 inquisitive minds. She grew up amongst scientists and in an
23 academic and business environment."

24 MS. POMERANTZ: We can pull that down, Ms. Drescher.

25 Thank you.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 Can we zoom in on the last paragraph, please.

2 Q. Mr. Flatley, can you please read this last paragraph.

3 Thank you.

4 A. "Jeffrey and Ghislaine complement each other really well
5 and I cannot imagine one without the other. On top of being
6 great partners, they are also the best of friends."

7 MS. POMERANTZ: Your Honor, may I have one moment,
8 please?

9 THE COURT: You may.

10 MS. POMERANTZ: No further questions, your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Thank you. Ms. Menninger.

12 CROSS-EXAMINATION

13 BY MS. MENNINGER:

14 Q. Good morning, Mr. Flatley.

15 A. Good morning.

16 Q. How are you?

17 A. I'm fine.

18 Q. Good. The exhibit that represents the hard drive, do you
19 have that in front of you?

20 A. Yes, ma'am.

21 Q. That's GX54; correct?

22 A. Yes, ma'am.

23 Q. And it's your understanding that that hard drive was found
24 within Mr. Epstein's home in New York; correct?

25 A. Yes, ma'am.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 Q. And what you actually saw were three copies of that hard
2 drive; right?

3 A. That is correct.

4 Q. And there was no information about why there were three
5 copies of that same hard drive; correct?

6 A. No, ma'am.

7 Q. And, in fact, the three hard drives were in a box; correct?

8 A. Yes, ma'am. That's how I received them.

9 Q. And when they were in the box, the front of the box had a
10 xerox copy of another hard drive on the front; correct?

11 A. Yes, ma'am.

12 Q. You have no idea why there was a different hard drive
13 xeroxed on the front of the box; right?

14 A. I have my thoughts of why that would be.

15 Q. But you don't know?

16 A. But no one told me or conveyed to me why it was like that,
17 no.

18 Q. And there was evidence tape on the box; right?

19 A. Yes, ma'am.

20 Q. And you didn't break that evidence tape; correct?

21 A. Not for that one, no, ma'am.

22 Q. It was already broken when you received the box?

23 A. That is correct.

24 Q. And there was some indication that the drive had been
25 seized in July of 2007; correct?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Grounds?

3 MS. POMERANTZ: Foundation. Relevance.

4 THE COURT: Foundation, sustained.

5 BY MS. MENNINGER:

6 Q. Did you write a report in which you talked about the fact
7 that these devices show they were seized in July of 2007?

8 A. No, ma'am.

9 Q. And they had a name D. Klyman on them?

10 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection, your Honor. Hearsay.

11 THE COURT: Sustained.

12 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, I'm asking if he can
13 identify Government Exhibit 54 as something he previously
14 referred to with a different indication. It goes to the --

15 THE COURT: You can ask him that question. Sustained
16 on the current question.

17 MS. MENNINGER: Okay.

18 BY MS. MENNINGER:

19 Q. Do you recall whether the drive that you examined had a
20 representation on it that it was from D. Klyman?

21 A. Not on the drive, no, ma'am.

22 Q. On the box in which the drive was located; correct?

23 A. No, ma'am.

24 Q. On the bag in which the box in which the drive was located?

25 A. I do recall a D. Klyman on a bag for one of these hard

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 drives, but I couldn't tell you if it was that one.

2 Q. And you don't know who he is or what that means; correct?

3 A. No, ma'am.

4 Q. When you examined that hard drive, you don't have the
5 device, the computer that that hard drive was in; correct?

6 A. That is correct.

7 Q. You don't know if it was from a desktop computer; right?

8 A. I can make -- actually, yes, I can say it was from a
9 desktop computer.

10 Q. So not a laptop computer?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. In a stationary place; right?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. People don't usually take their desktops with them on
15 airplanes, for example; right?

16 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection.

17 THE COURT: Sustained.

18 Q. A desktop is more difficult to transport than a laptop; is
19 that fair to say?

20 A. Yes, ma'am.

21 Q. So when you examined this hard drive, you actually learned
22 that the hard drive itself was a clone of some other hard
23 drive; right?

24 A. That is correct.

25 Q. So you made a clone of a clone?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 A. I did not. I made an image of a clone.

2 Q. Thank you for the clarification. You made an image of a
3 clone; right?

4 A. Yes, ma'am.

5 Q. But you were not able to match the clone with whatever it
6 had cloned; right?

7 A. I don't understand the question.

8 Q. Well, on direct examination, you talked about how an image
9 was a bit-for-bit copy of the clone; right?

10 A. Yes, ma'am.

11 Q. And that means you were able to then confirm that the image
12 you made was identical to the clone from which you made it;
13 right?

14 A. That is correct.

15 Q. And then you believe that the thing you were imaging was a
16 clone of something else?

17 A. Yes, ma'am.

18 Q. And you don't have that something else to make sure that
19 you did an identical copy, that the clone was an identical
20 copy; correct?

21 A. Correct, I do not know what happened or who made that clone
22 or where it came from.

23 Q. Right. You just don't know?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. So you don't know whether anything was changed in the

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 course of that copying; correct?

2 A. That is correct.

3 Q. You just don't have something to compare it to; right?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. If you had the other one, you could run the same program;
6 right?

7 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Overruled.

9 Q. If you had the other one, you could run the same program
10 and make sure that they were identical; right?

11 A. That's correct.

12 Q. So, because you don't have that other thing to compare it
13 to - what you think is a desktop; right?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. - you don't know where that desktop was living when any of
16 these exhibits were created; correct?

17 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Overruled.

19 A. No, I don't.

20 Q. Right. You don't have a location, a geo location for any
21 of these particular documents you've been testifying about;
22 correct?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. So the desktop could have been in Florida or in New York or
25 somewhere else; right?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 A. Yes, that's correct.

2 Q. And so, when you examined these particular documents, you
3 were able to tell, and I think you told the jury about the user
4 that was associated with the computer, you testified was the
5 author; correct?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. Because that's the piece of information that's contained in
8 the properties, author; right?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. An author is just drawn from the person who set up the
11 computer in the first place; right?

12 A. No. In that particular instance, the author is another
13 user inputtable field from Microsoft Word when you start using
14 it and it's saved to your account. So, where the account name
15 was Ghislaine, the author name was gmax.

16 Q. So when you first set up Word, you put in your name because
17 you're the person who's installing the Word; right?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. And then when you create documents from that Word program,
20 it auto populates the name of the author from the person who
21 set it up; right?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. It doesn't actually mean a particular person is sitting in
24 front of Word on a particular time when they say new document;
25 right?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. It just auto populates it from Word; right?

3 A. Yes, that is correct.

4 Q. And it auto populates the created date or the modified date
5 and the other dates you talked about; right?

6 A. Yes, ma'am.

7 Q. That's not a person inputting a created date, it just comes
8 from the program; right?

9 A. Yes, it gets it from the system, from the clock in the
10 computer.

11 Q. So you didn't specify whether this particular computer was
12 password protected; right?

13 A. That's correct.

14 Q. You don't have any information that this computer was
15 password protected; right?

16 A. In the registry, it said that it was.

17 Q. You were able to get into the computer no problem; right?

18 A. We don't actually get into the computer. We don't go
19 through the operating system. We just take the information
20 that's on the drive and categorize it. The password and user
21 name and all that only protects the computer when you're
22 accessing it through its operating system.

23 Q. And you were accessing it through a hard drive copied
24 cloned image?

25 A. All through our forensic software.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 Q. Which was running off of the image of the clone of
2 something; right?

3 A. Yes, ma'am.

4 Q. And so, you don't know whether it was an easy-to-remember
5 password or whether the computer actually just had the password
6 on a Post-it next to it; right?

7 A. I have no idea.

8 Q. So when you were looking at these documents, these Word
9 documents, you talked about the created date; right?

10 A. Yes, ma'am.

11 Q. And that, as we just discussed, was something that was
12 populated by the computer system; right?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. And you didn't then go out and look at that created date to
15 see where any particular person was at that point in time;
16 correct?

17 A. No, ma'am.

18 Q. So if, for example, Government Exhibit 418 had some
19 metadata associated with it in 418B -- could we pull that up,
20 418B. You see that; correct?

21 A. Yes, ma'am.

22 Q. And that tells you that the document was created on January
23 29th, 2002; right?

24 A. Yes, ma'am.

25 Q. And it was only edited and so forth on that day, no other

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 day; right?

2 A. It says that it was created on the 29th and it was last
3 saved on the 29th.

4 Q. And last printed on that date; right?

5 A. Yes, ma'am.

6 Q. So, for example, if you were to go get a flight log and
7 tell where gmax was on January 29th, 2002, it might tell you
8 that gmax was in the same place as the computer or a different
9 place; right?

10 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection, your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Sustained.

12 Q. You don't know who was actually sitting down creating this
13 document; right?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. You don't even know where the computer was; correct?

16 A. That is correct.

17 Q. And if you were to ascertain that gmax was in several
18 different places when different of these documents were
19 created, it might lead one to believe that she's not the one
20 who created all these documents; right?

21 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection.

22 THE COURT: Sustained.

23 Q. Other people had access to this computer, potentially;
24 right?

25 MS. POMERANTZ: Objection.

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - cross

1 THE COURT: Overruled.

2 A. I have no idea.

3 Q. You don't know whether the computer was sitting in the
4 middle of a kitchen that other people could access it; right?

5 A. I don't know where the computer was.

6 Q. You don't know who was around the computer at any
7 particular point in time; correct?

8 A. The only thing I know is that there were three user
9 accounts on the computer - two were created by default when the
10 computer was made and the only other user account was
11 Ghislaine.

12 Q. So anyone who used that computer was using that Ghislaine
13 Maxwell user account; right?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. No other user account was used; correct?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. So if Ghislaine was not present with the computer when a
18 document was made, that would suggest other people had access
19 to the computer; correct?

20 A. I don't know who had access to the computer.

21 MS. MENNINGER: May I have one moment, your Honor?

22 THE COURT: You may.

23 MS. MENNINGER: No further questions of this witness.

24 Thank you.

25 THE COURT: Ms. Pomerantz?

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - recross

1 MS. POMERANTZ: Just briefly, your Honor.

2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

3 BY MS. POMERANTZ:

4 Q. Mr. Flatley, during the course of your review of Government
5 Exhibit 54, did you review emails?

6 A. Yes, I did.

7 Q. And as to the emails you reviewed on Government Exhibit 54,
8 how many emails did not include gmax1@mindspring.com on the
9 email chains?

10 A. They were all from that account.

11 MS. POMERANTZ: No further questions, your Honor.

12 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, on that point.

13 THE COURT: Okay.

14 RECROSS EXAMINATION

15 BY MS. MENNINGER:

16 Q. You know about email clients; right?

17 A. Yes, ma'am.

18 Q. An email client is something like Outlook or Mail; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. And when an email client like Outlook or Mail is installed
21 on a computer, it often goes up to the server and refreshes
22 itself from the server whenever that computer is connected to
23 the internet; correct?

24 A. That is correct.

25 Q. Just like my cellphone may be constantly drawing down

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - recross

1 emails or sent emails, even though I'm not using it at the
2 moment; correct?

3 A. That is correct.

4 Q. So anytime the computer was connected to the internet, it
5 may have been populating emails through an email client on it;
6 correct?

7 A. That's correct.

8 MS. POMERANTZ: No further questions. Thank you.

9 THE COURT: Thank you. Mr. Flatley, you're excused.
10 You may step down.

11 Members of the jury, we'll take our mid morning break.
12 See you in about 15 minutes. Thank you.

13 (Continued on next page)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7Cmax2

Flatley - recross

1 (Jury not present)

2 THE COURT: Mr. Flatley may step down and out.

3 (Witness excused)

4 Counsel, do we need to speak before the break?

5 MS. POMERANTZ: Nothing from the government, your

6 Honor.

7 THE COURT: I'll be back in 10 if anybody needs to see
8 me before the break ends. Thank you.

9 (Recess)

10 (Continued on next page)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

LC7VMAX3

1 THE COURT: All right. Where are we? Ms. Comey.

2 MS. COMEY: I don't believe we have matters to take
3 up, your Honor.

4 THE COURT: Oh, okay.

5 MS. COMEY: I think that the next witness will likely
6 go past the lunch break, so we can deal with the issue with
7 Brian hopefully during the lunch break.

8 THE COURT: I hadn't totally understood Ms. Moe's
9 point about the potential need to take a witness out of order
10 given the length. And it's fine with me if that's what makes
11 sense and there's no objection from the defense.

12 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor. We'll see how long
13 this next witness takes and then go from there.

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, might I hand up potential
16 cross-examination exhibits?

17 THE COURT: Will we get there before lunch?

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: I doubt it.

19 MS. COMEY: We might, but unlikely, your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Sure. Thank you, Mr. Pagliuca.

21 All right. We can bring in the jury please,
22 Ms. Williams. Thank you.

23 MS. MOE: I'm very sorry for the delay, your Honor.

24 THE COURT: Just one second please. We're about to
25 start with the jury. I'm sorry, Ms. Moe, I didn't realize we

LC7VMAX3

1 were waiting for you.

2 MS. MOE: No, your Honor. I just apologize. I got a
3 message saying that folks were waiting for me, so I apologize
4 for being late.

5 THE COURT: Oh, no, no. That's fine. Everybody has a
6 lot going on. I understand.

7 (Jury present)

8 THE COURT: Thank you, members of the jury.

9 Ms. Comey, the government may call its next witness.

10 MS. COMEY: The government calls Carolyn.

11 THE COURT: The witness testifying under the name
12 Carolyn may come forward.

13 CAROLYN,

14 called as a witness by the Government,

15 having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

16 THE COURT: Once seated, please remove your mask.

17 This witness will be testifying under the pseudonym
18 Carolyn. I remind the sketch artists that my order is in place
19 requiring no exact likenesses of the witnesses testifying under
20 pseudonym.

21 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, just to be clear, this witness
22 is testifying just under her first name, not a pseudonym. But
23 we would ask the same order be in place.

24 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Comey.

25 The witness is testifying under her first name, and

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 the anonymity order with respect to exact likenesses applies.

2 Go ahead, Ms. Comey.

3 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

4 May I inquire?

5 THE COURT: You may.

6 DIRECT EXAMINATION

7 BY MS. COMEY:

8 Q. Good morning.

9 A. Good morning.

10 Q. What's your first name?

11 A. Carolyn.

12 Q. Could you spell that for us please.

13 A. C-A-R-O-L-Y-N.

14 Q. Leading up to this trial, Carolyn, did you ask to testify
15 under just your first name to protect your privacy?

16 A. Yes, ma'am.

17 Q. I'd like to ask you to please take a look at the binder in
18 front of you. Could you please turn to Government Exhibit 11.
19 Let us know when you're there.

20 A. I'm here.

21 Q. Do you recognize that?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. What is that?

24 A. My birth certificate.

25 THE COURT: Sorry, Carolyn. If you could come closer

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 to the microphone, please.

2 A. My birth certificate.

3 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would ask that the jury be
4 permitted to turn to Government Exhibit 11 in their binders,
5 please.

6 THE COURT: Which is admitted?

7 MS. COMEY: Which is admitted, yes, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right. Without objection?

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: No objection.

10 THE COURT: Thank you.

11 Jury, please turn to GX-11.

12 BY MS. COMEY:

13 Q. Carolyn, at the top of the page here, without saying it out
14 loud, do you see the name at the very top?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Is that your full name?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And is the date of birth in the top right-hand corner your
19 date of birth?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Thank you. You can set that aside.

22 And your Honor, I'd ask that the jurors be permitted
23 to put their binders back under their chairs.

24 THE COURT: Yes. Thank you.

25 Please do so, jury. Thank you.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Carolyn, where did you grow up?

2 A. In New York.

3 Q. And then did you move somewhere from New York?

4 A. Yes, I moved down here to Florida.

5 Q. And in what year did you move to Florida?

6 A. In 1999.

7 Q. I'm going to ask you to speak into the microphone.

8 A. 1999.

9 Q. Thank you.

10 Carolyn, what is the last kind of school you attended?

11 A. Middle school.

12 Q. What is the last grade you attended before dropping out in
13 middle school?

14 A. Seventh.

15 Q. After you dropped out in seventh grade, did you ever go
16 back to school?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Carolyn, have you used drugs in your life?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Have you been addicted to drugs in your life?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What drugs have you been addicted to?

23 A. Pain pills and cocaine.

24 Q. I want to talk a little bit about when you were in middle
25 school. Where did you go to middle school?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. At H. L. Watkins.

2 Q. In what town is H. L. Watkins?

3 A. Palm Beach Gardens.

4 Q. Is that in Florida?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. When you were 14 years old, who lived at home with you?

7 A. My mom and my brothers.

8 Q. Are your brothers older or younger than you?

9 A. Younger.

10 Q. What was your life like at home when you were 14 years old?

11 A. I was allowed to do whatever I wanted.

12 Q. Why is that?

13 A. Because my mom was an alcoholic and a drug addict.

14 Q. When you were between the ages of 14 and 16, how did you
15 make money?

16 A. I went to Mr. Epstein's house and got money that way.

17 Q. How did you first meet -- and when you say "Mr. Epstein,"
18 do you know his full name?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What's his full name?

21 A. Jeffrey Epstein.

22 Q. How did you first meet Jeffrey Epstein?

23 A. Through the guy I was dating.

24 Q. What's the first name of the guy you were dating when you
25 were 14?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Shawn.

2 Q. Can you spell that for us?

3 A. S-H-A-W-N.

4 Q. How did you meet Shawn?

5 A. He lives across the street from me.

6 Q. In West Palm Beach?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. About how old were you when you first started dating Shawn?

9 A. Thirteen.

10 Q. About how old was Shawn when you first started dating him?

11 A. Seventeen.

12 Q. I'd like you to please turn back to the binder and pull out
13 what's been marked for identification has Government Exhibit
14 20. Let us know when you're there.

15 A. I'm sorry, which exhibit?

16 Q. Two zero, 20.

17 A. I'm here.

18 Q. Is the name on that exhibit, without saying it out loud,
19 Shawn's full name?

20 A. Yes.

21 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this
22 exhibit under seal.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: No objection.

24 THE COURT: Thank you.

25 GX-20 is admitted under seal to protect the identity

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 of the third party and the witness.

2 (Government's Exhibit 20 received in evidence)

3 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may we have the jurors please
4 turn to this exhibit in their binders.

5 THE COURT: They may.

6 Please take out your binders. GX-20.

7 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

8 I think the jurors can put the binders back down.

9 THE COURT: Okay. Please do so, jury.

10 BY MS. COMEY:

11 Q. Carolyn, when you first met Shawn, how old did you tell him
12 you were?

13 A. Seventeen.

14 Q. How, if at all, to your knowledge, did Shawn learn how old
15 you actually were?

16 A. I was going -- I had a birthday and I was going to be 14.

17 Q. Did he come to your 14th birthday party?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. And is that how he learned your actual age?

20 A. Yeah.

21 THE COURT: I just ask again, Carolyn, please speak
22 directly into the mic so everyone can hear you. Thank you.

23 Q. How did Shawn lead you to meeting Jeffrey Epstein?

24 A. Through friends of his, Virginia Roberts and Tony Figueroa.

25 Q. How did you meet Virginia?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Through Shawn.

2 Q. About how old were you when you met Virginia?

3 A. Fourteen.

4 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, would you please pull up
5 what's in evidence as Government Exhibit 113.

6 Q. Carolyn, do you recognize the person on the screen in front
7 of you?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Who is that?

10 A. That's Virginia.

11 Q. Is that the same Virginia we were just talking about?

12 A. Yes, ma'am.

13 MS. COMEY: We can take that down. Thank you.

14 Q. Who was Tony in relation to Virginia?

15 A. Her boyfriend.

16 Q. What would you, Shawn, Tony, and Virginia do together when
17 you were 14 years old?

18 A. We would smoke pot.

19 Q. How do you remember Jeffrey Epstein first coming up with
20 that group?

21 A. Virginia asked me if I wanted to go make money.

22 Q. Did she tell you what you would need to do to make that
23 money?

24 A. Not right away.

25 Q. Before you ultimately went, did she tell you?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. No.

2 Q. What did she tell you?

3 A. That we were going to go to her friend's house who lived on
4 Palm Beach Island, and I was going to meet one of her wealthy
5 friends.

6 Q. And do what?

7 A. Give him a massage.

8 Q. How did you respond?

9 A. Okay. I said okay.

10 Q. Why did you say okay?

11 A. Because I was going to make a lot of money.

12 Q. About how old were you the first time you went to Jeffrey
13 Epstein's house?

14 A. Fourteen.

15 Q. Do you remember about what time of year it was the year you
16 were 14?

17 A. Yes. It is around spring, like going into summer.

18 Q. How did you get to Jeffrey Epstein's house that first time?

19 A. Virginia drove me.

20 Q. When you got to Jeffrey Epstein's house -- withdrawn.

21 Where was Jeffrey Epstein's house?

22 A. On Palm Beach Island.

23 Q. What did the outside of the house look like that first day
24 you went there?

25 A. I could tell it was a mansion and it was pink.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Did you go there multiple times after that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Did the color of the house change at some point?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. To what?

6 A. White.

7 Q. That first day when you got to Jeffrey Epstein's house, who
8 went inside?

9 A. Me and Virginia.

10 Q. What room did you walk into?

11 A. The kitchen.

12 Q. When you walked into the kitchen, what happened?

13 A. We were greeted by Ms. Maxwell.

14 Q. What did Ms. Maxwell look like?

15 A. An older lady.

16 Q. Can you describe her.

17 A. She had an accent and she had like shoulder-length black
18 hair.

19 Q. How did you learn her name?

20 A. She introduced herself.

21 Q. Did she say just her last name or both her first and her
22 last name?

23 A. Her first and her last name.

24 Q. What did you call her?

25 A. Maxwell.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Why did you call her Maxwell instead of using her first
2 name?

3 A. Because I couldn't exactly pronounce her first name
4 correctly.

5 Q. When Maxwell greeted you in the kitchen, what, if anything,
6 did Virginia say to Maxwell?

7 A. That I was her friend.

8 Q. Did she say your name?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What did she say?

11 A. She said, This is my friend Carolyn.

12 Q. And what did Maxwell say?

13 A. You can bring her upstairs and show her what to do.

14 Q. What happened next?

15 A. We walked up the stairs that were in the kitchen, and we
16 passed a bunch of bedrooms and entered into Mr. Epstein's
17 bedroom, into his bathroom area.

18 Q. Can you describe the bathroom that you went into off of
19 Mr. Epstein's bedroom.

20 A. Yes. When you walk in, there is a sink to your right,
21 there is a dresser to the left, there is a closet area, there
22 is a toilet area, there is a steam room, and then there's a
23 shower.

24 Q. What, if any, seating do you remember?

25 A. There is an ugly polka-dotted couch.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. After you went into that room with Virginia, what did
2 Virginia show you?

3 A. Where the massage table was.

4 Q. Then what happened?

5 A. We walked into the little closet area and she was pulling
6 out the massage table. And I was looking at all the photos
7 that were on the wall.

8 Q. What else did Virginia show you, if anything?

9 A. Where all the massage oils and lotions were kept.

10 Q. And where was that?

11 A. In the bottom drawer of the dresser that is on your
12 left-hand side.

13 Q. After the massage table was set up, what did you and
14 Virginia do next?

15 A. Virginia had taken off her clothes and she asked me if I
16 would be comfortable taking off mine. And I told her I would
17 like to keep my bra and underwear on.

18 Q. So at that point what was Virginia wearing?

19 A. Nothing.

20 Q. And what were you wearing?

21 A. My bra and underwear.

22 Q. What happened next?

23 A. Mr. Epstein came into the room.

24 Q. Then what happened?

25 A. He brushed his teeth and then laid face down on the massage

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 table.

2 Q. While Mr. Epstein was face down on the massage table, what
3 did you and Virginia do?

4 A. We massaged the backs of his legs up to his buttocks.

5 Q. Then what happened?

6 A. After 45 minutes, he had turned over.

7 Q. What happened when Mr. Epstein turned over?

8 A. Virginia got on top of him.

9 Q. And what did you see Virginia and Mr. Epstein doing?

10 A. Having sex.

11 Q. Where were you while Virginia and Mr. Epstein were having
12 sex on the massage table?

13 A. I was sitting on the couch right in front of them.

14 Q. Did Mr. Epstein touch you during this first massage?

15 A. No.

16 Q. After that ended, what happened next?

17 A. I was paid.

18 Q. Where did the money come from?

19 A. It was on top of the sink.

20 Q. In that same bathroom?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Who got money?

23 A. Me and Virginia.

24 Q. How much money did you get?

25 A. \$300.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. How much money did Virginia get?

2 A. I'm not exactly sure.

3 Q. What denominations were the bills?

4 A. Hundred dollar bills.

5 Q. After that first time, did you go back to Jeffrey Epstein's
6 house with Virginia again?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Why not?

9 A. Because I didn't have to.

10 Q. Why not?

11 A. Because when we were leaving, Maxwell had asked me for my
12 telephone number.

13 Q. And did you give her your telephone number?

14 A. Yes.

15 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, would you please pull up
16 what's in evidence as Government Exhibit 115.

17 Q. Carolyn, do you recognize the person in this photograph?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Who is that?

20 THE COURT: I'm sorry, I need the witness to speak
21 into the microphone.

22 A. That's Mrs. Maxwell.

23 THE COURT: Thank you.

24 MS. COMEY: Now, can we please go to Government
25 Exhibit 112, Ms. Drescher.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Do you recognize the person in this photograph?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Who is that?

4 A. That's Mr. Epstein.

5 MS. COMEY: Let's take that down please, Ms. Drescher.

6 Q. Carolyn, in total, approximately how many times did you go
7 over to Mr. Epstein's house to give him massages?

8 A. Over 100.

9 Q. About how often did you go over to his house to provide
10 those massages?

11 A. Two to three times a week.

12 Q. About how old were you the first time you went over to his
13 house?

14 A. Fourteen.

15 Q. And about how old were you the last time you went over to
16 his house?

17 A. Eighteen.

18 Q. Do you remember the exact details of every encounter you
19 had at that house?

20 A. A lot of them run together.

21 Q. Do some of those details and events stand out more in your
22 mind though?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Carolyn, I'd like to ask you -- go ahead and get a drink.

25 Would you please pick up the binder again and turn to

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 what's been marked for identification as Government Exhibit
2 104.

3 A. One 0 what?

4 Q. 104.

5 Do you recognize that?

6 A. Yes, I do.

7 Q. What is it?

8 A. A picture of me when I was 14.

9 Q. Does this fairly and accurately depict what you looked like
10 when you went to Jeffrey Epstein's house when you were 14 years
11 old?

12 A. Yes.

13 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this
14 exhibit under seal.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: No objection.

16 THE COURT: Thank you. GX-104 is admitted under seal
17 to protect the anonymity of the witness who I've permitted to
18 testify under her first name.

19 (Government's Exhibit 104 received in evidence)

20 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may we please ask the jurors
21 to pull out their binders and look at Government Exhibit 104.

22 THE COURT: Yes. Please, jurors, take your binders.
23 GX-104.

24 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

25 The jurors can set their binders aside.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 THE COURT: All right. Please do. Thank you.

2 BY MS. COMEY:

3 Q. Carolyn, how would you schedule times to go to Jeffrey
4 Epstein's house for massages?

5 A. Maxwell would call and set up appointment times.

6 Q. Would anyone else ever call?

7 A. I sometimes called and there over time was Sarah Kellen
8 that would call.

9 Q. Let me ask you some questions about that.

10 During about what time period do you remember Maxwell
11 being the person who would call to schedule massage
12 appointments with Jeffrey Epstein?

13 A. For like the first year or two.

14 Q. And then after that, who would call you to schedule your
15 appointments?

16 A. Sarah or I would call.

17 Q. Now, after Sarah started being the person to call you, did
18 you still see Maxwell at Epstein's house?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Where would she be?

21 A. In an office area off the kitchen.

22 Q. And you said that sometimes you would call to make
23 appointments?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Why would you call?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Because I was young and \$300 was a lot of money to me.

2 Q. What phone numbers would Maxwell and Sarah call you on in
3 order to make massage appointments?

4 A. Either my cell phone, my mom's cell phone, or Shawn's home
5 phone.

6 Q. How did they get all of those numbers?

7 A. I give -- I had given them to Maxwell.

8 Q. Why did you give extra numbers to Maxwell?

9 A. In case she couldn't get a hold of me on one.

10 Q. Was that your idea?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. Do you remember any of those phone numbers?

13 A. No, I can't.

14 Q. Do you remember your mom's cell phone number?

15 A. That I do.

16 Q. Okay. But you don't remember your own phone number or
17 Shawn's number?

18 A. I -- I've blocked it out. It's been a very long time.

19 Q. This morning, Carolyn, did I ask you to write your mom's
20 cell phone number down on a piece of paper?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Could you please turn now to what's been marked for
23 identification as Government Exhibit 608 in your binder.

24 Are you there?

25 A. Yes.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Do you recognize that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What is that?

4 A. My mother's cell phone number.

5 Q. Is that the phone number you wrote down on a piece of paper
6 this morning?

7 A. Yes.

8 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, the government offers this in
9 evidence under seal.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: No objection.

11 THE COURT: GX-608 is admitted under seal to protect
12 the anonymity of this witness.

13 (Government's Exhibit 608 received in evidence)

14 MS. COMEY: Thank you. You can set that aside,
15 Carolyn.

16 Q. Carolyn, what is your mother's first name?

17 A. Dorothy.

18 Q. Carolyn, when Maxwell called you to schedule appointments,
19 what did she say to you?

20 A. She would ask if I would be available at this time,
21 sometimes because they would be out of town and be flying in.

22 Q. During those times when Maxwell mentioned that they were
23 flying in, who's the "they" she referred to?

24 A. Her and Mr. Epstein and I don't know who else.

25 Q. And what did Maxwell say about where she and Mr. Epstein

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 were during those conversations?

2 A. Sometimes they said New York.

3 Q. How would that come up?

4 A. Well, they -- she said that they would be flying in from
5 New York, could I be available at this time.

6 Q. And when Sarah would call you to schedule an appointment,
7 what would she say?

8 A. She'd ask me if I would be available at this time.

9 Q. Were you ever present when your mom received a phone call
10 that you later learned was from Maxwell?

11 A. Sometimes, yeah, she would hand me the phone.

12 Q. What do you remember happening on those occasions?

13 A. Just my mom saying, Here, you have a phone call.

14 Q. And then what would happen?

15 A. It would be to schedule an appointment.

16 Q. Were you ever present when Shawn received a phone call on
17 his phone --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. -- from Maxwell?

20 What happened?

21 A. Shawn would tell me that I have a phone call and to say yes
22 to the appointment.

23 Q. About how many times do you remember Maxwell saying she was
24 calling from New York?

25 A. Only a couple.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Now, you mentioned that sometimes you would reach out to
2 schedule appointments yourself; is that right?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you mentioned that Shawn would tell you to go to these
5 appointments, right?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Why were you reaching out to go to these appointments?

8 A. For the money.

9 Q. What were you doing with the money?

10 A. I was buying drugs.

11 Q. What drugs were you using?

12 A. Marijuana, cocaine, alcohol, anything that could block out
13 for me to go to the appointment.

14 Q. Did you become addicted to drugs at some point while you
15 were going over to Mr. Epstein's house?

16 A. Yes, unfortunately.

17 Q. What drugs did you become addicted to?

18 A. Cocaine and pain pills.

19 Q. How did you get to Jeffrey Epstein's house for appointments
20 in your home in West Palm Beach to Palm Beach?

21 A. Sometimes it would be by a driver would be sent, or I would
22 take a cab, or Shawn would use my mom's car and drop me off,
23 and my mom has also dropped me off there.

24 Q. Why couldn't you drive yourself?

25 A. Because I wasn't of age.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. When you got a cab or a car was sent for you, how did you
2 know that those cars were on the way?

3 A. I was told.

4 Q. By who?

5 A. Either Maxwell or Sarah, whoever called to schedule the
6 appointment.

7 Q. What would they say?

8 A. That we would be sending a cab or a Town Car.

9 Q. Did Shawn ever go inside Jeffrey Epstein's house when he
10 drove you there?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Who, if anyone, did Shawn meet outside of Jeffrey Epstein's
13 house when he went with you there?

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection.

15 Lack of foundation, your Honor, under 602.

16 THE COURT: Sustained.

17 Q. When you and Shawn were together at Jeffrey Epstein's
18 house, did you ever see someone else?

19 A. When we were together at Mr. Epstein's house, yes.

20 Q. Who did you see?

21 A. I mean, he didn't go inside.

22 Q. But when you were outside, did you ever see anyone?

23 A. Yes, Mr. Epstein.

24 Q. How many times did you see Mr. Epstein when Shawn was with
25 you?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Once.

2 Q. What happened that one time?

3 A. They were talking about the Shelby Cobra that he owned.

4 Q. That who owned?

5 A. Mr. Epstein.

6 Q. Where did that conversation happen?

7 A. In the driveway.

8 Q. Carolyn, did you ever drive yourself to Jeffrey Epstein's
9 house even though you didn't have a license?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. About how many times?

12 A. A few.

13 Q. When you went over to Jeffrey Epstein's house for massage
14 appointments, where did you enter the house each time?

15 A. Through the kitchen.

16 Q. During the first few months when you were going over to
17 that house for massages, who did you see when you first entered
18 the kitchen?

19 A. Maxwell.

20 Q. What, if any, conversations do you remember having with
21 Maxwell when you would meet her in the kitchen?

22 A. She would just let me know that Mr. Epstein would be back,
23 he was on a jog or he was -- he'd be back any moment; I could
24 go upstairs and set up.

25 Q. When you interacted with Maxwell, what, if any,

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 conversations did you have with her about your family?

2 A. About my upbringing and things that were going on at the
3 time.

4 Q. What did you tell Maxwell?

5 A. That my mom was an alcoholic, and I had been molested, and
6 just random personal things.

7 Q. What, if any, conversations do you remember having with
8 Maxwell about sexual abuse that you have had experienced in the
9 past?

10 A. I'm sorry, can you repeat that?

11 Q. What conversations do you remember having with her about
12 sexual abuse that you'd experienced?

13 A. I remember telling her that I had been raped and molested
14 by my grandfather starting at the age of four.

15 Q. What, if any, conversations did you have with Maxwell about
16 travel?

17 A. I couldn't travel because I couldn't get a passport because
18 I was too young. And my mom, no matter how messed up she was,
19 there was no way I would be able to leave the country.

20 Q. How did that topic come up?

21 A. I was invited to go to an island.

22 Q. Who invited you?

23 A. Mr. Epstein and Maxwell.

24 Q. And did they invite you together in one conversation or in
25 separate conversations?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Separate.

2 Q. When you were speaking with Maxwell about that, what did
3 she say?

4 A. She had asked if I ever traveled. And I told her I've been
5 to New York, I used to live there, and just places I've been in
6 the United States.

7 Q. And then where did she invite you to?

8 A. To the island.

9 Q. And how did you respond when Maxwell invited you to the
10 island?

11 A. I told her that I was too young, and there is no way in
12 hell my mom was going to let me leave the country.

13 Q. Did you tell her how old you were?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What did you say?

16 A. I told her I was 14.

17 Q. After you told Maxwell you were 14, did she continue to
18 call you to schedule massage appointments with Jeffrey Epstein?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What, if any, conversations do you remember having with
21 Maxwell about school?

22 A. She had asked me if I had ever -- like, what I wanted to
23 do. And I told her I wanted to become a massage therapist.

24 Q. What, if any, conversations did you have with Maxwell about
25 sex toys?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. She asked me if I'd ever used them, and I told her no.

2 Q. What, if any, conversations do you remember having with
3 Maxwell about your bra and hip size?

4 A. I was upstairs setting up the massage table. And at that
5 point I was kind of comfortable because I had been there so
6 many times, that at that point I was getting fully nude. And
7 she came in and felt my boobs and my hips and my buttocks and
8 said that -- that Mr. Epstein would -- that I had a great body
9 for Mr. Epstein and his friends.

10 Q. How did that relate to your breast and hip size?

11 A. She just said that I had a good body type.

12 Q. And just so we're clear about who she is?

13 A. Maxwell.

14 Q. You said she felt your boobs. Did she touch you?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Where?

17 A. On my breasts.

18 Q. And where did that happen?

19 A. In the massage room or the bathroom.

20 Q. After that, did she leave the massage room?

21 You have to say the answer.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And then who came in?

24 A. Mr. Epstein.

25 Q. During each massage appointment at Jeffrey Epstein's house,

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 after you went into the kitchen, where would you go from there?

2 A. Upstairs to set up the massage table.

3 Q. In what room did you set up the massage table?

4 A. In his bathroom.

5 Q. In whose bathroom?

6 A. Mr. Epstein's.

7 Q. Is that the same bathroom you described for us earlier?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. When you first went into the massage room, what did you do
10 first?

11 A. I would -- well, sometimes the massage table was already
12 set up, and all I would have to do is put the towel on it. And
13 sometimes I would have to open the closet door and pull it out
14 and set it up.

15 Q. After you set up the massage table, what would you do with
16 your clothing?

17 A. I would take them off.

18 Q. At first when you were first going over to that house, what
19 would you wear during the massages?

20 A. I would keep my underwear on.

21 Q. Did that change at some point?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. What did it change to?

24 A. To me being fully nude.

25 Q. After -- withdrawn.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Other than Jeffrey Epstein, who else saw you fully
2 naked in the massage room?

3 A. Maxwell, two of Mr. Epstein's friends, and two girls that I
4 don't know who they were.

5 Q. We'll talk about them in a minute.

6 How many times approximately did Maxwell see you fully
7 naked in the massage room?

8 A. Probably about three.

9 Q. Was one of those the time when she touched your breasts?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Did she touch you the other two times that you can
12 remember?

13 A. No.

14 Q. After Maxwell saw you naked in the massage room, did she
15 continue calling you to schedule massage appointments with
16 Jeffrey Epstein?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. About how old were you when Maxwell saw you naked in the
19 massage room and touched your breasts?

20 A. I was going to be 15.

21 Q. So were you 14, almost 15?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. Did anyone ever photograph you while you were at Jeffrey
24 Epstein's house?

25 A. Yes.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Who photographed you?

2 A. Sarah.

3 Q. How did Sarah come to photograph you?

4 A. She had called me and asked -- well, she had said Mr. --
5 she called and said she was calling in regards to Mr. Epstein;
6 and that I would get paid five to \$600 if she could take
7 pictures of me.

8 Q. How did you respond?

9 A. I said okay.

10 Q. Where were those pictures taken?

11 A. In the Palm Beach house.

12 Q. What were you wearing in those pictures?

13 A. Nothing.

14 Q. Who took those pictures?

15 A. Sarah Kellen.

16 Q. Do you remember anyone else being around at that time?

17 A. No. It was just me and her that I was aware of.

18 Q. During the massage appointments, after you set up the
19 massage table and got undressed, who would come inside the
20 room?

21 A. Mr. Epstein.

22 Q. After Mr. Epstein came in the room, for the first
23 approximately 45 minutes in the room, what would you do?

24 A. Massage him.

25 Q. How would he be lying down?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Face down.

2 Q. While you were massaging Mr. Epstein, what, if any,
3 conversations did you have?

4 A. About my life, my upbringing.

5 Q. What did you tell him about your family, if anything?

6 A. That it was kind of screwed up; that my mom was an
7 alcoholic and an addict.

8 Q. And what did you tell him about sexual abuse you had
9 experienced in the past?

10 A. I had told him that I had been molested and raped.

11 Q. And what, if any, conversations did you have with him about
12 travel?

13 A. He had also asked me a couple of times if I can travel.
14 And I told him there is no way that my mom's going to let me
15 because I was too young.

16 Q. In those conversations, did you tell Jeffrey Epstein how
17 old you were?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. What did you say?

20 A. I told him that I was only 15 and I couldn't leave.

21 Q. After each massage, what were you paid?

22 A. Three to \$400.

23 Q. Usually where would the money be after each massage?

24 A. On the sink.

25 Q. Did anyone ever hand you money?

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Once or twice Ms. Maxwell did.

2 Q. About how much money do you remember Ms. Maxwell handing
3 you after you engaged in a sexualized massage with Jeffrey
4 Epstein?

5 A. \$300.

6 Q. What denominations were the bills?

7 A. Hundreds.

8 Q. Other than money, what gifts, if any, did you receive from
9 Jeffrey Epstein?

10 A. I received lingerie.

11 Q. How did you get that lingerie?

12 A. Through FedEx.

13 Q. Where did you receive a FedEx package?

14 A. At my home.

15 Q. In what town was your home?

16 A. West Palm Beach.

17 Q. Is that the home where you lived with your mom and your
18 younger brothers?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Did you notice the return address from those packages?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What was it?

23 A. Manhattan, New York.

24 Q. Any reason that stands out in your mind?

25 A. Yeah. Because I was born in New York, so -- and also I

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 knew that he had a home here in New York.

2 Q. What was inside those packages?

3 A. Lingerie from Victoria's Secrets.

4 Q. How did Mr. Epstein get your address as far as you know?

5 A. I had given --

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection, your Honor.

7 Lack of foundation.

8 THE COURT: Sustained.

9 Q. Did you give your address to anyone?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Who?

12 A. Maxwell.

13 Q. Why did you give your address to Maxwell?

14 A. Because Jeffrey Epstein wanted to send me some items. I
15 wasn't sure what the items were going to be.

16 Q. And so did she ask for your address?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And did you give her your address?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Other than the lingerie, did you receive any other gifts?

21 A. Yes. A massage book for dummies, because I wanted to be a
22 massage therapist; and concert tickets to Incubus.

23 Q. Other than Virginia, were there ever any other females in
24 the room with you when you were massaging Jeffrey Epstein?

25 A. Yes.

LC7VMAX3

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. How did those other females end up in the room?

2 A. They came in the room.

3 Q. With who?

4 A. Themselves.

5 Q. Did you ever bring friends to Jeffrey's house?

6 You have to say the answer.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. About how many friends did you bring to Jeffrey Epstein's
9 house?

10 A. Two or three.

11 Q. What are the names of some of the friends you remember
12 bringing? First names.

13 A. Amanda Lazlo, Tatum, and Julie Morgan.

14 (Continued on next page)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 BY MS. COMEY:

2 Q. About how old were they when you brought them over?

3 A. Amanda was one year older than me, Tatum was the same age
4 as me, and so was Julie.

5 Q. How old were you when you brought Amanda?

6 A. I believe I was 15 or 16.

7 Q. And so how old was Amanda?

8 A. She was a year older than me. So I believe she was going
9 to be 17.

10 Q. And how old were you when you brought Tatum?

11 A. When we were 15, going to be 16.

12 Q. And how old were you when you brought Julie?

13 A. 16.

14 Q. Why did you bring friends to Jeffrey Epstein's house?

15 A. He asked me if I had any friends that were my age or
16 younger, and I told him I didn't hang out with younger people,
17 but I do have some friends I can ask.

18 Q. Do you remember anyone else asking you to bring friends?

19 A. No.

20 Q. When you brought your friends over to Jeffrey's house,
21 where did you enter the house with them?

22 A. Through the kitchen area.

23 Q. Where did you go next?

24 A. Up the stairs into the massage room.

25 Q. And after the massage ended, what were you and the friend

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 paid?

2 A. I was paid \$600 and my friend was paid \$300.

3 Q. In what denominations?

4 A. Hundreds.

5 Q. Why did you get extra?

6 A. Because I brought her, a friend with me.

7 Q. About how long did each massage with Jeffrey Epstein last?

8 A. 45 minutes.

9 Q. After that first 45 minutes, what happened each time?

10 A. He would turn over and start masturbating until he
11 ejaculated.

12 Q. During how many of the massages you gave Jeffrey Epstein
13 did he masturbate?

14 A. Every single time.

15 Q. During how many of the massages you gave Jeffrey Epstein
16 did he touch your breasts?

17 A. Every time.

18 Q. During how many of the massages you gave Jeffrey Epstein
19 did he touch your buttocks?

20 A. Every time.

21 Q. Where else, if anywhere, did Jeffrey Epstein touch you
22 during these massages?

23 A. He tried one time to use like a vibrating thing on me, and
24 I immediately told him I'm not comfortable with that.

25 Q. And did he stop?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Can you describe the vibrating thing that he tried to put
3 on your vagina?

4 A. It looked like what now I know -- it looked like --

5 Q. Like a penis?

6 A. Yes. Sorry.

7 Q. Did he actually touch that vibrator onto your vagina?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. How did every massage you ever gave Jeffrey Epstein end?

10 A. With him masturbating until he ejaculated.

11 Q. Were there ever massages you provided Jeffrey Epstein where
12 nothing sexual happened?

13 A. No. Something sexual happened every single time.

14 Q. During the massages when you brought friends, did sex acts
15 happen?

16 A. The same thing, he would turn over and masturbate.

17 Q. And where, if anywhere, did Jeffrey Epstein touch you and
18 your friends during those massages?

19 A. On our breasts and butt.

20 Q. Did Jeffrey ever bring anyone into the room?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Who did he bring into the room?

23 A. On two separate occasions, he had pushed the button on the
24 phone and a girl came in that was already fully nude.

25 Q. How many times did that happen?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Twice.

2 Q. I want to talk about those times.

3 Had you ever met them before?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Do you know their names?

6 A. I have no idea.

7 Q. Let's talk about the first one. What did she look like?

8 A. She was slender and she had blond -- long blond hair and
9 she had a really strong accent.

10 Q. What happened when this first female came into the massage
11 room with you and Jeffrey Epstein?

12 A. Jeffrey was having sex with her while she performed oral
13 sex on me.

14 Q. And turning to the second female, what did she look like?

15 A. She had darker brown hair.

16 Q. And what happened when she came into the room with you and
17 Jeffrey Epstein?

18 A. She came in nude and Jeffrey penetrated me a couple times
19 and I told him I wasn't comfortable. So he had sex with the
20 model and she performed oral sex on me.

21 Q. Just to be clear, did Jeffrey Epstein penetrate your vagina
22 with his penis?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And then when you said you weren't comfortable, did he
25 stop?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. What were you doing with the money that you made going to
3 Jeffrey Epstein's house?

4 A. Buying drugs.

5 Q. Was there ever a time, Carolyn, when you took a break from
6 going over to Jeffrey Epstein's house?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. About when was that?

9 A. When me and Sean ran away from Florida, we stole my mom's
10 car and went to Georgia.

11 Q. Do you remember how old you were when you and Sean went to
12 Georgia?

13 A. I was 16. I was 16, going to be 17.

14 Q. While you took that break from going over to Jeffrey
15 Epstein's house, what major life event, if any, happened?

16 A. I got pregnant.

17 Q. Did you have a baby?

18 A. I did.

19 Q. What month and year did you have a baby?

20 A. March 12th, 2004.

21 Q. What is the father of your son's first name, just his first
22 name?

23 A. Sean.

24 Q. After you had your son, your baby, did you ever go back to
25 Jeffrey Epstein's house?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Yes, I did.

2 Q. About how many times?

3 A. Well, I had gone there while I was pregnant --

4 Q. I'm asking about after you had the baby.

5 A. Okay. I had gone back there more than, like, four or five
6 times, and he asked me if I had any younger friends and I said
7 no. And that's when I realized I was too old.

8 Q. Why did you go back after you had your baby?

9 A. Because I needed the money because I was so young when I
10 had my son and I needed the money to buy stuff for him.

11 Q. Why did you stop going to Jeffrey Epstein's house?

12 A. Because I became too old.

13 Q. How old were you?

14 A. 18.

15 MS. COMEY: May I have a moment, your Honor?

16 THE COURT: Yes.

17 Q. Carolyn?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. After you stopped seeing Jeffrey Epstein, did you continue
20 using drugs?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What drugs did you use?

23 A. Cocaine and pain pills.

24 Q. Were you addicted to both of those drugs?

25 A. Yes.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Have you ever been arrested as a result of your drug use?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. In 2011, were you arrested for possessing cocaine?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. What happened that led to you getting arrested?

6 A. I handed the officer the drugs.

7 Q. Why did you do that?

8 A. Because I'm an idiot. I handed him the drugs because I was
9 hoping I wouldn't get arrested.

10 Q. Had you been pulled over in a car?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did you ultimately plead guilty to felony possession of
13 cocaine as a result?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What was your sentence?

16 A. I was on SOR.

17 Q. What's that?

18 A. Supervised own recognizance.

19 Q. In 2013, were you arrested for possessing stolen property?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What happened that led to that arrest?

22 A. Sean told me it was our son's Xbox.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection. Hearsay.

24 THE COURT: Sustained.

25 Q. Did you pawn an Xbox?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Yes, I did.

2 Q. Was it your Xbox?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Did you tell the pawnbroker it was your Xbox?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Did you ultimately plead guilty to felony possession of
7 stolen property as a result?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And did you plead guilty to felony false verification of
10 ownership to a pawnbroker?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What was your sentence?

13 A. I spent 52 days in jail.

14 Q. After serving that sentence, did you go to drug treatment?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And after serving that sentence, did you go to therapy?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What medications do you currently take?

19 A. I take methadone and Xanax and doxepine and Vyvanse.

20 Q. What is methadone for?

21 A. It's an opioid blocker so I can't take any pain pills
22 without being really sick.

23 Q. So is that to help you with your opioid addiction?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. What's the Xanax for?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. For all the anxiety I have of thinking my daughters are
2 going to be trafficked or stolen or kidnapped from me.

3 Q. And you mentioned two other types of medication. What were
4 those for?

5 A. My Vyvanse is to stay focused and my doxepine is for the
6 schizophrenia so I don't freak out if I -- because I am scared
7 that my kids are going to get kidnapped.

8 Q. But you mentioned schizophrenia. Do you have particular
9 symptoms?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. What symptoms?

12 A. I feel like people are out to get my children and traffic
13 them.

14 Q. And do you hear voices telling you that someone's going to
15 take your children away?

16 A. Sometimes.

17 Q. Can you tell the difference between those voices and
18 reality?

19 A. Absolutely.

20 Q. How is that?

21 A. Because I know that they're right there with me and I would
22 never let that happen.

23 Q. Do any of those medications affect your ability to remember
24 what has happened to you?

25 A. No.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Do any of them affect your ability to tell the difference
2 between the truth and a lie?

3 A. No.

4 Q. About how often do you speak to Sean now?

5 A. Never.

6 Q. When did you break up?

7 A. After the pawnshop thing.

8 Q. Since breaking up with Sean, have you had any conversations
9 with him about what happened with Jeffrey Epstein?

10 A. Nope.

11 Q. Have you had any conversations with Sean about your
12 testimony here today?

13 A. Absolutely not.

14 Q. In 2007, were you interviewed by the FBI about Jeffrey
15 Epstein?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. During that interview, did you tell the FBI that you
18 noticed an older lady with short black hair and an accent at
19 Epstein's residence the first time you went there with
20 Virginia?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Who was that?

23 A. Maxwell.

24 Q. During your interview with the FBI in 2007, did you mention
25 the other details of your interactions with Maxwell?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. No.

2 Q. Why not?

3 A. I wasn't asked about Maxwell.

4 Q. Who was the focus of that interview?

5 A. Jeffrey Epstein.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection, your Honor. Speculation.

7 THE COURT: Sustained.

8 Q. Who did the FBI ask you questions about in 2007?

9 A. Jeffrey Epstein.

10 Q. After you stopped seeing Jeffrey Epstein when you were
11 about 18 years old, how did you make money?

12 A. I worked for an escort service and was a stripper.

13 Q. When you worked for the escort service, did you have sex
14 with men for money?

15 A. Sometimes.

16 Q. In or about 2009, did you bring a lawsuit against Jeffrey
17 Epstein and Sarah Kellen?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Why did you sue Jeffrey Epstein?

20 A. Because of all the damage, emotional damage he did to me.

21 Q. Why did you sue Sarah?

22 A. Because she knew what was going on and she was -- she was
23 older than me, so she was an adult. She knew what was
24 happening.

25 Q. And what else did she do?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 A. Took pictures of me while I was nude.

2 Q. Without getting into the substance of any conversations,
3 who made the decision about who to sue in that lawsuit?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection, your Honor. 602 without any
5 further foundation.

6 THE COURT: Sustained.

7 Q. Carolyn, did you hire a lawyer in order to bring this
8 lawsuit?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Without telling me the substance, did you have
11 conversations with that lawyer about who to sue?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And ultimately, after those conversations, based on your
14 understanding, who decided who would be sued in this lawsuit?

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Objection, your Honor. Lack of
16 foundation.

17 THE COURT: Sustained.

18 THE WITNESS: Am I --

19 THE COURT: I sustained. It means don't answer. Jury
20 will disregard.

21 Q. In 2009, were you deposed as a part of that lawsuit?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. During that deposition, were you asked about your time
24 working for the escort service?

25 A. No.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 Q. Did you lie during your deposition, Carolyn?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. What did you lie about?

4 A. Being an escort and a stripper.

5 Q. What did you say during the deposition?

6 A. I didn't say anything about that.

7 Q. Did you say that you worked for the escort service but
8 didn't sleep with anyone?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Was that true?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Why did you lie about that?

13 A. I was embarrassed.

14 MS. COMEY: May I have a moment, your Honor?

15 THE COURT: Yes.

16 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

17 Ms. Drescher, could we please pull up, just for the
18 Court and the witness, 3505-403 at page 1.

19 BY MS. COMEY:

20 Q. Carolyn, what was the date of your deposition in the
21 lawsuit?

22 A. December 4th, 2009.

23 MS. COMEY: Can we now please turn in this document,
24 Ms. Drescher, to page 36. I want to go to deposition page 137,
25 lines 3 through 6.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 Your Honor, I would like to offer this and read it
2 into the record pursuant to 801(d)(1)(B).

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: Lines 3 through 6?

4 MS. COMEY: Yes, your Honor.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: I don't understand what this is being
6 offered for, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: You'll confer.

8 MS. COMEY: We've conferred, your Honor.

9 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Pagliuca, do you have an
10 objection?

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, your Honor --

12 THE COURT: Just objection or no.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes. Can we approach?

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 (Continued on next page)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 (At the sidebar)

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: This is apparently being offered as
3 purported prior consistent statement?

4 THE COURT: Right.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: The problem is, when read in context,
6 which really starts at line 20 on the page above and goes
7 through probably line 16 on the next page, we're simply just
8 parsing out two lines.

9 THE COURT: She can read the whole thing.

10 MS. COMEY: That's fine, your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Okay?

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

13 MS. COMEY: Starting at which line?

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd say 136, line 23.

15 MS. COMEY: That's an answer.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: So the question is going to be line 20.

17 MS. COMEY: Line 20 through line 6.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

19 (Continued on next page)
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 (In open court)

2 THE COURT: Okay, Ms. Comey.

3 MS. COMEY: Ms. Drescher, I would like to pull up the
4 page just a little earlier, page 136, line 20, and we're going
5 to go through page 137, line 6.

6 BY MS. COMEY:

7 Q. Carolyn, do you see that in front of you?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. My question is, were you asked the following questions and
10 did you give the following answers. I'm going to read this
11 aloud. Just listen and read along with me.

12 "Q. You would agree with me that you cannot recall the
13 specifics of each visit that you had at Mr. Epstein's home?

14 "A. I don't remember the times and dates, but I can tell you
15 everything that happened while I was there.

16 "Q. In your complaint in each count, you allege that you went
17 to Mr. Epstein's at his request?

18 "A. Uh-huh.

19 "Q. In fact, Mr. Epstein himself did not contact you on each
20 occasion and request you to come, did he?

21 "A. No, he would have Sarah or Maxwell call me."

22 Did you give that testimony in December 2009, Carolyn?

23 A. Yes.

24 MS. COMEY: I'd like to go now, please, to page 33 of
25 the same document.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 THE COURT: Page and line numbers, please.

2 MS. COMEY: We'll be doing deposition page 124, lines
3 8 through 20.

4 THE COURT: Just a moment. Mr. Pagliuca.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: That's fine, your Honor.

6 THE COURT: All right. Go ahead.

7 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

8 BY MS. COMEY:

9 Q. Starting with line 8 on page 124:

10 "Q. And for what reason were you placing calls to try to get
11 Mr. Epstein?

12 "A. To go over there to see him.

13 "Q. Were you seeking the opportunity to go over and massage
14 him and get paid?

15 "A. Yes.

16 "Q. And on these occasions that you called to see if you could
17 go over there and give him a massage, did you talk to him or
18 did you talk to others at his house?

19 "A. I talked to Sarah or Maxwell. I have also talked to -- I
20 don't know if it's the cook or somebody else that was there
21 that took phone messages."

22 Carolyn, did you give that testimony in December 2009?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Other than those two exchanges we just talked about, were
25 you asked any other questions about Maxwell during your 2009

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - direct

1 deposition?

2 A. No.

3 Q. How did your lawsuit against Jeffrey and Sarah end in 2009?

4 A. I received money.

5 Q. Did you settle the case?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Do you remember how much money you received?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Can you approximate for us?

10 A. Like \$250,000.

11 Q. Have you participated in a victim compensation fund for
12 victims of Jeffrey Epstein?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. What did you do to submit a claim to that fund for the
15 fund?

16 A. I -- I don't understand the question.

17 Q. Did you put in an application to the fund?

18 A. My attorneys did.

19 Q. Did you receive an award from the fund?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Do you know exactly how much the fund awarded you?

22 A. No.

23 Q. About how much do you remember it being?

24 A. Somewhere between \$1 million and \$3 million.

25 Q. Did that money come from the estate of Jeffrey Epstein?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Has that money already been wired to you?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Are you waiting on any other money from the fund?

5 A. No.

6 Q. As part of receiving that money, did you have to sign a
7 waiver agreeing not to sue any of Jeffrey Epstein's employees?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. To your understanding, can you sue Maxwell?

10 A. No.

11 Q. To your understanding, will the jury's verdict in this case
12 affect the award you received from that fund?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Do you have any financial stake in the outcome of this
15 case?

16 A. No.

17 MS. COMEY: May I have a moment, your Honor?

18 THE COURT: You may.

19 MS. COMEY: Nothing further.

20 THE COURT: We have about 15 minutes before lunch.

21 Mr. Pagliuca, you may begin your cross.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

23 THE COURT: Thank you.

24 CROSS-EXAMINATION

25 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. Good afternoon, Carolyn.

2 Carolyn, you had an acquaintance named Virginia
3 Roberts that was a friend of yours in 2002, approximately;
4 correct?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And you met her through your then boyfriend, Sean; is that
7 correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Sean was a friend of the man that Virginia Roberts was
10 living with, a fellow named Tony; is that correct?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And Tony and your boyfriend, Sean, were older than you;
13 correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. About four years older than you; is that right?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And Ms. Roberts and Tony had an apartment together; is that
18 right?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And you had been to their apartment; correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You and Sean and Virginia Roberts and Tony hung out at that
23 apartment and smoked marijuana, for example?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. Drank alcohol; correct?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 A. We didn't drink any alcohol.

2 Q. Did other drugs?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Now, as I understand it, you were at a party when Virginia
5 Roberts approached you first about making \$300; is that
6 correct?

7 A. Absolutely not.

8 Q. Do you remember speaking to the FBI in 2007?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And that was the first time that you talked to any law
11 enforcement about Mr. Epstein; correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And I'll direct --

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: May I approach the witness, your Honor?

15 THE COURT: You may.

16 Q. If you could turn to tab 5 in that binder that I just
17 handed you, the big one, which is 3505-005, page 1.

18 A. Sorry. In which binder?

19 Q. The big binder that I just gave you.

20 THE COURT: Ms. Comey, do you have it?

21 MS. COMEY: I do. Thank you, your Honor.

22 A. What number? I'm sorry.

23 Q. It's the first tab, it's got a 5 on it.

24 A. It's upside down. Hold on.

25 Q. The first page.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can display this electronically if
2 it's easier, your Honor.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. I want to direct your -- do you have the document?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Page 1, paragraph 2.

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. The fifth line down, do you see where it starts, "Virginia
9 approached Carolyn at a party and asked her if she would like
10 to make \$300." Do you see that?

11 A. No, I don't.

12 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may we approach? Actually,
13 may I confer with counsel?

14 THE COURT: You may confer.

15 Q. Carolyn, directing your attention to that paragraph, do you
16 see that?

17 A. Yeah, I see the paragraph.

18 Q. Where it says that, "Virginia approached Carolyn at a party
19 and asked her if she would like to make \$300." Do you see
20 that?

21 A. Yes, I see that.

22 Q. Is that what you told the FBI in 2007?

23 A. No.

24 Q. The FBI got it wrong?

25 A. We weren't at a party. We were at Virginia's house when

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 she approached me.

2 Q. Did Virginia explain to you that you could make \$300 by
3 providing a man in Palm Beach with a massage?

4 A. She told me that we were going to be meeting a friend of
5 hers in Palm Beach.

6 Q. And the friend you were meeting was older; is that correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Now, when Roberts approached you about making this \$500,
9 Ms. Maxwell, Ghislaine Maxwell was not there; correct?

10 A. There was no \$500.

11 Q. \$300. Ms. Maxwell was not there; correct?

12 A. No, it was me and Virginia.

13 Q. And Ms. Maxwell was not involved in this conversation that
14 you had with Ms. Roberts about making this \$300; correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. During your conversation with Ms. Roberts, she told you
17 that you could make this \$300 by massaging this older man; is
18 that right?

19 A. No. She said we were going to meet one of her friends
20 and -- I'm sorry. Repeat the question.

21 Q. She told you that you could make money by massaging an
22 older man; is that correct?

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, can we just classify if
24 Mr. Pagliuca is asking her about a document or her memory as
25 she sits here today.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Sure. You're asking about her memory?

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

3 THE COURT: Start with that question.

4 THE WITNESS: Why do I have the binder?

5 THE COURT: You can close the binder.

6 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

7 Q. Ms. Roberts told you that you could make money by massaging
8 an older man; is that correct?

9 A. No.

10 Q. If you could go back to that same exhibit, 005 at page 1,
11 paragraph 2.

12 A. Go ahead.

13 Q. The last line, isn't it true that you told the FBI,
14 "Virginia explained that Carolyn could make \$300 by providing a
15 man in Palm Beach with a massage." Isn't it true, you told
16 them at that time?

17 A. What paragraph are you on?

18 Q. Paragraph 2, the last sentence.

19 A. She didn't tell me anything about a massage at that time.

20 Q. So you're saying you didn't tell that to the FBI in 2007
21 when they interviewed you?

22 A. She told me that when we got to Mr. Epstein's house.

23 Q. Carolyn, I'm just asking you a very simple question, are
24 you denying telling the FBI, in August of 2007, that Virginia
25 explained that Carolyn could make \$300 by providing a man in

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 Palm Beach with a massage?

2 A. Yes, she told me that.

3 Q. And that's what you told the FBI?

4 A. Yes, I told the FBI that.

5 Q. It's also true that Ms. Roberts told you that you could
6 make a lot of money real fast; correct?

7 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, are we talking about a
8 document or her memory?

9 THE COURT: Can you clarify the timeframe of your
10 question, both as to whether you're asking about her current
11 memory, and if so, what time you're asking her to recall.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm asking about current memory, unless
13 I refer the witness to the document, your Honor.

14 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, it might be helpful to have
15 the witness set the document aside.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: That's fine.

17 THE COURT: Close the binder, please.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: Might be easier if we use the screen.

19 THE COURT: Do that.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: That's fine.

21 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

22 Q. Carolyn, Ms. Roberts told you, you recall, this first time
23 that you could make a lot of money real fast; isn't that true?

24 A. No.

25 Q. If we can show the witness 005, page 1, third paragraph,

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 first sentence, please.

2 A. Yes, I did say that.

3 Q. It's also true, Carolyn, that Ms. Roberts instructed you to
4 dress sexy; is that correct?

5 A. Ms. Roberts dressed me sexy to be able to go.

6 Q. Isn't it also true that Ms. Roberts instructed you that if
7 you didn't like something, to let her know; correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. She also told you, before you went over to Mr. Epstein's,
10 that you might have to remove your shirt and pants, but could
11 keep your underwear on; is that correct?

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can take this down while we're
13 asking questions.

14 A. She had -- she asked me if I wanted to go with her to meet
15 a friend of hers who lived on Palm Beach and I would have to
16 dress provocatively. so she dressed me and said that we could
17 make money. So she drove me there and when we got there is
18 when she told me that she would massage Mr. Epstein with me so
19 I would not feel uncomfortable.

20 Q. Okay. My question is, before you went over there,
21 Ms. Roberts told you that you might have to remove your shirt
22 and pants, but you could keep your underwear on. Is that true
23 or not?

24 A. She told me that when we were in the massage room.

25 Q. Before you went over there, isn't it also true that

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 Ms. Roberts told you to say that you were 17 or 18?

2 A. That is not true.

3 Q. That's not true; is that your testimony?

4 A. She said if somebody asked, I needed to say that.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness the same
6 document at paragraph 4.

7 Q. Do you see on the last two lines there, "Carolyn was
8 previously instructed by Virginia to tell Epstein she was 17."
9 Do you see that?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. Is that what you told the FBI in August of 2007?

12 A. Yes, because I slipped up and told Mr. Epstein that I was
13 14.

14 Q. I'm not asking you what you told Mr. Epstein, I'm asking
15 you first, that's what Ms. Roberts told you and, at first, you
16 said no, and now you're saying yes?

17 A. She told me if anybody asked, I needed to say I was 17.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can take that down.

19 Q. Do you remember Ms. Roberts saying that he, Epstein, was a
20 friend of hers, we can go there, you can give him a massage,
21 and he will pay. Do you remember that?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Now, I want to talk about the timeframe that you've
24 testified about. Isn't it true that the date you first went to
25 Epstein's house at the invitation of Roberts was in May or June

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 of 2002?

2 A. I don't recall.

3 Q. Ms. Comey showed you your deposition testimony from
4 December 2009. Do you recall that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And that was in connection with your civil lawsuit against
7 Jeffrey Epstein and Sarah Kellen; correct?

8 A. I don't remember.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Let's show the witness 3505-043 at page
10 33 at deposition page 125, lines 23 through 24 through 126,
11 line 2.

12 Q. Do you have that? Isn't it true that, under oath in August
13 of 2009, you were asked the question:

14 "Q. All right. So for purposes --

15 THE COURT: I'm sorry. It's small again.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Can we enlarge that, please.

17 THE COURT: Can we get the page and line numbers that
18 you intend to read.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: Certainly, your Honor. So we'll start
20 at the bottom, which is page 33, deposition page 125, lines 23
21 through 25 on that page, over to page 126, line 1, and we'll
22 continue down to line 10, your Honor.

23 THE COURT: Okay.

24 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

25 Q. Isn't it true, Carolyn, that, under oath, you were asked

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 the question:

2 "Q. All right. So for purposes of this case, the total period
3 of time that you had any interaction with Mr. Epstein was
4 between May of '02 and August of '03.

5 "A. Uh-huh."

6 Q. Do you see that?

7 A. I see the ending of that, yes.

8 Q. And then if we go to page 126, lines 1 through 10 is the
9 next page --

10 THE COURT: Could you pull up the mic, Mr. Pagliuca.

11 A. We're on page 126.

12 Q. Okay. And then there is another question:

13 "Q. That is another way of saying it is the first time you
14 went, is May of '02, and the last time was August of '03?

15 "A. Yeah."

16 Do you see that?

17 A. Yes, I do.

18 Q. And that was your testimony under oath?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. In 2009; correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And then you were then asked the question:

23 "Q. Didn't know Mr. Epstein at all prior to May of '02 and had
24 no contact with him after August of '03?

25 "A. Correct."

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 Is that right?

2 A. Yes, that's right.

3 Q. So that was your deposition testimony under oath in 2009;
4 is that right?

5 A. Yes, that's right.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can take that down.

7 Q. You recall that Virginia Roberts was 18 when you first met
8 her; is that correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And you don't recall the exact date, but sometime in May or
11 June of '02 after this conversation is when you went to
12 Mr. Epstein's house; correct?

13 A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the question.

14 Q. Yes. You don't recall the exact date, but sometime after
15 you had this conversation with Virginia Roberts in May or June
16 of '02 is when you went to Mr. Epstein's house; correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And you had never been to the house before; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. You never met Mr. Epstein before; correct?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. You didn't even know the name of the person that you were
23 going to meet; correct?

24 A. She told me when we got there.

25 Q. Before you got there, you didn't even know the name of the

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 person that you were going to meet; correct?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. And it is Roberts who arranged this meeting with

4 Mr. Epstein; correct?

5 A. I suppose.

6 Q. Well, it was just you and her that went; correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And she drove; correct?

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. And she had a white car. Do you recall that?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. She picked you up at your house; right?

13 A. Nope.

14 Q. How did you get there?

15 A. We were at her house for the first time, not a party, and
16 it was only me, Sean, Tony, and Virginia, and she dressed me
17 provocatively and that's when we went to Mr. Epstein's home.

18 Q. Okay. She knew where to go; right?

19 A. Yes, she did.

20 Q. And she drove the two of you there; is that right?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And it took about 30 minutes or so to get there; is that
23 fair?

24 A. I have no idea, sir.

25 Q. She parked the car; right?

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Obviously.

2 Q. And then you and she walked to the front door; is that
3 correct?

4 A. No, we walked to the kitchen door.

5 Q. You walked to a door; right?

6 A. That led into the kitchen.

7 Q. Okay. You went inside; right?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Now, this is approximately 19 years ago is what we're
10 talking about here today; correct?

11 A. Give or take.

12 Q. And you had never been inside this house before; correct?

13 A. Didn't you already ask me that question?

14 Q. I don't think I did.

15 A. That was the first time I went, was with Virginia.

16 Q. And that's the first time you were inside; correct?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. You had never met anyone who worked there before; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. And you went inside and you were taken upstairs by Virginia
21 Roberts; correct?

22 A. Correct.

23 THE COURT: Mr. Pagliuca, we're going to break here
24 for lunch.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Members of the jury, you have your lunch.
2 We'll resume in about an hour. Thank you so much.

3 (Continued on next page)

4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 (Jury not present)

2 THE COURT: The witness may step down and break for
3 lunch.

4 (Witness excused)

5 Everyone may be seated. Okay, matters to take up
6 before the break?

7 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor. During the morning break,
8 we had an opportunity to speak with the witness identified as
9 Brian. I've provided a copy of the notes from that
10 conversation to defense counsel when we came back from the
11 break along with a text message that Brian provided us a copy
12 with. I'm happy to -- we haven't had a chance to stamp them
13 yet with 3500 numbers, but I'm happy to provide a copy to the
14 Court.

15 THE COURT: Okay.

16 MS. MOE: Besides that, is there a particular time
17 when the Court would like to take up that particular issue and
18 the other issue that we addressed at sidebar?

19 THE COURT: Let's discuss this now since that goes to
20 the defense's at least prior request was the exclusion of his
21 testimony. So I'll hear from you on that, if you're prepared
22 to be heard from that now or we break and then I hear from you.

23 MS. MOE: Your Honor, we'd be happy to take this up
24 after the break, perhaps in order to provide defense counsel an
25 opportunity to review those further and to confer on this

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 issue. I just wanted to alert the Court that we had run this
2 issue down and disclosed that matter and wanted to promptly
3 alert the Court about that.

4 THE COURT: So Ms. Menninger, the suggestion is we all
5 look at the copy of the notes, I think we resume in about 30
6 minutes to address the issue.

7 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor. I received it right
8 as testimony was beginning, so I have not studied them. If
9 your Honor would like to take an additional 10 minutes, I can
10 try to do some research, but if your Honor is just wanting to
11 address the content of the note --

12 THE COURT: My suggestion is we all look at the
13 contents of the notes, do some research, and resume in 30
14 minutes. How is that?

15 MS. MENNINGER: I will do my best, your Honor.

16 THE COURT: It's all we all can do.

17 Do you want to give a 3500 stamp or --

18 MS. MOE: Your Honor, I would suggest that we hand up
19 the printed copy now and, during the break, we can stamp it and
20 send an email copy to chambers.

21 THE COURT: That's fine.

22 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

23 THE COURT: So it's 12:55. We'll resume in 30 minutes
24 to discuss this. Assuming we're going forward with this
25 witness's testimony, we'll take up, at sidebar, the issue

LC7Cmax4

Carolyn - cross

1 regarding a question that the defense is interested in that
2 implicates some privacy issues. Correct?

3 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor. Yes.

4 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

5 THE COURT: We'll meet in 30. Thank you.

6 (Recess)

7 (Continued on next page)

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

A F T E R N O O N S E S S I O N

1:40 P.M.

THE COURT: All right. We'll take up the question of the communication between the brother of Jane and Jane.

MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, your Honor.

During the break, the government did find some cases. But we also learned toward the end of the break that there are a small number of additional text messages.

The government's view at this point is that it makes sense for us to fully run down and make sure we have identified the universe of text messages. And we're willing to not call Brian until tomorrow morning to give the parties an opportunity to understand all the facts and provide an analysis of the law.

And so my understanding from talking to Ms. Menninger is that the defense doesn't object to allowing us to brief this issue tonight and call Brian and address it tomorrow morning.

THE COURT: Okay.

MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor. As long as the factual record is still undeveloped, I don't think it makes sense to start applying the law to those facts. But I repeat my request that there be an actual under-oath representation by this witness about the communications rather than dribbling out information.

THE COURT: Well, I don't know if we'll need an under oath prior to his testimony. Certainly it can be fully

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 explored in your cross-examination, which is under oath. But I
2 do think in advance of that, we need a full understanding which
3 I think includes making sure you have every text and email
4 communication. I would think you need to have an interview
5 with Jane, as well, to see if you're getting the same
6 information from her. And I think you need to make sure that
7 there are no other conduits of information regarding Jane's
8 testimony to the brother.

9 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Okay. And I've started to look at the law
11 too. I think it's unlikely we're going to get to a breach of
12 the text of the rule. I think my hypo about if somebody passed
13 the transcript would certainly go to a violation of the spirit
14 of the rule and not the text. And there may be some further
15 version of full communication of her testimony, especially a
16 witness who's being put on solely to provide prior consistent
17 statements.

18 I don't think the government did anything wrong. I'm
19 a little shocked that this wasn't fully drilled into these
20 witnesses just as a matter of best practice. I understand from
21 the notes that it was communicated to the witnesses not to
22 speak to other witnesses, but somehow this witness didn't
23 understand that to mean his sister. But here we are.

24 MR. ROHRBACH: Your Honor, on that point, we would
25 just say that the notes from today reflect that the witness

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 recalls having been instructed by the government not to discuss
2 his testimony with his sister. Of course, it can be very
3 difficult not to talk about your life with your family.

4 THE COURT: Right. That would be the kind of thing, I
5 would think, best practices would say, Look, I know this is
6 difficult. This is important. I imagine that is a
7 conversation that many government lawyers have with witnesses.

8 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, your Honor. And my understanding
9 is that we did have that conversation.

10 THE COURT: Okay.

11 Then it may be a little hard to square that that
12 conversation was had with the statement that it was unclear
13 that this was a transgression. There's some mismatch there.

14 So you need to run a full investigation. We'll have
15 those facts produced to the defense by what time?

16 MR. ROHRBACH: We'll be working on it through the
17 afternoon today. We will do our best to have disclosed as much
18 as we know by the end of the court day. Understanding the
19 breadth of the investigation the Court wants, it may take
20 longer to complete all of --

21 THE COURT: Well, you should think about whether there
22 is anything else worth pursuing to make sure that the Court and
23 both sides have a full factual record.

24 MR. ROHRBACH: We will certainly give that thought.

25 THE COURT: And then, as I say, I think once we have

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 that, my quick look at the case law is that I'm very unlikely
2 to exclude, unless there was some knowing and full violation of
3 the sequestration spirit, if details of -- significant details
4 of Jane's testimony. But in the absence of that, I think what
5 we have is ripe grounds for cross-examination with an
6 opportunity for the defense to have at it.

7 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, your Honor.

8 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor I looked at some recent
9 case law, and I imagine your Honor has seen similar cases. But
10 one was Judge Engelmayer's decision in *Teman*. And there are
11 some significant reasons why this case is much different than
12 the decision he reached in that case, including the fact that
13 that was a conversation between the government and a witness
14 rather than -- he distinguished the other cases, which were a
15 witness speaking to another witness.

16 THE COURT: There was no order in place for witnesses
17 not to speak. It could have been requested, I suppose. It
18 wasn't requested. I didn't put one in place. I never have.
19 And the reason is because if witnesses speak to each other,
20 that's going to come out on cross, and boy is that going to
21 look bad for the witnesses.

22 So I think that's probably where we are. I have
23 looked at *Teman*. I looked at the rule. We'll keep looking at
24 cases once we have the full factual record.

25 But it seems to me we're likely to be at a point where

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 we have the factual record. There's no additional record that
2 would lead to exclusion, and so we'll do what we need to do. A
3 hearing, an order, only to prepare further for what's going to
4 happen is likely not necessarily. I don't see any law that
5 supports that. But we'll get the full factual record and
6 you'll brief it.

7 So I would like -- if this witness is going to testify
8 tomorrow, I think the government needs to provide the defense
9 the results of a full factual investigation by 6 p.m. And
10 then, Ms. Menninger, when would you like to brief the issue?

11 MS. MENNINGER: By 9 p.m., your Honor.

12 THE COURT: Okay. By 9 p.m.

13 And then let's say -- Mr. Rohrbach?

14 MR. ROHRBACH: I apologize. By 9 p.m. By midnight.
15 I know that's late for the Court. That would be three hours
16 for each side to write a brief.

17 THE COURT: Okay.

18 MR. ROHRBACH: Thank you, your Honor.

19 Just one other point on this witness, your Honor.

20 We understand that this witness is also a subject of a
21 defense subpoena. And so the government would just like to
22 know whether, in light of the defense's motion to preclude his
23 testimony for this reason, he's still under defense subpoena.

24 THE COURT: I suppose they might want to know the
25 result of that motion first.

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Right?

3 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes.

4 THE COURT: Okay. In other words, let's put it this
5 way: If I grant your motion, do you intend to call the
6 brother?

7 MS. MENNINGER: It seems highly unlikely, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 MS. MENNINGER: But, your Honor, two very quick
10 factual issues. One is you may recall that when we began at
11 the final pretrial conference on November 23rd, we specifically
12 requested permission to share Dr. Rocchio's testimony with our
13 two experts because we believed that this issue precluded
14 otherwise witnesses listening in or finding out about the
15 testimony of other witnesses, one.

16 The second point is --

17 THE COURT: And I said talk it out, confer, and then
18 brief me if you have disagreement. I received no briefing.

19 MS. MENNINGER: I think there was no objection to that
20 process, your Honor.

21 MR. ROHRBACH: There was no objection.

22 MS. MENNINGER: And then the second point is when Jane
23 was released from the stand and the government asked for
24 permission to speak with her about logistical matters, I said
25 at that time, So long as she's admonished that she's not to

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 speak to other witnesses; and they said, Of course. That was a
2 brief sidebar conversation that was had.

3 So just to the extent your Honor has brought up the
4 fact that there wasn't an order specifically saying witnesses
5 aren't to speak to one another, I certainly thought it was
6 implied in the course and conduct of what had occurred and the
7 sequestration order generally.

8 THE COURT: Okay. You'll brief it.

9 MR. ROHRBACH: Yes, we'll brief it, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 So I suppose that we can deal then in the afternoon or
12 tomorrow with the related sub question of an area that the
13 defense seeks to cross the witness on.

14 MS. MENNINGER: Yes, your Honor.

15 Ms. Moe and I spoke briefly. We assumed, I think, as
16 your Honor said, that the question of gatekeeping would
17 logically come first before dealing with a side issue if he
18 does testify. We didn't really have a chance over the break to
19 explore the facts of that further.

20 THE COURT: Okay. So you'll confer on that and we can
21 take it up. I suppose we could take it up in the morning.
22 There's going to be a lot to do in the morning. But I need to
23 hear from you on it before I resolve the question of whether
24 Brian will testify on the theory that I think it's likely that
25 he will testify.

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 MS. MENNINGER: Understood, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

3 Is there anything else we can address now?

4 MS. STERNHEIM: I can raise this now or --

5 THE COURT: Microphone please.

6 MS. STERNHEIM: I apologize.

7 THE COURT: That's okay.

8 MS. STERNHEIM: I could raise this now or we could
9 hold off, but the government has indicated that they may call
10 some witnesses out of order. That's not the issue.

11 But with regard to one of the witnesses that they may
12 call, I have some objection to the relevance of some of the
13 testimony. And I did not know if you wish to hear it now or
14 wait until such time as they actually intend to call.

15 THE COURT: Okay. So, let's see. We have the current
16 witness. How long do you anticipate for your cross,
17 Mr. Pagliuca?

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm going to guess an hour, hour and a
19 half, your Honor, something like that.

20 THE COURT: Okay.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Some of that may depend on some issues
22 that I think the government has opened the door on. And I
23 don't know if you want to talk about those now or later.

24 THE COURT: Well, I don't want the jury to be sitting
25 idly. So if it is going to happen in your cross, we should

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 talk about it now.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. I don't know if you want to deal
3 with Ms. Sternheim's issue first.

4 MS. STERNHEIM: Mine should go to the back of the bus
5 on this.

6 THE COURT: Okay.

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: So there was direct examination
8 testimony, your Honor, concerning psychiatric issues, ongoing
9 psychiatric issues, with this witness. I think there was some
10 minimization of the ongoing psychiatric issues. And the
11 records that I have reflect much more extensive psychiatric
12 issues.

13 I believe that I should be allowed to inquire about
14 her extensive psychiatric history. There were questions on
15 direct examination about her ongoing drug abuse, and I think
16 that opens -- and I think it was minimized. And I think that
17 that opens the door to my being able to examine on the full
18 extent of her ongoing drug abuse.

19 There was also testimony raised sort of in the vein
20 of, I'm schizophrenic and I am schizophrenic about my children
21 because they're important to me, essentially, and that's why I
22 have this schizophrenia and hear voices around my children.

23 This witness has a significant history of having her
24 children taken away from her and these children living with her
25 mother or other relatives. And I think that the way that the

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 government has framed this allows for inquiry about that. And
2 had the government not asked those questions, it was not my
3 intent to get into any of the child issues.

4 But I think the jury is left with the impression that
5 because of what Epstein did to her, she's now schizophrenic and
6 has all these schizophrenic concerns about her children, when,
7 for the last 19 years, these children have been repeatedly put
8 in different places as a result of her problems.

9 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think if Mr. Pagliuca is
10 going to go into detail, we should be having this at side bear
11 under seal, if we're going to be discussing the details of her
12 family.

13 THE COURT: Yes.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

15 THE COURT: The court reporter requested, so she can
16 sit, that we do it in the robing room.

17 (Pages 1590 to 1601 SEALED)

18 (Continued on next page)

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 (In open court)

2 THE COURT: We'll bring in the jury.

3 Can we have the witness come back please.

4 MS. POMERANTZ: I believe Ms. Comey just went to do
5 that, your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Thank you. Bring in the jury.

7 (Jury present)

8 THE COURT: Please take your seats. We're just
9 waiting for the witness to return.

10 Good afternoon, Carolyn. You may remove your mask.
11 And I remind you, you are under oath.

12 And Mr. Pagliuca, you may resume with your
13 cross-examination.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

15 THE WITNESS: One second. I walked upstairs.

16 THE COURT: Sorry about that. Take your time.

17 THE WITNESS: Okay.

18 CAROLYN, resumed.

19 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

20 Q. Are you ready?

21 A. Yup.

22 Q. Okay. Carolyn, when we broke for lunch --

23 THE COURT: Could you pull the mic up, Mr. Pagliuca?

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

25 THE COURT: Thank you.

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. -- we were talking about 2002, when you went to
2 Mr. Epstein's house with Virginia Roberts. And I think where
3 we stopped was you were -- you went into the house and you were
4 taken upstairs by Ms. Roberts. Do you recall that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Now, the only person that you saw when you entered the
7 house, you identified as being an older lady with unknown hair
8 and an unknown accent. Is that correct?

9 A. No. I said she had shoulder-length black hair with an
10 accent.

11 Q. Do you recall again giving a statement to the FBI in August
12 of 2007?

13 A. A what? A testimony?

14 Q. Do you recall being interviewed by the FBI in August of
15 2007, Special Agents Nesbitt and Kuyrkendall?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And they met with you at your house; is that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And they weren't there to be mean to you; they were trying
20 to ask you questions. Correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And they introduced themselves to you, right?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And you certainly had no reason to lie to them; correct?

25 A. Correct.

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. You told the FBI the truth at that meeting; correct?

2 A. Some of the things I didn't mention because I was
3 embarrassed.

4 Q. So let's talk about that.

5 Do you recall testifying at your deposition, this is
6 at 3505-043, page 27.

7 THE COURT: And give us the line numbers while that's
8 being brought up on the screen.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: It's actually 3505-043, 9, at
10 deposition page 37, lines 21 through 23.

11 THE COURT: I don't have anything on my screen yet.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-043, page 9, page 27, deposition,
13 lines 21 through 23, continuing on to the next page, which is
14 28, lines 1 and 2.

15 May I, your Honor?

16 THE COURT: Ms. Comey, any objection?

17 MS. COMEY: No, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Go ahead.

19 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

20 Q. Isn't it true, Carolyn, that you testified under oath in
21 2009 to the following:

22 "Q. Whether you were under oath or not, did you tell them the
23 truth at that meeting?

24 "A. Yeah.

25 "Q. Did you tell the FBI the truth when they came to your

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 house?

2 "A. Yes. I have absolute no -- absolutely no reason to lie
3 about this situation."

4 Do you recall that testimony under oath?

5 A. I do not remember if I was under oath or not, but I do
6 remember the question.

7 Q. Okay. And you testified in your deposition that you told
8 the FBI the truth in 2007; correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. So let's go back to what you told the FBI. And this
11 is at 3505-005, page 1, fourth paragraph, second sentence:

12 Carolyn noticed an older lady with short black hair
13 and an unknown accent at Epstein's residence. Isn't that what
14 you told the FBI when you told them the truth in 2007?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And they didn't cut you off when you were talking to them;
17 correct?

18 A. Well, that day was a bad day for me. So it was like -- I
19 was not expecting the FBI to come to my home.

20 Q. Okay. They didn't cut you off though, they weren't rude to
21 you; correct?

22 A. No, they weren't rude.

23 Q. Okay. And they gave you the opportunity to tell them
24 whatever you wanted to tell them; correct?

25 A. Yes.

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. Okay. What you told them, the only thing you told them is
2 that you saw an older lady with short black hair and an unknown
3 accent; correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Now, at that point in your life, you knew what a British
6 accent was; correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you didn't tell them a British accent, you said an
9 unknown accent; correct?

10 A. I didn't say an unknown accent, I said with an accent.

11 Q. Are you denying telling the FBI in 2007 that you said an
12 unknown accent?

13 A. The day that you're talking about --

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I'd ask that the Court --

15 A. -- talking about --

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd ask that the Court direct the
17 witness to answer the question please.

18 THE COURT: I will direct the witness to answer the
19 specific question and then you can explain.

20 Would you like --

21 THE WITNESS: Yeah, can I --

22 THE COURT: Repeat the question.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

24 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

25 Q. You told the FBI that it was an unknown accent; correct?

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Thank you.

3 Okay. You didn't say anything else about the person
4 that you claim you saw at Epstein's house, correct, other than
5 what is right here?

6 A. I guess, yeah.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. I'm looking -- I don't know what I'm looking at and where
9 you're reading from.

10 THE COURT: I think at this point you can close and
11 you can ask the question again just from her memory. Go ahead.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

13 Q. What you told the FBI in 2007 was that you saw an older
14 lady with short black hair and an unknown accent, and that's
15 all you told them at the time; correct?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Thank you.

18 Now, you went in and Ms. Roberts led you upstairs;
19 correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. She knew where to go; correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. She instructed you to rub Mr. Epstein's legs; correct?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And she rubbed his back; correct?

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yes, but when we -- can you back up for a second? Because
2 when we first --

3 THE COURT: Could you talk into the mic.

4 A. When we first walked in is when Maxwell introduced herself
5 to me.

6 Q. You didn't tell that to the FBI in 2007, did you?

7 A. No, I did not.

8 Q. Thank you.

9 So you went upstairs and Ms. Roberts directed you to
10 rub Epstein's legs while she rubbed his back; correct?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Then Epstein told you to take off your shirt and your
13 pants; correct?

14 A. Not at the first time, no.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness again
16 3505-005, page 1, fourth paragraph -- no, fifth paragraph,
17 middle of the paragraph.

18 Isn't it true that you told the FBI, Epstein stated to
19 Carolyn, take off your shirt and take off your pants?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Okay. And then you told the FBI, Virginia got naked and
22 Carolyn undressed to her bra and panties, right?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And it's after that that Virginia Roberts, who's 18 at this
25 time, has sex with Mr. Epstein in front of you; correct?

LC7VMAX5

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. And that's while you sat on a couch; correct?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And they were looking at you while you were sitting on a
5 couch; correct?

6 A. No, they were not looking at me.

7 Q. Okay. Epstein paid you \$300 directly to you; correct?

8 A. It was on the sink, but yes.

9 Q. It was from Mr. Epstein to you; correct?

10 A. I -- I don't know who it was from. It was just laying
11 there. Anybody could have put it there.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Again, if we can show the witness
13 3505-005, page 2, paragraph 1.

14 Q. The second to the last sentence: Epstein paid Carolyn \$300
15 at the end of the massage. Do you see that?

16 A. Yeah, I see that.

17 (Continued on next page)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. That's what you told the FBI in 2007; correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. You then left the house with Ms. Roberts after
4 Mr. Epstein paid you \$300; is that correct?

5 A. Yes, we left after.

6 Q. And then after you left, isn't it true that you got
7 Mr. Epstein's phone number from the phonebook?

8 A. No.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: We're going to show the witness,
10 please, 3505-005, page 2, third paragraph, first sentence.

11 Q. Isn't it true that you told the FBI, in 2007, "Carolyn
12 obtained Epstein's phone number from a telephone book." Do you
13 see that?

14 A. Yeah, the telephone book that you're talking about was my
15 personal book. It wasn't like a phonebook.

16 Q. Well, what you told the FBI --

17 A. It was a telephone book with my personal numbers of friends
18 and loved ones.

19 Q. And you called to schedule a massage session by leaving a
20 message with Sarah. Do you see that?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And then Epstein returned your call; correct?

23 A. It was not Epstein who called me.

24 Q. Well, isn't it true --

25 A. It was someone in Epstein's house that called me.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. Isn't it true that, in 2007, you told the FBI that Epstein
2 returned Carolyn's call?

3 A. I see that it says that, yes, but I don't -- at the time,
4 the way that it's worded is not that Jeffrey Epstein himself
5 called me.

6 Q. Well, there is not a different name, is there? It says
7 Epstein returned Carolyn's call?

8 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

9 A. No. Yes, that's what it says, but it wasn't Epstein
10 himself.

11 THE COURT: Sustained.

12 Q. Then there was a second visit that you had shortly after
13 you returning Mr. Epstein's call to schedule this second visit;
14 correct?

15 A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the question.

16 Q. Yes. You scheduled a second visit with Mr. Epstein after
17 he returned your call; correct?

18 A. I made an appointment to meet with Mr. Epstein again after
19 I got a phone call.

20 Q. And then your boyfriend, Sean, drove you; correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And Sean waited in the car; is that right?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And this second visit, first you sat in the kitchen and
25 talked to the chef; correct?

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 A. I don't recall if it was the second visit or a couple into
2 going there.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can show the witness 005, page 2,
4 paragraph 4, please.

5 Q. Isn't it true that, in 2007 --

6 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor. Isn't this
7 refreshing recollection at this point?

8 THE COURT: Yes. If you want to point her to the
9 paragraph and make it larger, that's fine.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. Fourth paragraph, please enlarge
11 that.

12 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

13 Q. Have you had a chance to look at the fourth paragraph?

14 A. I'm reading it right now, sir.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. Does reading that paragraph refresh your recollection that
18 you told the FBI that you sat in the kitchen and the chef asked
19 if you were hungry?

20 A. You might be wrong on the paragraph you had me read. It
21 mentioned nothing about a chef. It mentioned about me taking
22 off my panties to get \$400.

23 Q. We should be at 005, page 2, paragraph 4.

24 THE COURT: You mean the fourth full paragraph?

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Correct.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: That's not what was said.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm sorry. The fourth line down
3 beginning with "She."

4 THE COURT: That's not there.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-005, page 2.

6 THE WITNESS: You're wrong.

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm looking at a paper copy.

8 THE COURT: Why don't you look at your paralegal's
9 screen and make sure you're directing to the right paragraph,
10 please.

11 I think you mean the third full paragraph. Is that
12 what you're looking for?

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, the third full paragraph.

14 THE COURT: All right. We have that now.
15 Question?

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor. I was waiting for the
17 witness to finish.

18 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

19 Q. Carolyn, does that refresh your memory that that's what you
20 told the FBI in 2007, that you sat in the kitchen and the chef
21 asked if you were hungry?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Isn't it also true that on that second visit, Sarah was
24 there and led you upstairs?

25 A. I wasn't led upstairs by anybody.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. Sarah was there to greet you?

2 A. The second time I had gone to Epstein's residence, Maxwell
3 greeted me.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can direct the witness back to
5 the third paragraph, starting with the word "Sarah" after the
6 word "Hungry."

7 THE WITNESS: I see what you're saying.

8 Q. Does this refresh your recollection that, in 2007, you told
9 the FBI that Sarah was there and led her - meaning you -
10 upstairs?

11 A. A lot of it runs together because I had gone there so many
12 times. So I'm a little confused on the timing, because the
13 second time I went to his residence, I did not see Sarah.

14 Q. So isn't it true, though, that that's what you told the FBI
15 in 2007?

16 A. Obviously, because it's here.

17 Q. And you also told them, in 2007, that Sarah placed towels
18 on the massage table; correct?

19 A. Yes, that's what it states.

20 Q. And at this second time, there is no one else there that
21 you have told the FBI about, other than Sarah and Mr. Epstein;
22 correct?

23 A. Yes. Maxwell was not brought up.

24 Q. It's also true that Sarah was the person who would call you
25 from New York to schedule massages; correct?

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 A. It wasn't only Sarah, no.

2 Q. If you can look at the next paragraph, 005, page 2, second
3 paragraph from the bottom.

4 A. Question.

5 Q. Does this refresh your memory that Sarah would call you
6 from New York to schedule a massage appointment for Epstein?

7 A. On some occasions, yes.

8 Q. Ms. Maxwell's name does not appear in that paragraph;
9 correct?

10 A. We were not talking about Ms. Maxwell in 2007.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. So this has nothing to do with --

13 Q. Now, in this entire first discussion with the FBI in 2007,
14 it's true that you never said the name, Ghislaine Maxwell,
15 once; correct?

16 A. Yes, because it's not who we were talking about.

17 Q. So is it your testimony that the FBI limited your ability
18 to talk in some fashion?

19 A. She was not the subject of the discussion.

20 Q. You talked about Virginia Roberts, you talked about Sarah,
21 you talked about Sean, you talked about Epstein, you talked
22 about a cook, you talked about going there, and you never
23 mentioned Maxwell once; correct?

24 A. Correct, because she was not topic of what they were asking
25 me. It had nothing to do with her at the time. But, yes,

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 several occasions, she was there, but I was not asked about
2 her.

3 Q. You gave other information to the FBI about Sarah. Do you
4 recall that?

5 A. What kind -- what's the information?

6 Q. Do you recall telling the FBI that Sarah called you from
7 New York to tell you about the Incubus tickets?

8 A. I believe it was Epstein who called me about the Incubus
9 tickets.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can direct the witness to 005,
11 page 3, paragraph 5, the second to last sentence.

12 THE WITNESS: What about it?

13 Q. Does this refresh your memory that you told the FBI, in
14 2007, that Sarah called Carolyn to inform her that Epstein left
15 the concert tickets for her?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And it was Sarah who called you to tell you that Epstein
18 wanted to take photographs of you; correct?

19 A. What does that have to do with what I'm reading?

20 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think the document may still
21 be up for the witness.

22 THE COURT: Okay. Shut the document.

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would ask that, at the end
24 of each question about a document, the document be brought
25 down.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 THE WITNESS: I'm getting confused.

2 THE COURT: Then do that.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: We'll do that, your Honor.

4 May I re-ask the question, your Honor?

5 THE COURT: Yes.

6 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

7 Q. It was Sarah who called you to tell you --

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. -- that Epstein wanted to take photographs of you; correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And you left Florida in 2003 to go to Georgia; correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Now I want to talk about the lawsuit that you filed --

14 A. What does that have to do with me going to Georgia?

15 Q. I'm changing the question here. Okay?

16 You filed a lawsuit against Epstein and Sarah Kellen
17 in 2008; correct?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You had lawyers. One of your lawyers was a man named jack
20 Scarola; correct?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. Mr. Scarola is still your lawyer; correct?

23 A. I don't believe so.

24 Q. Mr. Scarola represented you in your claim with the Epstein
25 Victim Compensation Fund; correct?

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And you also had a lawyer in 2008 named Richard Willits.
3 Do you remember Mr. Willits?

4 A. Yes, I do.

5 Q. The lawsuits that were filed in 2008 were after your first
6 discussion with the FBI in 2007; correct?

7 A. I'm not sure.

8 Q. Well, you met with the FBI in 2007 and then there was a
9 lawsuit in 2008; right?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. And before the lawsuits were filed, you had lawyers; right?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. And you had meetings with lawyers about the lawsuits?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And based on those meetings, you filed not one, but two
16 civil complaints. Do you recall that?

17 A. I -- yeah.

18 Q. I want to talk about the second civil complaint first.

19 First, you read that complaint before it was filed.
20 Do you recall that?

21 A. I don't recall.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can direct the witness to
23 3505-043, page 41, deposition page 157, lines 18 through 25.
24 If we can blow that up for the witness and the Court, please.

25 THE COURT: Okay.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

2 Q. Do you recall testifying in your deposition, under oath?

3 A. Yes.

4 THE COURT: You can leave it up for reading the
5 question.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: Go ahead.

8 Q. You were asked:

9 "Q. Did you read the complaint before it was filed?

10 "A. Yeah, I read the complaint.

11 "Q. Did you -- when you read the complaint, did you notice
12 there was anything missing from it?

13 "A. No, I trust my attorneys. That's why they're my
14 attorneys."

15 Correct?

16 A. Right.

17 Q. And moving on to the next question on the same page:

18 "Q. Did you tell anyone, your lawyers or anybody --

19 THE COURT: Just a second.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: That question was objected to, your
21 Honor, so I'm not going to read it.

22 THE COURT: Okay.

23 Q. The complaint that you filed in federal court was not
24 against Ms. Maxwell; correct?

25 A. Correct.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. I'm sorry. I didn't hear the answer.

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. The complaint didn't mention Ms. Maxwell's name; correct?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. The complaint was 91 pages with 209 paragraphs. Do you
6 remember that?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And not one paragraph had the word "Maxwell" in it;
9 correct?

10 A. Correct.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: I would like to show the witness and
12 the Court first Exhibit C4. I provided the government a copy
13 of this exhibit.

14 THE WITNESS: Is it in the binder?

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: It's in the smaller binder. We can put
16 it on the screen, if that's easier.

17 THE WITNESS: What's the number?

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: C4.

19 THE WITNESS: Okay.

20 THE COURT: Question.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

22 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

23 Q. This complaint was filed by Mr. Willits on your behalf in
24 state court. Do you recall that? If you look at page 3,
25 Mr. Willits' signature is there.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 A. I might be in the wrong --

2 THE COURT: Could you pull up to the microphone,
3 please, Carolyn.

4 A. I might be in the wrong binder. Is it this one?

5 Q. It should have -- yes, I think that's the one, and it
6 should be at C --

7 THE COURT: Well, there is no C. I think you mean tab
8 4?

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, tab 4, which is going to be
10 Exhibit C4.

11 A. That has to do with me being arrested --

12 THE COURT: Just a moment. Just a moment. It's not
13 what I have in my binder.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Can we pull up C4 electronically,
15 please.

16 Q. [REDACTED], if you put that one down and we have the
17 exhibit on the screen in front of you.

18 A. Yes. It's also in the binder on the next page.

19 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, can we approach?

20 (Continued on next page)

21 (Pages 1622 to 1624 SEALED)

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 (In open court)

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: May I resume your Honor?

3 THE COURT: You may.

4 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

5 Q. Carolyn, we were talking about the exhibit that was up on
6 the screen which is the --

7 THE COURT: It's not up there. Go ahead.

8 Q. The complaint filed by Mr. Willits in state court regarding
9 Jeffrey Epstein and Sarah Kellen. Do you see that?

10 A. Yes, I do. Yes.

11 Q. And this was the complaint that was filed originally in
12 2008 on your behalf against those two individuals; correct?

13 A. Yes.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Did the witness say yes, your Honor?

15 THE COURT: Yes.

16 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

17 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm going to move for the admission of
18 C4, your Honor.

19 MS. COMEY: I'm going to object, your Honor. Not
20 inconsistent.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: I didn't hear the objection.

22 MS. COMEY: I would object, your Honor. It's not
23 inconsistent.

24 THE COURT: I'll sustain.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Can we have a sidebar, your Honor?

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: We'll take it at the break.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

3 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

4 Q. Carolyn, I'd like to ask you some questions about Exhibit
5 C5, if we can display that for the witness, please.

6 A. Go ahead.

7 Q. Thank you. Carolyn, I want to direct your attention first
8 to paragraph 21 of exhibit -- 11 of Exhibit C5.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. This was the complaint that you reviewed with your lawyers
11 and testified under oath that it was complete and accurate;
12 correct?

13 A. It wasn't accurate.

14 Q. That's what you testified to under oath; correct?

15 A. Yes, but they had it wrong.

16 Q. Paragraph 11 is a factual claim that you made against
17 Mr. Epstein in that complaint; correct?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Paragraph 11 does not contain the name "Maxwell," correct?

20 A. Correct.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I'm going to move for the
22 admission of paragraph 11.

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, same objection.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I can respond --

25 THE COURT: No, on this one, on paragraph 11, I will

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 overrule.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you.

3 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

4 Q. Paragraph 11 reads: "The plaintiff, Carolyn, was first
5 brought to the defendant, Jeffrey Epstein's mansion..."

6 THE COURT: You skipped a word.

7 Q. "...was the first brought to the defendant, Jeffrey
8 Epstein's mansion in late May or early June 2002 when she was
9 15 years old and in middle school."

10 A. Correct. I see that it says that, yes.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. But it's inaccurate.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd like to show the witness paragraph
14 21 of Exhibit C5.

15 THE WITNESS: Okay. Go ahead.

16 Q. Again, this is a factual statement made by your lawyers in
17 this complaint against Jeffrey Epstein and Sarah Kellen;
18 correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: I move for the admission of paragraph
21 21, your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Without objection, you may read it.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

24 Q. This paragraph reads: "In late May or early June of 2002,
25 Carolyn was first introduced to defendant, Jeffrey Epstein.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 Carolyn was brought to Jeffrey Epstein's residence by a female
2 friend of hers. Carolyn sat on the couch while the female
3 friend took off her own clothes, mounted Jeffrey Epstein, who
4 was wearing only a towel and lying on a table, and performed a
5 sexual act upon Jeffrey Epstein in the presence of Carolyn in
6 exchange for her participation as an observer of Jeffrey
7 Epstein's lewd and insidious conduct. Carolyn was paid \$300 by
8 Jeffrey Epstein."

9 Correct?

10 A. That's what it states.

11 Q. Paragraph 27 is another factual paragraph filed by your
12 lawyers in federal court in this lawsuit; correct?

13 A. Sorry?

14 Q. Paragraph 27, could you look at that, please.

15 A. Okay. It's true.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: I move for the admission of paragraph
17 27, your Honor.

18 MS. COMEY: No objection.

19 THE COURT: Without objection, you may read 27.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

21 Q. Paragraph 27 says: "Approximately one week after the first
22 incident, Carolyn received a telephone call from Jeffrey
23 Epstein requesting that she return to his residence. On this
24 occasion, Jeffrey Epstein directed Carolyn to undress to her
25 brassier and underwear and to provide him with a massage. At

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 the conclusion of the massage, Jeffrey Epstein masturbated
2 himself in Carolyn's presence. Jeffrey Epstein paid Carolyn
3 \$300 for this encounter."

4 True?

5 A. True. But what does this have to do --

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd like to direct the witness's
7 attention to paragraph 33. And this will be the last
8 exemplary, your Honor --

9 THE COURT: Just ask the question.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

11 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

12 Q. Do you see paragraph 33?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And that's another factual paragraph in the complaint
15 against Mr. Epstein, filed in federal court in 2009; correct?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And again, that's true?

18 A. Yes.

19 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would object. It's not
20 inconsistent.

21 THE COURT: Sustained.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, may I respond?

23 THE COURT: I'm sustaining. Move on. We'll deal with
24 it at the break.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay. I'm going to move for the

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 admission of paragraph 33, your Honor.

2 MS. COMEY: Same objection.

3 THE COURT: Sustained. We'll take it up at the break.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

5 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

6 Q. Carolyn, this complaint repeats these same paragraphs
7 against Mr. Epstein two times per month up to August 2003. Do
8 you recall that?

9 A. I do not recall.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd like to show the witness paragraph
11 206.

12 THE WITNESS: Okay.

13 Q. Paragraph 206 is a factual complaint against Sarah Kellen.
14 Do you see that?

15 A. Yes, I do.

16 Q. And again, that was reviewed by you prior to it being filed
17 in federal court by your lawyers; correct?

18 A. Um, what was the question, if it was correct?

19 Q. You reviewed this prior to it being filed in federal court
20 by your lawyers, correct, and approved it?

21 A. I did not.

22 Q. Do you recall me asking you questions about your testimony
23 under oath earlier?

24 A. I do.

25 Q. And you agreed that you gave that testimony under oath in

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 2009; correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Are you disagreeing with that now?

4 A. Yes.

5 THE COURT: I think the witness is looking at the
6 paragraph. So clarify the question.

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

8 Q. Isn't this paragraph 206 of the complaint that you agreed
9 you reviewed and agreed with; correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. This paragraph does not contain the name Ghislaine Maxwell;
12 correct?

13 A. Correct.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: I move for the admission of paragraph
15 206, your Honor.

16 MS. COMEY: Same objection, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Sustained.

18 Q. Paragraph 207, again, this paragraph deals with Sarah
19 Kellen; correct?

20 A. I don't believe that it was to engage me in prostitution,
21 no.

22 Q. My question is, is this a paragraph of the complaint that
23 was approved --

24 A. Yes.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Move for the admission of paragraph

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 207, your Honor.

2 MS. COMEY: Same objection, your Honor.

3 THE COURT: I'll take it at the break.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, there are a number of these
5 that I will address with the Court at the break if that's all
6 right.

7 THE COURT: Okay.

8 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

9 Q. Do you remember, Carolyn, talking to Dr. Hall in connection
10 with this lawsuit?

11 A. Who? I'm sorry. Repeat the question.

12 Q. Do you remember talking to --

13 THE COURT: I'm sorry. Stop. You can close the
14 binder, Carolyn. Thank you.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: May I, your Honor?

16 THE COURT: You may.

17 Q. Do you remember talking to Dr. Richard Hall for about six
18 and a half hours in connection with this lawsuit at your
19 lawyer's office on October 21st, 2009?

20 A. I don't have any recollection of that.

21 Q. You have no recollection of meeting with Dr. Hall for six
22 and a half hours on October 21st, 2009?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Do you recall telling Dr. Hall that you started seeing
25 Epstein in 2002?

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. Yes, you do?

3 A. Yes, I do.

4 Q. There were also, in connection with this lawsuit, what are
5 called interrogatories that you answered under oath. Do you
6 recall that?

7 A. That what?

8 Q. There were documents called interrogatories --

9 A. I don't know what that -- what those are.

10 Q. They were questions sent by lawyers --

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. -- to your lawyer for you to answer under oath. Do you
13 recall that?

14 A. I didn't -- I don't -- don't know anything about that.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness 3505-043,
16 page 5, deposition page 12, lines 23 through 25.

17 Q. Have you had an opportunity to review that, Carolyn?

18 THE COURT: It just came up.

19 A. Yeah. Review -- which numbers am I?

20 Q. Sure.

21 A. The whole thing?

22 Q. You should be looking at page 12, lines 19 through 25.

23 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, is the question whether this
24 refreshes recollection?

25 THE COURT: I think that is the question.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 THE WITNESS: I am confused.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: It is.

3 THE WITNESS: Very confused right now.

4 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

5 Q. Well, reviewing those questions and answers, does that
6 refresh your recollection --

7 A. You want me to read from 8 and 9 to 20 and 20-what?

8 Q. Deposition page 12, on that page.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. Lines 18 through 25.

11 A. 18 through 25. Like I said, I'm so confused.

12 Okay. I read it.

13 Q. Does that refresh your recollection that you were shown
14 your answers to interrogatories, Mr. Scarola directed you to
15 them, and that you said to Mr. Scarola, this is what me and you
16 did, right, then it should be correct, unless somebody messed
17 with it?

18 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor. I didn't think
19 that was what -- the witness said she didn't recall.

20 THE COURT: Sustained.

21 Q. Isn't it true that's what you said under oath in 2009?

22 MS. COMEY: A same objection.

23 THE COURT: Sustained.

24 Q. I'd like to show you, Carolyn, the answers to
25 interrogatories that you authored and swore to under oath in

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 connection with this lawsuit. Okay?

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness C8, please.
3 It might be easier to look at C8 in the binder.

4 THE COURT: Last time it wasn't the right exhibit.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can do it on the screen.

6 THE WITNESS: Okay. That's correct.

7 THE COURT: Go ahead.

8 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

9 Q. Do you have C8? And if you flip to the last page, 19 of 20
10 on C8. Do you see that's the first part of your --

11 A. I do.

12 Q. And you signed that under oath; correct?

13 A. Yes, I believe so. That is -- that's my signature, my
14 first name, yes.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I move for the admission of
16 C8.

17 MS. COMEY: Same objection, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: We'll take it up at the break.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm going to have the same request,
20 your Honor, as to C9, which we'll take up at the break, I
21 assume?

22 THE COURT: Yes.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: Would you like to take the break now?

24 THE COURT: Do you have other matters?

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor, I have further cross

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 examination of this witness.

2 THE COURT: We'll break. Members of the jury, for the
3 afternoon break, we'll see you in about 15 minutes.

4 (Continued on next page)

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 (Jury not present)

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, should I sit or stand?

3 THE COURT: I don't mind. I just want to hear you.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: C4 was the state complaint, your Honor.

5 And I'm not sure what the objection was.

6 MS. COMEY: The objection was that it is not
7 inconsistent with the witness's testimony, your Honor. I
8 believe your Honor sustained that objection.

9 THE COURT: That's what I'm hearing you on now.

10 Mr. Pagliuca, you're seeking the admission of the
11 whole document?

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: I am, your Honor. Alternatively, the
13 factual paragraphs. This does not have a lot of legalese in
14 it. It didn't seem to be too complicated to me.

15 THE COURT: Okay. So let's pick up the first factual
16 paragraph.

17 So just by way of background, you inquired about this
18 document and asked if Ms. Maxwell is mentioned anywhere in the
19 complaint; correct?

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

21 THE COURT: And the answer to that was no?

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: Correct.

23 THE COURT: So what I think we then need is to take
24 individual statements to determine if there is some
25 inconsistency with the testimony. So point me to the first

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 factual inconsistency.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, your Honor, there are two
3 principals at play here.

4 The first is this is what is commonly referred to as
5 impeachment by omission, which is a subset of impeachment by
6 contradiction. Impeachment by omission typically occurs where
7 there is a document or a statement where the witness would
8 likely include whatever is omitted, and this is such a
9 document, and I am seeking to impeach by omission through this
10 document. This is a complaint against two people that this
11 witness claims sexually abused her. It's not only against
12 Epstein, it's against one of Epstein's employees who is
13 highlighted in this complaint. The entire testimony by the
14 government here through this witness has downplayed the role of
15 Sarah Kellen and up-played the role of Ghislaine Maxwell, and
16 it is an impeachment by omission that, in 2008, shortly after
17 being interviewed by the FBI about the same subject matter with
18 counsel, there is no mention of Maxwell in this entire
19 complaint. I think that is significant under the facts of this
20 case. So, I think it is admissible under that theory and there
21 is ample federal law, First Circuit, this circuit, that
22 supports that theory of impeachment by omission. And these
23 factual paragraphs, I believe, are also impeaching of the
24 witness's testimony because it is inconsistent with the things
25 that she has claimed happened to her in addition to these

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 things that are in the complaint.

2 THE COURT: So that's a long way of getting to my --
3 responding to my first question.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

5 THE COURT: What paragraph is inconsistent?

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, the fact that Ms. Maxwell --

7 THE COURT: Point me to a paragraph.

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: All of the paragraphs, your Honor.

9 THE COURT: On the same theory you just pronounced?

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

11 THE COURT: So then on your second theory, can you
12 point to any inconsistency?

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, these are all omissions, your
14 Honor, factual. So paragraph 8, for example, the witness has
15 testified now that she was the subject of penetration and
16 intercourse by Epstein. Paragraph 8 does not include that.

17 Paragraph 9, I think, is an expansion. We have only
18 Kellen, often calling -- excuse me. 11A is what I'm looking
19 at.

20 THE COURT: So other than the omission theory, is
21 there an inconsistency you're pointing to?

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: No.

23 THE COURT: Is there any other? I understand your
24 omission theory, I'll hear from Ms. Comey on that in a second,
25 I do have a question for you on it, and I need to read the

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 whole thing.

2 Let me just ask. If there were, for example, a
3 paragraph that said these are some of the facts of what
4 occurred, but not all of them, would your omission theory work
5 to get everything in?

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

7 THE COURT: If there is a few discrepancies?

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

9 THE COURT: Do you have a case for that proposition?
10 I mean, it's really a factual question whether there is a
11 reasonable inference available from which the jury could
12 conclude that there is an inconsistency by testifying to one
13 thing to inclusion of facts now that were not included
14 previously.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think that's true and it's under the
16 circumstances -- I mean the case law, I can -- I need to pull
17 up my computer to give you the cite here, your Honor, but I'll
18 do that now.

19 THE COURT: Okay. Go ahead, Ms. Comey.

20 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor. I think the theory
21 of omission only works where one would expect that the specific
22 facts that are omitted would be included in the particular
23 statement. This is a lawsuit brought against two defendants
24 and it is containing the core allegations against those two
25 defendants. One would not expect that to include allegations

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 against third parties. I think that's borne out by the
2 substance of the document. Count One only talks about Jeffrey
3 Epstein, the first defendant. Count Two only talks about Sarah
4 Kellen, the second defendant. I think that that makes sense
5 and it wouldn't be expected that Ghislaine Maxwell or anyone
6 else would be included in allegations in a complaint against
7 those two.

8 More broadly, I think defense counsel has already
9 gotten the point that he wants to make across to the jury. He
10 has made very, very clear, repeatedly, that this witness sued
11 Jeffrey Epstein and Sarah Kellen and not Ghislaine Maxwell.
12 They have now heard that she has filed multiple court documents
13 that are lengthy in which the defendant's name is not
14 mentioned. So he has everything he needs to make his
15 impeachment point. At this point, it's cumulative and risks
16 403 prejudice and confusion of the issues, and a sideshow about
17 a 2009 lawsuit to put in the document itself. He has
18 everything he needs.

19 THE COURT: I think that he has everything he needs
20 goes to the relevance of the contention that the exclusion is
21 there.

22 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think that the point is that
23 she wasn't included as a defendant. I don't think that it
24 would be expected, especially in a document --

25 THE COURT: I think it's a redirect point, frankly,

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 counsel. And on a 401, 403, it is already in, it's a document.
2 So it's really a cumulative argument. The point that you want
3 to make, I presume you'll make on redirect. Since the point
4 has already been made, I don't see that there is tremendous
5 prejudice in including the document itself.

6 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, my concern would be that these
7 are crafted by lawyers in order to satisfy the elements of
8 particular causes of action.

9 THE COURT: Right.

10 MS. COMEY: It will confuse the issues and it's not
11 written in a narrative form and it wasn't offered by this
12 witness, and I think it would confuse the issues to start
13 putting these words in that her attorneys wrote. She did not
14 write this.

15 THE COURT: I think those are fine redirect points.
16 We've already established the 401 of the omission, I don't
17 think it causes substantial 403 prejudice, and you're going to
18 make those redirect points in any event. So at least with
19 respect to this document C4, I'm going to overrule the
20 objection.

21 C5, I think might be in a different position. I mean,
22 206 says, expressly, Kellen is one of defendant Epstein's
23 employees, assistants referenced in paragraph 12. Epstein,
24 Kellen, and others reached an agreement between themselves for
25 the purposes of allowing defendant Epstein to commit the

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 illegal acts. And then if you turn back to 12, 12 says,
2 Epstein's a wealthy financier with a lavish home, wealth, a
3 network of assistants and employees used his resource and
4 influence over a vulnerable minor child to engage in a
5 systematic pattern of sexually exploited behavior.

6 I mean, on its terms, it references additional people.
7 And so, on its face, it's not exclusive and I think that puts
8 it in a different position.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, with regard to this
10 exhibit, I was simply offering discrete factual paragraphs.

11 THE COURT: Right. But 206 -- so 206 was the one that
12 we began with. I don't think that paragraph is factually
13 inconsistent with the testimony for precisely the reason I've
14 just indicated.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think we left off with 206.

16 THE COURT: So what's the next paragraph?

17 MR. PAGLIUCA: I mean, I can go through it and tell
18 you all the paragraphs that I'm intending to introduce or
19 ask --

20 THE COURT: So 206 is not inconsistent. Therefore,
21 the objection is sustained.

22 What's the next paragraph?

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, let me look at 206 and hopefully
24 respond to that.

25 THE COURT: That's fine.

LC7Cmax6

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm fine with not admitting that, your
2 Honor. I think that's right.

3 THE COURT: They might want to get that one in.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: I agree with you.

5 THE COURT: What's next?

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, I guess the question -- I'm not
7 sure where we left off, your Honor, because I think we got to
8 about 33, and then we were going to take it up at sidebar.

9 (Continued on next page)

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Okay. Should I look at 33?

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, 33. The first inconsistency with
3 the direct testimony is the date, July of 2002.

4 THE COURT: I don't know -- so again, return to --
5 what's the inconsistency?

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, the indictment says 2001. In her
7 direct testimony she said 2001, and on the cross-examination,
8 she admitted to 2002.

9 THE COURT: So you have to use a full sentence so I
10 can track you. She said the first incident was in 2001.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes.

12 THE COURT: She then talked about 100 additional
13 incidents --

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Right.

15 THE COURT: -- over the course of at least a couple of
16 years. So what's inconsistent in July of 2002, she again
17 returned to?

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: This is chronological through this
19 complaint. This complaint goes from -- 2002 is the beginning
20 spot, and goes through 2003. So the entirety of the allegation
21 is that these events occurred between 2002 and 2003, not 2001
22 and 2004. And so this is impeachment on the time frame that is
23 alleged in the indictment and testified to by the witness on
24 direct examination.

25 THE COURT: Is there a paragraph that talks about the

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 first couple of incidents, which I think would be, as you're
2 suggesting, time frame inconsistent.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think you admitted those already,
4 your Honor.

5 THE COURT: See? I'm consistent.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: You are. Yes, you are. Yes, you are.
7 The Court admitted paragraph 21, I think, as the -- 21
8 and 27.

9 THE COURT: Okay.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: And where we started getting --

11 THE COURT: 21 and 27. 27 is called incident two.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Right.

13 THE COURT: And then 33, I'm not saying an
14 inconsistency. I'll sustain there.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: 39 --

16 THE COURT: And to the extent it is, because it could
17 somehow be read as part of a time frame that's off, it's
18 consistent with her -- it falls within the time frame she
19 testified to; it's not specific as to which incident this is.
20 To the extent there's 401 relevance, it's cumulative of the
21 point that you've already gotten in, which is that this -- that
22 the first incident described in this complaint took place in
23 2002, and her testimony is that it took place in 2001.

24 Next.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: But also to that point, your Honor,

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 this is inconsistent because we're not -- we're not talking
2 about 2001, we're talking about 2002.

3 THE COURT: Right. But it doesn't specify -- she
4 testified to incidents like these in 2002, and so it's just
5 not -- tell me how it's inconsistent with that testimony.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, you know, for the second time in
7 July of 2002 --

8 THE COURT: No, it doesn't say that.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Paragraph 39 is what I'm looking at.

10 THE COURT: Oh, you told me 33. I am a lot of things,
11 but I am not a mind reader. I sustained on 33.

12 I will go to 39. Go ahead.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: So for the second time in July of 2002.
14 This is --

15 THE COURT: I mean, that reads like more than one
16 incident in July of 2002.

17 MR. PAGLIUCA: The second, not a third, not a fourth.

18 THE COURT: For the second time. Okay.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: And when we get through all of this,
20 the other inconsistency that tracks all of these is there is no
21 allegation of sexual intrusion or penetration. Every single
22 one of these allegations is fondling of breasts and buttocks,
23 every single one. And so we have new testimony about the acts
24 that were allegedly performed.

25 THE COURT: All right. Ms. Comey, do you want to

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 respond to that for paragraph 39?

2 MS. COMEY: So for 39, your Honor, first with respect
3 to the time frame, I think the first clause is for the second
4 time in that month of that year. That's not inconsistent with
5 what the witness testified to. She testified she was going
6 frequently, certainly at least twice a month, through 2002. So
7 that's not inconsistent.

8 With respect to the sex acts, I think here is part of
9 the issue with taking a legal document and trying to suggest
10 that the witness should have included every single detail in
11 it. It is not necessarily the case that in order to make out
12 the legal claims in this complaint, that a lawyer would have
13 needed to include anything other than fondling and
14 masturbation. So it is not to be expected that if she had told
15 her attorneys about the other sex acts, that they would have
16 included it. And so I don't think the theory of omissions
17 works with respect to the sex acts.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: I disagree, your Honor.

19 THE COURT: Yes, I imagine.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: I mean, Ms. Comey doesn't do civil
21 work, but it is significant. And it is significant for many
22 reasons. And in particular --

23 THE COURT: This one, there are details included. The
24 one detail that was testified to is a significant detail. So
25 with respect to 39, I'll overrule. Sorry, I'll sustain.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may I clarify on that?

2 I don't think the witness testified to a particular
3 time frame when the penetration actually took place. And so I
4 don't know that we can say that any particular paragraph is
5 necessarily inconsistent, because I don't think she testified
6 to a time frame. I don't know that she would remember a
7 particular time frame. I think that this could be more readily
8 accomplished to the extent Mr. Pagliuca wants to point out that
9 this complaint does not contain a reference to that particular
10 sex act. I think he can ask her the question.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I think the document itself
12 has value --

13 THE COURT: You're not moving the whole document.
14 We've established that. So one paragraph at a time.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Right. The paragraphs have value --

16 THE COURT: And you'll respond to Ms. Comey's point
17 that it's only inconsistent if the time frame matches up with
18 the time frame that she's testified as to penetration.

19 Do you have a response to that?

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, she testified here that it was
21 more frequent than what's alleged. So that's one problem with
22 the argument from the government. I think she testified here
23 that it was up to four times a week that she was going. And
24 this complaint goes month by month, two times a month. That's
25 what it talks about. That's what this is. So that's another

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 inconsistency. I'm not sure where the disconnect is here on
2 the factual inconsistency where there is specific claim of
3 fondling breasts and buttocks. At the conclusion of the
4 massage, Jeffrey Epstein masturbated himself in C presence,
5 paid C in excess of \$200 for this encounter, which is also
6 inconsistent with the testimony, which she's claiming 300, up
7 to 600 an encounter. So it's inconsistent.

8 THE COURT: All right. I'm going to overrule on 39
9 and I think Ms. Comey's points are fully available for cross --
10 sorry, for redirect on this one.

11 The time frame pace is a little difficult to match up
12 exactly given that there is some -- a little bit of a shift --
13 well, it's hard to know what time frame this is referring to,
14 but I think in light of the witness's testimony, there's an
15 inference available that paragraph 39 falls within the time
16 frame that she talked about, penetrative acts, and that's not
17 included. So I'll allow 39.

18 Next.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: The same argument for 45, your Honor.

20 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would just like to clarify
21 that the witness only described one penetrative act on one
22 occasion once. So it cannot be that she's inconsistent if she
23 doesn't mention it in 50 different allegations on 50 different
24 dates.

25 THE COURT: Was that the testimony, that there was

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 only a penetrative act once?

2 MS. COMEY: Yes, your Honor. It was the second
3 incident where Jeffrey Epstein brought another female into the
4 room. She testified that he briefly penetrated her twice
5 during that incident. So he inserted his penis into her two
6 times during that one incident and that was it. So it's one
7 incident.

8 THE COURT: Okay. I'm re-persuaded. I'm going to
9 sustain on 39. But you can ask the question about are there
10 any allegations in the complaint regarding penetrative sex,
11 which is as she testified to.

12 Next paragraph.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: 51. And this is the same -- the same
14 issue.

15 MS. COMEY: And the same objection, your Honor.

16 THE COURT: All right. So I'll sustain on 51.

17 Next.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: 57.

19 THE COURT: And again, you can ask the question, but
20 it's not, on its face, inconsistent. And I don't think there's
21 an inference available. And to the extent there is, it would
22 be cumulative of the question that you're asking.

23 57.

24 MS. COMEY: Same objection, your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 I'll sustain on 57 for the same reason.

2 Next.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think I can -- I can just tell you
4 all of them, your Honor, which are going to be the same.

5 THE COURT: If they are all on that same theory, then
6 you can make the record. If there's any different theory of
7 inconsistency, either as to the specific time frame and
8 testimony or to some different inference available, I'll hear
9 it. But otherwise just make the record with respect to the
10 numbered paragraphs.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. And when I get to the place
12 where it's different, I'll stop and we'll address that.

13 THE COURT: Okay.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: Is that fair?

15 THE COURT: Fair.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: 63.

17 THE COURT: Okay. Sustained.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: 69, 75.

19 THE COURT: Sustained on 69. And sustained on 75.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: 81.

21 THE COURT: Sustained.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: 87.

23 THE COURT: Sustained.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: 93.

25 THE COURT: Sustained.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: 99.
2 THE COURT: Sustained.
3 MR. PAGLIUCA: 105.
4 THE COURT: Sustained.
5 MR. PAGLIUCA: 111.
6 THE COURT: Sustained.
7 MR. PAGLIUCA: 117.
8 THE COURT: Sustained.
9 MR. PAGLIUCA: 123.
10 THE COURT: Sustained.
11 MR. PAGLIUCA: 129.
12 THE COURT: Sustained.
13 MR. PAGLIUCA: 135.
14 THE COURT: Sustained.
15 MR. PAGLIUCA: 141.
16 THE COURT: Sustained.
17 MR. PAGLIUCA: 147.
18 THE COURT: Sustained.
19 MR. PAGLIUCA: 153.
20 THE COURT: Sustained.
21 MR. PAGLIUCA: 159.
22 THE COURT: Sustained.
23 MR. PAGLIUCA: 165.
24 THE COURT: Sustained.
25 MR. PAGLIUCA: 171.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Sustained.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: 177.

3 THE COURT: Sustained.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: 183.

5 THE COURT: Sustained.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: There's a slightly different argument
7 on 189.

8 THE COURT: Okay.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: And 195.

10 These are the end dates of the allegations, which
11 brackets it before 2004, which is inconsistent with the
12 testimony. And so these are the last two dates alleged in this
13 complaint which does not go farther than August of 2003.

14 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think the paragraphs
15 themselves are still consistent. I think Mr. Pagliuca can make
16 the point by asking the question of the witness about whether
17 there were any allegations contained after August 2003 in the
18 complaint.

19 THE COURT: Is there a line that says it's the final
20 contact?

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, it just says August 2003,
22 incident one and incident two.

23 THE COURT: Right.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: And there are no further allegations in
25 the complaint.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Okay. Sustained.

2 I think if it said the last incident, then fine. But
3 otherwise you can ask the question. The paragraph itself is
4 not inconsistent.

5 What else?

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, I'm offering 207 and 208 with
7 regard to Sarah Kellen.

8 THE COURT: 207.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: 207 and 208.

10 THE COURT: What's the inconsistency in 207?

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Again, these are -- well, as to all of
12 these, I'll just make this argument as to all of the paragraphs
13 that the Court sustained. I view these as impeachment by
14 omission because Ms. Maxwell's name does not appear in any of
15 these paragraphs.

16 THE COURT: Right. So this is why this one is
17 different than the last document, which is because of paragraph
18 206 and paragraph 12, which expressly reference other unnamed
19 individual employees and assistants. So on that ground I'll
20 sustain on 207.

21 Is there something different in 208?

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: No.

23 THE COURT: Okay. So sustained on that ground, too.

24 What else?

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: The interrogatory responses, your

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 Honor.

2 THE COURT: Which one is that tab?

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: Those are going to be C-8, I believe,
4 starting at --

5 THE COURT: Okay.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: -- tab 8.

7 THE COURT: Okay. Is there a specific inconsistency
8 or is it the omission theory?

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes. It's both.

10 THE COURT: Objection. Compound. Sustained.

11 Go ahead.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: It's both.

13 This document, we need to read the question with the
14 answer. And so question 16: State in detail how you came to
15 be at Mr. Epstein's home on each occasion, i.e., did someone
16 bring you or ask you if you would or wanted to go. If so,
17 state the name and address of that individual and what he/she
18 told you and the purpose of your visit.

19 THE COURT: Okay. It's an open-ended question.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Right. The answer is limited.

21 THE COURT: Okay. So I will allow -- Ms. Comey,
22 unless you want to be heard, my inclination is to allow the
23 question and answer in 16 in.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: The same is -- 17, your Honor, we have
25 the question: The amount of monies or anything of value you

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 claim you were given or paid to you by Mr. Epstein or someone,
2 yaddah, yaddah. And we have an expansive time frame here. And
3 the question, 2000 to 2006. And then the answer again is she's
4 only paid for May or June of 2002 to August of 2003. So we've
5 excluded two whole years by this answer in terms of the time
6 frame the witness testified to.

7 THE COURT: Okay. On the time frame inconsistency,
8 I'll allow 17, question and answer.

9 What's next?

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: 19 is all males who had any sexual
11 contact with her. It says sexual assault or battery since age
12 10. And the answer is none. And she's testified that there
13 were two males, I believe, that had sexual contact with her.

14 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I believe the testimony was
15 that they saw her naked in the massage room. I don't believe
16 there was testimony about sexual contact. I would want to
17 check the transcript, your Honor, but that is my recollection
18 of the testimony.

19 THE COURT: It's mine as well, but you'll check the
20 transcript. In the absence of that, I don't see any
21 inconsistency.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, then 20 covers lewd or lascivious
23 conduct, which would be naked people in a massage looking at a
24 naked underage --

25 MS. COMEY: Again, your Honor, the testimony was just

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 that they saw her naked. There was no other color on it.
2 There was no suggestion that they were engaged in sex acts or
3 that they were naked. I have the same objection.

4 THE COURT: I'm going to overrule on that one, 20.
5 There's the inference available of inconsistency, so I'll allow
6 20.

7 Next.

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: 21 is a description --

9 THE COURT: Just to spell that out, on the theory that
10 other males present in the room during conduct described could
11 be deemed lewd and lascivious conduct.

12 MS. COMEY: I just want to be clear, your Honor, that
13 the description was that they saw her naked in the massage
14 room, not that they saw her during any of the conduct. I think
15 there was testimony that she would be naked for a period before
16 Jeffrey Epstein would come in; and so it would just be them
17 seeing her nude in the room is what the testimony was, not lewd
18 and lascivious conduct.

19 THE COURT: Well, I'm going to overrule on 20.

20 Go ahead.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: 21 is simply asking a description of
22 the lewd and lascivious exhibition, the date, and whether you
23 received money or other consideration. Answer, none.

24 THE COURT: Okay. Exhibition we did not get testimony
25 on, so I'll sustain. There's no inconsistency on 21. No

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 inference available.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

3 THE COURT: Anything else?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes. C-9, question 16. This is an
5 amendment to the prior question 16 by the witness. And the
6 witness added in this amendment: I was also transported via
7 private car provided by Jeffrey Epstein.

8 It's significant, your Honor, in that the witness had
9 the opportunity to think about, reflect, add information here,
10 and did not. And it is important in the context of this case
11 where there's this changed memory over time.

12 THE COURT: Okay. I see the inconsistency.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you.

14 THE COURT: 16 I'll allow.

15 What else?

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think that's it -- well, then
17 there's -- well, I think that's it.

18 THE COURT: Okay. We really need to get the jury
19 back.

20 MS. STERNHEIM: Can we just have five minutes, Judge?

21 THE COURT: You can take five.

22 MS. COMEY: And, your Honor, can I ask how long we
23 have left on cross-examination? I think it's been longer than
24 the direct at this point.

25 THE COURT: I'm stepping down. You can ask the

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 question.

2 (Recess)

3 THE COURT: We'll bring in the jury.

4 Ms. Comey is coming?

5 MS. POMERANTZ: Yes, your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Let's get the witness.

7 Mr. Pagliuca, if you can go to the podium.

8 MS. COMEY: I apologize, your Honor. The witness is
9 on her way. I was looking for her.

10 THE COURT: Okay.

11 Bring in the jury.

12 (Jury present)

13 THE COURT: Everyone may be seated. And we're getting
14 the witness, so it will just be a second.

15 Members of the jury, sorry for the extended break. We
16 were working through issues to minimize the sidebars, so thank
17 you for your patience.

18 While we have a second, I'll use the time to remind
19 you of scheduling issues this week. Same as it's been.

20 Next week, you'll recall, Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday
21 we won't sit. That's because I have a scheduling conflict. So
22 we'll be back Thursday, Friday.

23 And then the following week, Monday, Tuesday,
24 Wednesday, then we're off for the Christmas break.

25 And the following week, Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday,

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 and then we're off for the New Year's break.

2 And I'll keep you updated beyond that as soon as I
3 have it.

4 Good afternoon, Carolyn. You can take your seat.

5 And please remove your mask. Thank you.

6 I remind Carolyn she's under oath.

7 Mr. Pagliuca, you may continue with your
8 cross-examination.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

10 I'd like to direct the witness to 3505-43, page 10,
11 deposition page 31, lines 21 through 25.

12 THE COURT: Can we get them called up please.

13 THE WITNESS: I'm at page 10.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: It will come up on the screen.

15 THE COURT: Page and lines?

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Excuse me? Page and line, your Honor,
17 we're going to start --

18 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would object to this.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: Start at page 32, line -- 31, line 18.
20 I'll have the witness to see if it refreshes --

21 THE COURT: What are the lines?

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-043, page 10, deposition page --

23 THE COURT: I can't hear you, Mr. Pagliuca.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm trying to bend down, talk, and read
25 at the same time.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Right.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-043, page 10, deposition page 31,
3 line 19.

4 THE WITNESS: Is it in this binder?

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: No, it will come up on your screen
6 there.

7 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

8 THE COURT: Sustained.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I'd like the opportunity to
10 make a record on this after.

11 THE WITNESS: There is nothing on my screen.

12 THE COURT: It's okay. Next question.

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

14 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

15 Q. Carolyn, in the 2002 to 2003 time frame, you were abusing
16 multiple substances; correct?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Do you recall abusing alcohol and drugs at approximately
19 the age of 13?

20 A. If you call smoking pot drugs, then I suppose so.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can direct the witness to
22 3505-035.

23 THE WITNESS: I was also on --

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: 47.

25 THE COURT: Pause. Go ahead.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE WITNESS: I was also on my Xanax for anxiety.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-035, 47.

3 THE COURT: Lines please?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

5 THE COURT: Thank you.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: 23 through 24.

7 MS. COMEY: No objection, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: All right. Go ahead.

9 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

10 Q. You indicated that you began drinking at the age 13, do you
11 see that?

12 A. I don't.

13 THE COURT: Carolyn, could you please move into the
14 mic.

15 A. I do not see that on the page that's in front of me at all.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay. I will move on, your Honor.

17 Q. You agree you were smoking marijuana at the age of 13;
18 correct?

19 A. Yeah.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'd like to direct the witness to
21 3505-039, page 4, the lower right box.

22 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

23 Q. Do you recall that during the time frame 2002 through 2003,
24 you were using benzodiazepines three to six times a week;
25 correct?

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Sir, this document that you're showing me was taken on
2 9/16/2005. So what does that have to do with the time frame
3 you're asking me?

4 Q. This was an intake interview, do you recall that?

5 A. In 2005.

6 Q. Right. And if you turn to --

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: The witness can be shown 039, page 6.

8 Q. That's your signature in October of 2005; correct?

9 A. Yes, but what does that have to do with the year 2002 and
10 2003?

11 Q. You were telling the intake person about your drug use;
12 correct?

13 A. In 2005.

14 Q. And you were telling them about your history of drug use
15 prior to 2005 in this intake; correct?

16 A. No.

17 Q. No? If we look at the intake form, the paragraph that I
18 showed you, do you recall telling --

19 THE COURT: Can you turn to it and enlarge it.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

21 Page 4 of the exhibit.

22 THE COURT: It's too small to read.

23 A. Okay. What's your question?

24 Q. Do you recall telling the intake interviewer that you were
25 using benzodiazepines?

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 A. That's Xanax.

2 Q. I understand. Three to six times per week, right?

3 A. Right. At the age of 13.

4 Q. Right.

5 A. That was my anxiety medication.

6 Q. You were using alcohol three to six times per week;
7 correct?

8 A. And I used it in 2005.

9 Q. Do you see that it says alcohol, three to six times a week,
10 beginning --

11 MS. COMEY: Objection. Reading from a document --

12 THE COURT: Just a moment. Just a moment.

13 You could direct her to it and ask if that refreshes.

14 Q. Yes. I'm looking at where it says alcohol.

15 A. I see that.

16 Q. Okay. And you told them -- well, does this refresh your
17 memory that you told them that you were using alcohol three to
18 six times per week beginning in 2000? Do you see that?

19 A. Yes, I do see that. But that's incorrect.

20 Q. Okay. So this interviewer -- well, you signed this form,
21 didn't you?

22 A. I did.

23 Q. It's also true that you were doing cocaine in 2002 and
24 2003; correct?

25 A. Absolutely not. I haven't done that. I didn't use crack

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 until I was 18 years old.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can direct the witness to --

3 A. And it dates in 2005.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: We can take down that document, your
5 Honor.

6 THE COURT: It's down.

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: If I can direct the witness to
8 3505-043, page 28, deposition page 105, lines 7 through 11.

9 THE COURT: Just a moment.

10 A. I'm sorry, what lines?

11 Q. It will be enlarged for you.

12 A. No, I see that. I'm asking what lines of the paper you
13 would like me to look at.

14 Q. Sure. We're looking at lines 7 through 11.

15 A. Yes, I see that.

16 Q. Again, this is testimony under oath in 2009; correct?

17 A. Right.

18 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

19 THE COURT: Sustained.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: The basis of the objection, your Honor?

21 THE COURT: Not inconsistent.

22 Q. You also ingested something called angel trumpets when you
23 were going to Mr. Epstein's house, do you recall that?

24 A. That's a flower. I don't think you should ingest those at
25 all.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can direct the witness to
2 3505-035, page 139. That's the deposition page, I believe.

3 THE COURT: I will direct the witness to answer,
4 because I don't think we got a direct answer to the question.

5 THE WITNESS: I have never taken a hallucinogenic.

6 THE COURT: Okay. Go ahead.

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: 3505-035, page 139, line 10.

8 THE COURT: All right. Go ahead.

9 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, may I confer with counsel --

10 THE COURT: You may.

11 MS. COMEY: -- please?

12 (Counsel conferred)

13 THE WITNESS: I have never seen this document in my
14 life.

15 THE COURT: Just one second, Carolyn.

16 MS. COMEY: Thank you, your Honor.

17 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Can you orient the witness as to what
19 we're looking at.

20 MR. PAGLIUCA: Page 138.

21 THE COURT: But just the date that this is from.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: This is from 2009, your Honor.

23 THE COURT: Okay. Can you just show the first page,
24 because she said she didn't know what it was.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. October 21st, 2009.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Okay. And then --

2 THE WITNESS: Rough draft. Who's it from?

3 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

4 Q. The question is did you make that statement?

5 A. What statement?

6 Q. That you used angel trumpets --

7 A. No, I don't even see that as a question. It was asking
8 about hallucinogenics.

9 Q. You know what an angel trumpet is; correct?

10 A. I do not. I don't suggest anybody eats them.

11 Q. Your drug use continued in the 2001 through 2003 time
12 frame; correct?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Isn't it true that you left the state of Florida in part
15 because you were abusing cocaine, and you and your boyfriend
16 wanted to go to Georgia so that you could detox?

17 A. That is not true. I went to Georgia to escape the
18 traumatic events that were happening in my life.

19 Q. Well, and you went to Georgia and you were pregnant, right?

20 A. I got pregnant in Georgia.

21 Q. And you stayed there through 2003; correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. I want to ask you some questions about your testimony
24 related to your claims about having sex with Mr. Epstein.

25 Do you remember testifying about that on direct

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 examination?

2 A. When, earlier?

3 Q. Yes.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And let me back up.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Isn't it true that you used cocaine while you were at
8 Mr. Epstein's house?

9 A. No.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: If I could direct the witness's
11 attention --

12 A. I saw the paper.

13 THE COURT: I will ask you to call it up.

14 MR. PAGLIUCA: I am, your Honor. I'm going to direct
15 the witness's attention to page 3505-043, 28, at page 105.
16 Let's start at page 103.

17 Does the witness have page 103?

18 THE COURT: Yes.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: Let's go to line 10, start at line 11.

20 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

21 THE WITNESS: What does Mr. Epstein telling me not to
22 take drugs have to do with the question?

23 THE COURT: Just a second. When there's an objection,
24 you have to wait till I rule, please.

25 THE WITNESS: Oh.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: It's foundational for the next
2 question.

3 THE COURT: Well, then let's direct counsel and the
4 Court to the lines, and then you can expand for foundation, if
5 necessary.

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. Line 14:

7 Question: And how did Mr. Epstein --

8 THE COURT: No, no, no. You need to tell the
9 government and me what lines to read. The government can
10 indicate objection or no objection, and then I'll rule, and
11 then you can proceed or not proceed.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. Page 103, line 14 through 25,
13 continuing on to 104, through page -- line 25, continuing on
14 through 105, page -- line 25.

15 THE COURT: I'm still on 103 here.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Excuse me?

17 THE COURT: It was just on 103 so far.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

19 THE COURT: You need to communicate with each other
20 because it's just not working.

21 THE WITNESS: I don't understand what this has to
22 do --

23 THE COURT: Just a minute, please.

24 Can you repeat, I guess, the line. Okay.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: And we do have paper copies, your

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 Honor, if that's easier.

2 THE COURT: Okay.

3 So what exact lines do you propose reading?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, I think we need to start at 14
5 and continue through that page, the next page, the next page,
6 and the next page.

7 THE COURT: Ms. Comey.

8 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think the only potentially
9 admissible portion of this might be on pages 105 through 106.

10 THE COURT: Thank you. Let's go there.

11 That seems to get what you're getting at.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. I was just trying to give the
13 context, your Honor. So that's fine. I'll go there.

14 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

15 Q. Looking at line 7 on page 105, does it refresh your memory
16 that you answered the question: Yes, but I have done cocaine
17 at Mr. Epstein's house also?

18 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I think we need the question
19 and then its answer, and then it needs to continue through to
20 page 106.

21 THE WITNESS: I need to know what line --

22 THE COURT: So at this point you may read on that page
23 those indicated lines. Go ahead.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: Fine, your Honor.

25 Starting at line 4, is that fine, Ms. Comey?

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MS. COMEY: Yes. But I would ask that counsel be
2 cautioned not to say a last name.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: Absolutely.

4 MS. COMEY: And then continuing into page 106, line 9.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: That will be fine.

6 Does it refresh your recollection --

7 THE COURT: You can just read. Just read it all the
8 way through and then move on.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Okay.

10 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: (Reading)

12 "Q. And you were and he doing cocaine away from Mr. Epstein,
13 that is what you did when you weren't at Mr. Epstein's house?

14 "A. Yes. But I have done cocaine at Mr. Epstein's house also.

15 "Q. When did you do cocaine at Mr. Epstein's house?

16 "A. On some occasions when I was there.

17 "Q. What occasions were those?

18 "A. I don't recall the dates and times.

19 "Q. What, where at his house were you doing cocaine?

20 "A. I would excuse myself and go to the bathroom.

21 "Q. And who was in the bathroom when you were doing cocaine?

22 "A. Myself.

23 "Q. And what form of cocaine were you doing?

24 "A. Powder.

25 "Q. And did you tell anyone you were taking cocaine?

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 "A. Mr. Epstein knew I was high.

2 "Q. Did you tell Mr. Epstein that you had gone in the bathroom
3 in his house and snorted cocaine?

4 "A. Not per se in that form.

5 "Q. Did you tell him that you were using drugs in his house?

6 "A. No.

7 "Q. So -- no. He never told you to do drugs in his house, did
8 he?

9 "A. No, he never told me to."

10 A. He says he never told you to use drugs. You missed a word.

11 Q. Okay. And then the answer was:

12 "A. No, he never told me to."

13 Correct?

14 A. That's what it says.

15 Q. And those are the answers that you gave under oath in 2009;
16 correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Now, I want to ask you some questions about your testimony
19 here today about your claim that you had intercourse with
20 Mr. Epstein.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Directing the witness's attention to
22 the same page, 106, line 13.

23 THE COURT: Not up yet.

24 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I would just ask that the
25 witness be asked to explain what she defines as "sexual

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 intercourse."

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: I think that's --

3 THE COURT: That's not an objection. Let me look at
4 what we're talking about. Let's do this the same way every
5 time, okay?

6 MS. COMEY: Yes, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: Page and line?

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: 106, 13, your Honor.

9 THE COURT: All right. Go ahead.

10 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

11 Q. (Reading)

12 "Q. Did you ever have sexual intercourse with Mr. Epstein?

13 "A. No."

14 Do you see that question and answer?

15 A. Yeah, I do.

16 MR. PAGLIUCA: Then, your Honor, I'm going to
17 continue, with the Court's permission, to the next series of
18 questions and answers.

19 THE WITNESS: Can I finish my answer?

20 THE COURT: You may.

21 THE WITNESS: You asked me the question, did you ever
22 have sexual intercourse with Mr. Epstein. And the answer says
23 that I replied no. I replied no because I was not a willing
24 participant. He had intercourse with me and I stopped it. I
25 didn't ask to have sex with him.

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: And, your Honor, may I continue
2 reading?

3 THE COURT: What lines?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sixteen through 107, 14.

5 THE COURT: Need to see 107.

6 Through what line?

7 MR. PAGLIUCA: Five, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Okay. Go ahead.

9 MS. COMEY: I would object, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: I'm sorry?

11 MS. COMEY: Same objection, your Honor.

12 THE COURT: Go ahead.

13 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

14 Q. (Reading)

15 "Q. Do you know what I mean by sexual intercourse or do I need
16 to go through the various acts?

17 "A. Oh, I am pretty sure I know what sexual intercourse is
18 being I have two children.

19 "Q. Well, I just want to make sure we're clear about some
20 things. Did Mr. Epstein ever insert his penis into any part of
21 your body at all?

22 "A. I just said that I've never had any sexual intercourse
23 with Mr. Epstein, and that I knew what -- "

24 THE COURT: You misread.

25 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

LC7VMAX7

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. (Reading)

2 A. "I just said that I've never had sexual intercourse with
3 Mr. Epstein, and that I knew what sexual intercourse was and I
4 said no. So for you to explain to me what it was, unnecessary.

5 "Q. Okay. Do you just want to answer my question now, ma'am?

6 "A. I did four times. I said no."

7 Continuing on, your Honor, to --

8 THE WITNESS: For a spelling of that answer should
9 have been he did four times, I said no.

10 (Continued on next page)

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: Continuing on, your Honor, to page 106,
2 please.

3 THE COURT: Lines?

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: 24, 25 -- excuse me. 108, 24, 25, 109,
5 16.

6 THE COURT: Ms. Comey?

7 MS. COMEY: Same objection.

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: I need a basis. I'm going to respond.

9 THE COURT: I'm going to overrule.

10 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

11 "Q. Did you ever masturbate Mr. Epstein?

12 "A. No.

13 "Q. Did you ever touch Mr. Epstein's penis?

14 "A. No.

15 "Q. In any way?

16 "A. No. No.

17 "Q. Did you ever penetrate with any part of your body, any
18 part of Mr. Epstein's body?

19 "A. Besides touching his nipples, no.

20 "Q. Did you ever do anything physically to Mr. Epstein, other
21 than give him a nipple massage?

22 "A. Squeezed his nipples.

23 THE WITNESS: That says, "Simple massage."

24 "Q. Simple massage?

25 "A. Squeezed his nipples."

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Correct?

2 A. Correct.

3 "Q. Was that part of the massage?

4 "A. No.

5 "Q. Okay. So other than squeeze his nipples and give him a
6 massage, did you do anything else physically to Mr. Epstein?

7 "A. No."

8 Correct?

9 A. Yes. But what does this have to do with what I'm here for
10 today?

11 THE COURT: Mr. Pagliuca, next question.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

13 Q. When you spoke to the agents in 2007, you did not say
14 anything about Ghislaine Maxwell; correct?

15 A. Ms. Maxwell was not the topic of discussion at that time.

16 Q. Is the answer to my question yes?

17 A. The only thing Ms. Maxwell was involved in was fondling and
18 touching my breasts and my buttocks, and for that, my soul is
19 broken and so is my heart.

20 THE COURT: Counsel.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I move to strike the answer
22 and ask the Court to direct the witness to answer the question
23 asked.

24 THE COURT: Carolyn, you have to follow my rules here,
25 you have to.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Jury will disregard. I do direct the witness to
2 respond to the questions. I'll give you an opportunity to
3 explain and Ms. Comey will have an opportunity to redirect.

4 Go ahead.

5 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

6 Q. The question was, in 2007, you never said anything to the
7 FBI agents about Ms. Maxwell; correct?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. Your two lawsuits involving Jeffrey Epstein and Sarah
10 Kellen say nothing about Ms. Maxwell; correct?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Your deposition testimony in 2009 says nothing about
13 Ms. Maxwell, other than the two words that Ms. Comey read;
14 correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. Now, you also met with Ms. Villaflana (ph.) in Florida in
17 2007 with the government. Do you recall meeting with her?

18 A. I'm sorry, who?

19 Q. Ms. Villaflana?

20 A. I'm not -- I don't recall the name.

21 Q. Do you recall that there was a second meeting with the
22 government in 2007 in Florida which Ms. Villaflana attended? Do
23 you remember that?

24 A. I'm not sure exactly who that is.

25 Q. You never said anything to Ms. Villaflana or anyone else in

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 the second meeting about Ms. Maxwell; correct?

2 A. I don't recall.

3 Q. Between 2002 and 2003, you were in mental health
4 counseling. Do you recall that?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Do you remember Dr. Susan Pope?

7 A. That was my therapist.

8 Q. All right.

9 A. I wasn't in a mental facility.

10 Q. I said counseling. So I will use your word, your
11 therapist. Do you recall being in therapy with Dr. Pope?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. You never mentioned Ms. Maxwell in therapy with Dr. Pope;
14 correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. Now, you also met with Dr. Serge Thys?

17 A. Dr. Thys.

18 Q. Never mentioned Ms. Maxwell to him either; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. It's true, isn't it, Carolyn, that your story has changed
21 significantly since 2007, 2008, and 2009; correct?

22 A. No.

23 Q. And isn't it true -- well, first of all, you had no contact
24 with the government between 2007 and 2019; correct?

25 A. I'm not sure. I don't remember the dates.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. Do you recall that after you met with the agents in 2007,
2 the next time you spoke with anyone from the FBI was March
3 19th, 2019? Do you recall that?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And the agents contacted you and you told them that you
6 wanted to talk to your lawyers before talking to them; correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you got a hold of Mr. Scarola, who was your lawyer from
9 before; correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And you spoke with Mr. Scarola? The government continued
12 to try to contact you in 2019; correct?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. And you didn't get back to them at all in 2019, did you?

15 A. I don't recall.

16 Q. Well, do you recall that Mr. Scarola forwarded a number of
17 emails from the government to you in 2019 and you never
18 responded to them?

19 A. I -- I don't recall any of that.

20 Q. You don't recall getting any emails from your lawyer --

21 A. I'm not sure. My phone number has been changed numerous
22 times.

23 Q. My question is, do you recall getting any forwarded emails
24 from the government from your lawyer?

25 A. Yes.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. And you didn't respond to those in 2019; correct?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. Mr. Scarola also left you multiple --

4 THE COURT: Just a second. Go ahead.

5 A. I'm not sure -- the dates and everything have been run
6 together right now.

7 Q. Mr. Scarola also left multiple voice messages for you with
8 regard to the government, correct, in 2020?

9 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Sustained.

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: If I can direct the witness to 3505 --

12 THE COURT: No, question. What's your question?

13 MR. PAGLIUCA: I understand.

14 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

15 Q. The question is, you were aware that Mr. Scarola was
16 leaving messages for you about contacting the government?

17 A. I -- to Mr. Scarola --

18 THE COURT: Just a minute.

19 MS. COMEY: Objection.

20 THE COURT: I sustained the objection. That's why I
21 said go to the next question.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: I don't understand the basis for the
23 objection, your Honor.

24 MS. COMEY: Privilege, your Honor.

25 THE COURT: Sustained. Sustained. Next question.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

2 Q. You never responded to the government in 2020, based on any
3 messages that were left on your phone; correct?

4 A. I did speak with Mr. Scarola in 2020.

5 MS. COMEY: Your Honor --

6 THE COURT: I'll allow that answer and now you'll move
7 on.

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: I am, your Honor.

9 Q. You first responded to the government in July of 2020
10 through Mr. Danchuk; correct?

11 A. That was my attorney.

12 Q. Right. You first responded to them through Mr. Danchuk;
13 correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And July 1, 2020, is one month after applications to the
16 Epstein Victim Compensation Fund were opened; correct?

17 MS. COMEY: Objection. Foundation.

18 THE COURT: Sustained.

19 Q. You knew that in June, one month earlier, applications were
20 opened to the Epstein Victim Compensation Fund; correct?

21 A. No.

22 Q. In July 2020, your lawyer, Mr. Scarola, sent an email with
23 a number of bullet points for the government to interview
24 about; correct?

25 MS. COMEY: Objection. Foundation.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Just a moment. Overruled.

2 The question is, in July 2020, did Mr. Scarola send an
3 email with a number of bullet points for the government to
4 interview about.

5 A. Anytime I talked to the government, he was present with me.

6 Q. I understand that. And those interviews with the
7 government were a followup to the email that Mr. Scarola sent
8 on your behalf as your agent on July 16th, 2020; correct?

9 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Sustained on foundation.

11 Q. You were aware that Mr. Scarola sent the email with the
12 bullet points to the government in advance of you meeting with
13 the government; correct?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. And there are materials shown to you in advance of your
16 meeting with the government; correct?

17 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor. We're veering into
18 privileged territory.

19 THE COURT: You need to clarify the question so I can
20 respond to that objection.

21 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm not asking for any communications,
22 your Honor. I'm just talking about materials shown to her --

23 THE COURT: By her attorney, you're asking her what
24 materials her attorney showed her?

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: In advance of meeting with the

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 government, yes.

2 THE COURT: Sustained.

3 A. I have no --

4 THE COURT: I sustained it.

5 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

6 Q. You were present with Mr. Scarola and other lawyers on
7 multiple occasions meeting with the government; correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And this was at the same time that you were submitting your
10 Epstein Victim Compensation Fund request; correct?

11 A. No, it's not correct.

12 Q. Well, do you recall meeting with the government in July of
13 2020?

14 THE COURT: Do you recall meeting with the government
15 in July 2020.

16 A. No. I'm not sure. I can't recall.

17 THE COURT: Okay. You can say you can't recall if you
18 can't recall.

19 A. I can't recall.

20 Q. Do you recall meeting with the government -- let me ask the
21 question. How many times do you recall meeting with the
22 government in 2020?

23 A. I'm not sure.

24 Q. Multiple times; correct?

25 A. I don't recall.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Q. And do you recall submitting your application to the
2 Epstein Victim Compensation Fund in October of 2020?

3 A. I'm not sure when it was admitted.

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Can we show the witness Exhibit C6,
5 electronically, please, and let's go to the last page of the
6 exhibit.

7 THE WITNESS: Yes, that's my signature.

8 Q. And there is a date on there, which is October 14th, 2020.
9 Does that refresh your recollection as to when you submitted
10 it?

11 A. Yes, that's when it was submitted.

12 Q. And that's during the time that you were meeting with the
13 government; correct?

14 THE COURT: You could put the exhibit down?

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, please.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And your Epstein Victim Compensation Fund submission is
18 different from your two lawsuits against Epstein and Kellen;
19 correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Your Epstein Victim Compensation Fund has the date, May
22 1st, 2020, as the start date, not -- I'm sorry. 2001 as the
23 start date; correct?

24 A. I do not recall.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness that --

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 A. Can you repeat the question.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: Sure. If we can show the witness page
3 3 of C6, please.

4 THE WITNESS: What is your question now?

5 Q. I'm looking in the middle of the page, would that refresh
6 your memory as to what the date was you were claiming the
7 beginning date in the Epstein Victim Compensation Fund to get
8 compensation?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And that's May 1st, 2001; correct?

11 A. Wait. Can you ask me the question again, because --

12 Q. In your Epstein victim fund compensation submission, you
13 were claiming Epstein abused you beginning May 1, 2001;
14 correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And that's different from the two lawsuits that you
17 filed --

18 A. Yes. I've already answered that question for you.

19 Q. Okay. This Epstein Victim Compensation Fund submission is
20 also different because you added claims of vaginal penetration
21 with fingers, sex toys, oral sex, and forged intercourse?

22 A. Absolutely not. That's a lie.

23 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness page 4 of 11
24 in that same exhibit.

25 Q. Does that refresh your recollection that, with the Epstein

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 Victim Compensation Fund, you added claims of vaginal
2 penetration with fingers and sex toys, oral sex, forged
3 intercourse; true?

4 A. I suppose. That's what it states.

5 Q. And that's different from your lawsuits against Epstein --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Kellen --

8 THE COURT: Carolyn. Carolyn. You have to wait for
9 the question to finish and then you may give your answer. Go
10 ahead.

11 Q. That's different from your lawsuits filed against Epstein
12 and Kellen in 2008 and 2009; correct? Correct?

13 A. I already answered. Yes.

14 Q. The other difference between your 2008 and 2009 lawsuits
15 and your Epstein Victim Compensation Fund request is that you
16 included Ms. Maxwell in this Epstein victim fund request;
17 correct?

18 A. No, that's not correct. I did not add her.

19 Q. As part of the Epstein Victim Fund request, you were
20 awarded \$3.25 million; correct?

21 A. I'm not exactly sure.

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: If we can show the witness C7, and the
23 bottom of the page, the number there.

24 Q. Does that refresh your recollection --

25 A. That does not say \$3.9 million. It's \$2,804,000.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you. We can take the exhibit
2 down.

3 Q. You received \$2,804,000; correct?

4 A. Yes. But what does that have to do with anything?

5 Q. They subtracted \$446,000 which had been previously paid for
6 your claims against Mr. Epstein and Ms. Kellen; correct?

7 A. Yes, but no money will ever fix what's happened to me. So
8 why is that --

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Move to strike the answer, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Carolyn, you have to wait for my ruling
11 when there is an objection.

12 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

13 THE COURT: Objection sustained. Jury will disregard.
14 I will direct the witness to answer the questions of
15 Mr. Pagliuca.

16 Ms. Comey will have an opportunity to come back and
17 ask you additional questions.

18 Go ahead.

19 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

20 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

21 Q. As part of this compensation fund, you know that if any of
22 the information you've submitted is false, you can lose the
23 money; correct?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And you know if any of the information you've submitted is

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 false, you can be in criminal trouble; correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. So there is an incentive for you to stick to your story;
4 correct?

5 MS. COMEY: Objection, your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Sustained.

7 Q. Ms. Comey asked you some questions about your schizophrenia
8 and issues related to your children. Do you recall that?

9 A. Yes, I do.

10 Q. Isn't it true that you're worried about your children being
11 taken away from you because you've lost custody in the past
12 because of substance abuse issues?

13 A. No, that is not what I said. You are wrong.

14 Q. Isn't it true -- I'm not asking what you said --

15 A. It is not true, no.

16 THE COURT: Hang on a second. I'll direct the witness
17 to answer the question and then Ms. Comey will have an
18 opportunity to redirect. You may ask the question.

19 Q. Isn't it true that you're worried about your kids being
20 taken away because you lost custody of the children --

21 A. No.

22 Q. -- in the past --

23 THE COURT: You have to wait for the question.

24 Q. -- because of substance abuse issues?

25 A. No.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - cross

1 THE COURT: Okay. Next question.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: No further questions, your Honor.

3 THE COURT: Ms. Comey.

4 MS. COMEY: Briefly, your Honor. Thank you.

5 MR. PAGLIUCA: I need to confer, your Honor.

6 THE WITNESS: I didn't lose my kids.

7 THE COURT: Let's go, counsel, because it's close to
8 the end of the day.

9 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, I'm going to be very brief.

10 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Pagliuca, now is your time?

11 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor. Got it. Your Honor,
12 as I understand it, the prior testimony that's been read into
13 the record is admitted; is that correct?

14 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, it's been read into the
15 transcript.

16 THE COURT: Correct.

17 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

18 Q. When you were talking to the government, you recall seeing
19 a photograph of Ms. Maxwell pregnant; is that correct?

20 A. Excuse me?

21 Q. One of your memories about Ms. Maxwell is you claim that
22 you saw a photograph of her in Epstein's house, pregnant;
23 correct?

24 A. Nude and pregnant laying on the --

25 Q. And pregnant.

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - redirect

1 A. -- yes. There was multiple pictures, nude photos.

2 MR. PAGLIUCA: May I approach the witness, your Honor?

3 THE COURT: Yes, but Mr. Pagliuca, you got to --

4 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

5 Your Honor, I've handed the witness Defendant's
6 Exhibit C10. The government has a copy.

7 THE WITNESS: That is not the photo.

8 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I think I understand the
9 Court's ruling that the interrogatories that we discussed are
10 admitted; is that correct?

11 THE COURT: Yes.

12 MR. PAGLIUCA: No further questions.

13 MS. COMEY: Three minutes, your Honor.

14 THE COURT: Okay.

15 MS. COMEY: May I inquire?

16 THE COURT: You may.

17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

18 BY MS. COMEY:

19 Q. Carolyn, did you write your civil complaint?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Did you write your application to the Epstein Victim
22 Compensation Fund yourself?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Carolyn, when you were shown a report of an FBI interview,
25 had you ever seen that report before today?

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - redirect

1 A. No.

2 Q. Did you write it yourself?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Did anyone ever ask you if it was accurate?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Do you know how old you were when you first saw Ghislaine
7 Maxwell?

8 A. I was 13.

9 Q. Do you know how old you were when you first went to Jeffrey
10 Epstein's house?

11 A. I was 13.

12 Q. Do you know what year it was?

13 A. Not off the top of my head right now.

14 Q. Do you know what year it was when you were 14 years old,
15 Carolyn?

16 A. I can't remember right now.

17 Q. Are you able to tell us what year it was when you were 15
18 years old?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Can you tell us what year it was when you were 13?

21 A. If I do the math, yes.

22 Q. Did anyone tell you what to say here today on the stand?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Carolyn, are you trying to get money out of testifying here
25 today?

LC7Cmax8

Carolyn - redirect

1 A. No. Money will not ever fix what that woman has done to
2 me.

3 Q. Carolyn, why are you here today?

4 A. Because what she did was wrong and she takes vulnerable
5 young girls and --

6 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, I object.

7 A. I'm so petrified that my daughters are --

8 THE COURT: Carolyn, just a second. Just a second. I
9 have to rule on an objection. Grounds.

10 MR. PAGLIUCA: Your Honor, it's a narrative and
11 it's --

12 MS. COMEY: Your Honor, an answer he doesn't like is
13 not a narrative.

14 THE COURT: Counsel, both of you need to behave.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: I'm behaving, your Honor. It's a
16 narrative --

17 THE COURT: I understand. Just one word objection.

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: 404(b).

19 THE COURT: All right. I'll let the answer in as it
20 is. Next question.

21 BY MS. COMEY:

22 Q. Carolyn, what have you been told by the government to do
23 here today?

24 A. Just tell the truth.

25 MS. COMEY: No further questions.

LC7Cmax8

1 THE COURT: Mr. Pagliuca.

2 RECROSS EXAMINATION

3 BY MR. PAGLIUCA:

4 Q. The \$446,000 that you received in 2009, that was gone by
5 2012; correct?

6 A. I don't know, sir. I have children that I take care of.

7 Q. The \$446,000 was gone by 2012; correct?

8 MS. COMEY: Beyond the scope, your Honor.

9 THE COURT: Overruled.

10 A. I do not recall the dates.

11 Q. You don't recall when you ran out of \$446,000?

12 A. I bought a house, a car, food. I don't recall.

13 Q. And you lost all of it; correct?

14 A. Absolutely not.

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: No further questions, your Honor.

16 MS. COMEY: Nothing, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: All right. Carolyn, you may step down,
18 you are excused. Thank you.

19 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

20 (Witness excused)

21 THE COURT: Members of the jury, we're about two
22 minutes over. Thank you for your attention and diligence.
23 We'll resume same time tomorrow. Thank you so much.

24 (Continued on next page)

25

LC7Cmax8

1 (Jury not present)

2 THE COURT: You my be seated. Matters to take up.

3 MR. ROHRBACH: Your Honor, the government has an
4 update on its factual development with regard to the witness,
5 Brian. The government is not going to be able to complete a
6 factual investigation by 6 o'clock. Specifically, Jane's
7 counsel is not available, so the government won't be able to
8 talk with Jane as part of this. The government will just elect
9 not to call Brian as a witness. We'll of course produce the
10 materials we have gathered to the defense tonight.

11 And I would just like to make a record that the
12 government does not believe that any rule or order of the Court
13 has been violated and the government's decision should not be
14 understood in that light.

15 THE COURT: Anything, Ms. Menninger?

16 MS. MENNINGER: No, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Any other matters to take up?

18 MR. EVERDELL: Your Honor, just if we could get a bit
19 of the preview of the witness order since I think things have
20 shuffled a bit in light of developments today.

21 THE COURT: Can you give defense counsel a new witness
22 list?

23 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor, we can that this evening.

24 THE COURT: I'll note, the Court did receive a request
25 for a docketing of the witness list. The government submitted

LC7Cmax8

1 that with a request to file it under seal on the theory that
2 it's not a judicial document, as I'm not doing anything with
3 it, and even if it is a judicial document, it contains the
4 names, it's identifying as to individuals who are testifying
5 under pseudonym and individuals who haven't testified yet. For
6 that reason, I'll permit it to be maintained under seal if you
7 do share it with the Court.

8 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

9 With respect to scheduling -- I'm sorry, may I have
10 just one moment?

11 THE COURT: Yes.

12 MS. MOE: Your Honor, with respect to scheduling, we
13 did want to update the Court and counsel that we do anticipate
14 that, given the current pace of scheduling, we will rest this
15 week. So we want to let the Court know that, for scheduling
16 purposes, giving the timing of the trial, that's our current
17 update and estimate.

18 THE COURT: That's helpful. I wanted to talk about
19 the timing of the charging conference.

20 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor.

21 THE COURT: Let me just pull up my calendar.

22 Let me ask defense counsel, in light of that and in
23 light of the fact that I'm, due to a scheduling conflict, not
24 sitting 13th, 14th, 15th -- let me run this as an option. I
25 have inquired whether we can hold the charging conference on

LC7Cmax8

1 Saturday the 18th. It is possible to have Ms. Maxwell present
2 and to make public access available on that weekend date. So
3 you can consider if you'd like to do that or not, given where
4 we are in the schedule. I'll leave it to counsel to consider
5 it and confer. Alternatively, I suppose we could talk about
6 the charging conference on the 16th after we finish with the
7 jury. Any thoughts?

8 MS. MOE: Your Honor, the government has no preference
9 between those two dates and would be available for a December
10 18th conference. I think the timing would just depend on the
11 length and pace of the defense case. For example, if the
12 defense case were to begin on Friday, depending on how long
13 that defense case were to last, it may be that we might need to
14 have that conference earlier, but we don't have a sense of the
15 length of the defense case, and so it's hard for us to gauge
16 the timing.

17 MR. EVERDELL: May we confer, your Honor?

18 THE COURT: You may. Let me ask, does the government
19 anticipate -- I know it's a little hard to predict, but do you
20 predict resting potentially by Thursday such that --

21 MS. MOE: Yes, your Honor. It just depends on the
22 length of cross of the remaining witnesses, but I think it is
23 possible we will be resting on Thursday.

24 THE COURT: Okay.

25 MS. MOE: Thursday of this week.

LC7Cmax8

1 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, we do have witnesses, so
2 we're going to have to sort through some logistics ourselves.

3 THE COURT: I understand that.

4 MR. EVERDELL: Your Honor, I think maybe if we have
5 the opportunity to confer with the government, we can report
6 tomorrow on the options.

7 THE COURT: That's fine. I wanted to make that
8 available so that we're not -- so we have time for it that
9 isn't intruding into the time of the jury next week. So I
10 think in light of what you're indicating, my thinking would be
11 either the evening of the 16th or 17th, or Saturday the 18th.

12 Again, I have inquired and there is no issue,
13 Ms. Maxwell can be here and we can have public access both in
14 the courtroom and overflow room. So you'll confer and let me
15 know your thinking as to timing.

16 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Other matters to take up?

18 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, on that point, I would
19 like to point out that we do have a younger sibling of Jane
20 under our subpoena and I would ask, because we don't have
21 communications with that witness, that when there are
22 communications with Jane and her attorney, that she be directed
23 not to communicate about her testimony with that witness in
24 light of issues that I think are apparent that I can certainly
25 make a record if need be.

LC7Cmax8

1 MS. MOE: Your Honor, I have no issue with reaching
2 out to Jane's attorney to remind him, again, about that issue.
3 Happy to do that this evening.

4 With respect to outstanding defense subpoenas, since
5 we're talking about this issue, my understanding at this
6 juncture is, because the witness identified as Matt has now
7 testified, the witness identified as Brian is no longer
8 testifying, that there will be no additional prior consistent
9 statements with respect to Jane. We want to confirm that the
10 defense is not seeking to recall Jane regarding any prior
11 consistent statements so that she can be released for recall.

12 MS. MENNINGER: Your Honor, we would like to just
13 think about it tonight and can certainly let the Court know
14 tomorrow.

15 THE COURT: Okay.

16 MS. MOE: Thank you, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: I'll ask you to confer and if it's an
18 issue, raise it in the morning. Thank you for raising it,
19 Ms. Moe.

20 MS. MOE: Thank you.

21 THE COURT: Any other matters?

22 MS. MOE: Not from the government, your Honor. Thank
23 you.

24 MR. PAGLIUCA: I just needed to make a record on the
25 objections. I can do that tomorrow if the Court wants me to,

LC7Cmax8

1 if the Court wants to leave. It's very brief.

2 THE COURT: Go ahead.

3 MR. PAGLIUCA: So this is on the privilege objection,
4 your Honor. The statement did not call for a communication.
5 This was a request about materials shown to the witness in
6 anticipation meeting with the government. Those are not
7 privileged communications given that, whatever it is, is
8 intended to be communicated to a third party, number 1, and
9 number 2 --

10 THE COURT: Well, I don't think you've made a record
11 that any -- you asked generally about any materials shown to
12 her. I don't think you've made a record that any materials
13 shown to her were in anticipation of being -- how did you
14 phrase it? Discussed with the government in the meeting?

15 MR. PAGLIUCA: Well, the Court sustained the objection
16 and ordered me to move on, your Honor.

17 THE COURT: I understand. I'm just --

18 MR. PAGLIUCA: There was no opportunity to further
19 that.

20 THE COURT: Right. To be clear, I think the question
21 was whether she was shown materials by her attorney, privilege
22 objection sustained. There may have been other questions, I
23 suppose that would have been different than that, but I
24 sustained with respect to that question.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: So, I'm not arguing with your Honor.

LC7Cmax8

1 I'm just completing out the record here, which is the question
2 does not call for a privilege communication. It's a yes-or-no
3 answer. Yes, I was shown materials. I don't believe that
4 that's privileged because there is no communication required,
5 number 1.

6 Number 2, in the event those materials are shown to
7 the government in a meeting, they lose any putative privilege
8 that they may have.

9 Number 3, to the extent that they're intended to be
10 communicated to a third party, they are not privileged to begin
11 with, even if they're not shown to the third party. I believe
12 that's the status of the law and that's my record. Thank you.

13 THE COURT: Again, you might have been able to get
14 there, but the question that you asked, I sustained on
15 privilege.

16 Next, anything?

17 MS. MOE: Not from the government, your Honor. Thank
18 you.

19 MR. EVERDELL: No, your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Was there another issue you wanted to make
21 a record on, Mr. Pagliuca?

22 MR. PAGLIUCA: I don't think --

23 THE COURT: If it occurs to you, you can make it in
24 the morning.

25 MR. PAGLIUCA: Thank you, your Honor.

LC7Cmax8

1 THE COURT: I do just want to, in an admonishment,
2 because this has gotten a little out of hand. Objection,
3 one-word grounds. Cite a rule of evidence if a rule of
4 evidence is available. If it's not, then you probably don't
5 have a basis for your objection. But if a rule number can't be
6 used, one-word basis for grounds. No more communicating to the
7 witnesses or the jury via objections. Understood?

8 MS. COMEY: Yes, your Honor.

9 MR. PAGLIUCA: Yes, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Thank you. Have a goodnight, everyone.
11 I'll see you -- sorry. Sorry.

12 So we don't need any of the briefing related to the
13 witness. So I think I'm not expecting anything tonight; is
14 that true? It's like saying, oh, look, no traffic, but --

15 MS. MOE: Nothing anticipated from the government,
16 your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Okay.

18 MS. MENNINGER: Nor from us.

19 THE COURT: I thank everyone. Goodnight.

20 (Adjourned to December 8, 2021 at 8:45 a.m.)

21 * * *

INDEX OF EXAMINATION

Examination of:	Page
-----------------	------

KIMBERLY MEDER

Direct By Ms. Comey1444
-------------------------------	-------

Cross By Ms. Menninger1464
----------------------------------	-------

Redirect By Ms. Comey1472
---------------------------------	-------

STEPHEN FLATLEY

Direct By Ms. Pomerantz1473
-----------------------------------	-------

Cross By Ms. Menninger1496
----------------------------------	-------

Redirect By Ms. Pomerantz1507
-------------------------------------	-------

Recross By Ms. Menninger1507
------------------------------------	-------

CAROLYN

Direct By Ms. Comey1512
-------------------------------	-------

Cross By Mr. Pagliuca1562
---------------------------------	-------

Redirect By Ms. Comey1692
---------------------------------	-------

Recross By Mr. Pagliuca1695
-----------------------------------	-------

GOVERNMENT EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Received
-------------	----------

3041446
---------------	-------

3061447
---------------	-------

3071448
---------------	-------

3201448
---------------	-------

3211449
---------------	-------

3221450
---------------	-------

3241451
---------------	-------

1	3251452
2	3331453
3	3371454
4	3401454
5	3411455
6	3431457
7	3471458
8	3481459
9	3141460
10	3171461
11	3181461
12	3131463
13	3321464
14	4191479
15	4241481
16	418, 418R1486
17	418B1487
18	420, 421, 4221488
19	420B, 421B, 422B1489
20	201517
21	1041526
22	6081529

PLAINTIFF EXHIBITS

24	Exhibit No.	Received
25	3421456